



**UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL**

Distr.: Limited

ECA/DMD/PSM/WP/99/9
September 1999

Original: ENGLISH

Development Management Division

**Ad Hoc Expert Group Meeting on Civil Service Policy
Reforms Including Ethics and Accountability**

**29 September – 1 October 1999
Addis Ababa, Ethiopia**

**GUIDELINES FOR EFFECTIVE SERVICE DELIVERY SYSTEMS IN THE PUBLIC
SERVICE IN AFRICA AND MONOGRAPH ON STRENGTHENING INSTITUTIONS OF
ETHICS AND ACCOUNTABILITY IN AFRICAN PUBLIC SECTOR**

INTRODUCTION

The Civil Service in sub-saharan Africa has gone through trying times. The euphoria of independence had opened the door for the wildest hopes.

Many African governments at independence had chosen socialism as the fastest means of economic and social development for their countries. Thus, from a service that was responsible for the maintenance of law and order and the collection of revenue during the colonial era for the state, the Civil Service, overnight, found itself saddled with the added responsibility for planning the economy of the country. Not particularly equipped for such a task and, therefore, lacking the capacity to make a success of it; working with resources that dwindled with the rapid decline of the economy; poorly paid and unappreciated, civil servants had, by the mid 1980's, become less efficient and ineffective.

With the introduction of Structural Adjustment Programmes (SAPs) in many African countries in the 1980s, it became evident that the civil service in these countries was overstaffed and could not provide the needed support essential for the economic measures being introduced. The decision by donors to support reforms in the Civil Service was consequent to this discovery.

Initially, civil service reform programmes were limited in scope to trimming staff size to more manageable levels thus reducing cost. An additional objective was that the savings thus made, could be used to pay salaries that could motivate and retain those who remained. These reform activities were carried out with little success.

With the upsurge in economic liberalisation, and the demand for democratic systems of government in Africa, the role and responsibility of the Civil Service are being revisited. It is now generally acknowledged that good governance is a sine qua non of economic and social development. The role and functions of the civil service are seen as crucial to good governance which, in turn, paves the way for an accelerated economic and social development. The civil service is now expected to be responsive to, and supportive of, the expectations of users of its services. In other words, the civil service must formulate and implement public policies that create the environment conducive for trade and commerce. To this end, it must cultivate a new culture in public policy management - one of participation, i.e., developing a partnership with its citizens now seen as customers and ensuring customer satisfaction. Another is for the Civil Service to be truly accountable to the public for the policies it manages and for the functioning of its institutions.

And then it must be transparent: its methods and procedures for providing services to the public must be simplified and documented and made readily available to the users. So that the public knows what to expect. These are some of the challenges facing the civil service in Africa, South of the Sahara.

In this paper, we shall make a comparative study of civil service reforms undertaken within the last decade or so in five (5) African countries: namely Cameroon, Uganda, Botswana, Zimbabwe and Ghana, in one Asian country - Malaysia, and in one Caribbean

country, Trinidad and Tobago. This paper shall dwell mainly on the reforms introduced in the Civil Service of Ghana. The reasons are two-fold: first, there is a great deal of literature to work on and secondly, it was possible to do a few structured interviews with Civil Servants as to their perception of the impact of the reforms.

II. CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS: THE CASE OF GHANA

1.0 INTRODUCTION:

The Ghana Civil Service was regarded as one of the best in sub-saharan Africa in the period immediately after Ghana's independence in March, 1957. It did not take too long for the Service to start encountering difficulties. The Government of the First Republic adopted a hostile attitude to Civil Servants, calling them "imperialist lackeys". In the early 1960s there was a mass exodus, first, of expatriates, and then of Ghanaian senior civil servants. The resultant rapid africanisation policy saw many young inexperienced officers catapulted to the top to fill the gap. By the time of the overthrow of the Nkrumah regime in 1966 by the military, the Civil Service had lost much of its lustre.

The problems were further compounded by inadequate resources for the Service, which made it difficult for Civil Servants to perform their functions with any degree of efficiency and effectiveness, and a decline in the economic situation of Civil Servants as their salaries and conditions of service which had hitherto compared favourably with those in the private sector, became increasingly unattractive. Various reform initiatives had to be undertaken. These were mostly ad hoc, introduced as a result of some agitation among Civil Servants. In the event, they had all failed to address the major problems of the Service.

By the mid 1980s, the following major weaknesses had been identified in the Ghanaian Civil Service:

- over staffed and unwieldy;
- low morale and lack of motivation owing to unattractive salaries and poor conditions of service;
- an over-centralised structure;
- lack of political direction and commitment leading to apathy and inertia;
- corruption and nepotism;
- indiscipline and laxity in supervision;
- inadequate resources which affected productivity negatively;
- high turn-over of professional staff.

The introduction of the Economic Recovery Programme (ERP) and the Structural Adjustment Programme (SAP) exposed the deficiencies in the Service. Its inability to be responsive to, and supportive of, the above-named Programmes made the donors decide to initiate reforms in the Public Administration System, with particular emphasis on the Civil Service, at the initial stages. The reforms kicked off in 1987 under the broad heading - Civil Service Reform Programme (CSRP).

1.1 Labour Rationalisation

By 1987, it was evident that the Ghana Civil Service was overstaffed. The reform in this area was aimed at trimming the size of the service in terms of numbers so as to arrive at a manageable size. Labour rationalisation, popularly referred to as "redeployment", was introduced. The idea was to rid the Service of less critical staff while recruiting staff for the very critical areas and occupations. Redeployment was intended to achieve the following:

- a. release excess staff in the Civil Service for deployment in other areas of the economy; and
- b. with the savings made from the retrenchment, improve the salary and conditions of service of the staff of a numerically manageable service.

Guidelines were set for the implementation of the retrenchment exercise which included the criteria for the selection of staff to be affected, incentive packages and above all opportunities for retraining of retrenched staff and acquisition of skills to make them more employable or self-reliant. At the end of the CSRP, in 1993, the size of the Ghana Civil Service had been reduced by as much 35% from one hundred and forty thousand (140,000) to ninety-one thousand (91,000).

The second objective was however not achieved. As in the case of many other African countries, the savings made from retrenchment, were insignificant, and the governments and donors had under-estimated the level of severance packages to be paid.

1.2 Revamping of the Management Services Division (MSD)

Owing to a combination of factors namely, inadequate resources and non-availability of requisite personnel, MSD of the Office of the Head of the Service (PHCS) had not been able to undertake regular job inspections and job analysis as it was mandated to do. By September 1987, job inspection and job analysis exercises, which should have been a regular feature of the management of the Ghana Civil Service, had fallen in arrears by several years. Owing to this lacuna, several Civil Servants, particularly within the junior levels, were either not clear about their roles and functions or had very little work to do resulting in idleness and other acts of indiscipline.

The reform aimed at making job analysis and job inspection exercises a regular feature of the Ghana Civil Service. As a result of the reform, MSD was revamped as follows:

- it was relocated in offices in the Public Services Commission building and, therefore, closer to OHCS;
- it was equipped with new vehicles, computers and accessories, photocopiers and stationery and could, therefore, perform its functions; and

- the management analysts were sent abroad for re-training in job analysis.

1.3 **Revised Staff Performance Appraisal System**

At the beginning of the Civil Service Reform Programme in 1987, the Ghana Civil Service was operating the annual confidential reporting system. Although the system had been improved to incorporate openness, it was found to be obsolete and non-participative. It was also found not to be objective-based, hardly applied rigorously and was not linked to any personnel action except promotion. By 1987, it became obvious that the staff appraisal system in operation had lost its credibility and was being followed only as a matter of routine.

It therefore became apparent that the old annual confidential reporting system needed to be replaced and this was done in 1991 with the introduction of a new staff performance appraisal system. The components of the new system included target setting, appraisal interview between the reporting officer and the appraisee as well as a linkage between the appraisal process/exercise and staff training and development, succession planning, promotion and staff movement.

As from 1992 the application of the new staff performance appraisal system had become mandatory in the Ghana Civil Service. By this, a more objective, target-oriented system of staff appraisal had been introduced.

1.4 **Legal Framework**

At the beginning of the reforms, the Ghana Civil Service was being governed by the Civil Service Act, 1960 (C.A.G), the General Orders of 1952, and the Civil Service (Interim) Rules and Regulations, 1960, Legislative Instrument Number 47.

It was clear that the documents mentioned above had become out-dated and needed to be replaced. The objective of the new law was to take cognisance of new trends on the public administration landscape in Ghana as well as the creation of structures that would give effect to decentralisation and deconcentration. A new Civil Service Law, PNDCL 327 was passed in 1993.

PNDCL 327 makes provision for:

- a Civil Service Council;
- restructuring of ministries and the creation of the post of Chief Director as the Administrative Head of OHCS and Sector Ministries;
- the organisation of ministries into four (4) distinct specialised functional areas- Administration and Finance; Human Resources Management; Planning, Budgeting, Monitoring and Evaluation; and Statistics, Research, Information Management and Public Relations;
- decentralisation and strengthening of competencies at the district levels of administration;

- creation of a Reform Co-ordinating Unit to pursue the reform process;
- creation of the Public Complaints Unit (PCU) to receive and handle complaints from the public; and
- establishment of Committees on Administrative Reform to support reform activities.

Under the new Civil Service Law, 1993, twenty-two (22) decentralised departments are answerable to the District Assembly and are indeed departments within the District Assembly whose Head is the District Chief Executive.

1.5 **Revised Scheme of Service**

Schemes of Service for occupational groups, where they existed in the Ghana Civil Service, were found to be seriously outdated and irrelevant to the needs of the time. For example, in their investigations, a team of UK-ODA consultants found that although qualifications, experiences etc. for entry into certain occupational grades in the Service were no longer applicable, yet some departments retained the obsolete entry qualifications in their records. Indeed, some of these documents made entry into certain positions in the Civil Service very unattractive. Very little attempt had been made to revise schemes of service to reflect current realities. In order to redress the trend, a consultant was contracted in 1992 to undertake a detailed revision of existing schemes for all occupational groups in the Civil Service as well as draw schemes for those groups which did not have any. The assignment, which was completed in September 1994, provided guidelines for career progression in the Ghana Civil Service.

1.6 **Pay and Grading Structure**

At the commencement of the Civil Service Reform Programme, there was a multiplicity of salary scales and gradings in the Ghana Civil Service. No attempt had been made to grade positions in the service for salary purposes. This situation made salary administration very difficult and cumbersome. One aim of the reform was to introduce a uniform pay and grading structure in the Civil Service. By 1992, a 13 – band Pay and Grading Structure had been introduced.

1.7 **Payroll and Personnel Records**

Personnel and payroll records in the Ghana Civil Service were not integrated at the outset of the Civil Service Reform Programme. As a result, the payroll managed by the Controller and Accountant-General differed from the personnel records available at the ministries and departments. This discrepancy created loopholes for the insertion of “ghost” names into personnel and payroll registers.

There was therefore the need to put in place a mechanism for the integration of personnel and payroll records. This resulted in the operation of what has come to

be known as the Integrated Payroll and Personnel Database (IPPD) of the Ghana Civil Service.

One advantage of the IPPD is the brief information that is stored in the computers in respect of each Civil Servant in addition to the provision made for periodic revision of the data on staff. This is to solve the perennial problem faced by Civil Servants whose files and other records cannot be readily available when they proceed on retirement; with the IPPD, the tracing of personal records has been facilitated.

1.8 Institutional Framework

In addition to the large numbers of Civil Servants at the outset of the reform programme, it was detected that quite a number of institutions in the service could be hived off in order to have a more compact Civil Service. One of such organisations is the Ministry of Health from which a Ghana Health Service could be created.

Another measure is to contract out some of the services being rendered by the Civil Service to the private sector, such as cleaning, etc.

1.9 Restructuring Records Services

By 1987, record keeping in the Ghana Civil Service was in a chaotic state. Files got lost easily and data required for decision-making could often not be traced. It was imperative to re-organize the Records and a reform of Records management was undertaken under CSRP.

2.0 TRANSITIONAL PERIOD: 1994 –1995

The period 1994 –1995 could well be regarded as a period of transition in Ghana public policy management. During the period, the Government of Ghana produced a blue print for accelerated economic and social development. Known as VISION 2020, it set out a broad vision for the country to attain middle income level by the year 2020. It also set up a new body to be responsible for the reform of the entire public sector

2.1 Public Sector Reform Programme: National Institutional Renewal Programme (NIRP)

NIRP was launched in December, 1994. It was set up to undertake a comprehensive reform of the public administration system in Ghana. This followed the realisation that “the public administration system is weak. There seems to be a widespread lack of clear objectives at agency levels and weak leadership at administrative levels.” In this regard, “ the re-structuring of the Public Administration System is expected to enhance the delivery capacity of the public sector to plan, manage and monitor social and economic development”.

The Civil Service reform was redesignated as Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme (CSPIP).

CSPIP is a component of NIRP. Other components of NIRP are:

- Public Financial Management Reform Programme (PUFMARP) which aims at improving efficiency, accountability and transparency in the financial management functions of Government;
- Reform of the Judiciary, Security Services, democratic institutions such as the Commission on Human Rights and Administrative Justice (CHRAJ) and National Commission on Civic Education (NCCE), the Legislature, State Owned Enterprises (SOEs), and subvented organisations such as the Ghana Broadcasting Corporation (GBC), Ghana Institute of Management and Public Administration (GIMPA) etc.

NIRP is serviced by a secretariat headed by a Co-ordinator. NIRP is controlled by a National Overview Committee chaired by the Vice-President of the Republic of Ghana

3.0 CIVIL SERVICE PERFORMANCE IMPROVEMENT PROGRAMME (CSPIP)

3.1 CSPIP – Full Operation Phase (FOP) September 1996 - August 2001

Since 1996 up to the present time, new areas of reform have been tackled with new emphasis and a new approach. This has been dubbed the Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme (CSPIP).

3.1.1 Objectives of CSPIP/ the New Approach

CSPIP has fashioned what could be termed a Mission Statement. It reads: “CSPIP exists to promote reforms in the Ghana Civil Service with the aim of strengthening institutional capacity, developing a culture of good governance, of efficiency and effectiveness in service delivery and of willing assistance to the private sector, all in the interest of ensuring the success of Vision 2020.”

3.1.2 Goals and Objectives of CSPIP

The broad objectives of the new approach to reform are “to promote and enhance Civil Service performance, service delivery systems and good governance with particular emphasis on transparency and accountability.”

This stage of the reform process has shifted the emphasis to “develop the capacity of the civil service to be results-oriented”, a constant search for improved performance to be “customer-sensitive”. The approach seeks to be based on consensus-building, i.e. partnership of all the stakeholders, i.e. the Reform Co-ordinating Unit and the Technical Group both based at OHCS, the Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) and the donors. “This is to ensure commitment and ownership rooted in the fact that the resultant programme would have been home-grown”. The reform actions that have been the focus of attention, have, accordingly, been in areas that would make for efficiency and effectiveness, quality service, a high level of participation of Civil Servants in all the ministries and departments, and in creating the conditions for good governance.

To ensure the efficient and effective management of the reforms, certain structures were put in place. These are:

- **Project Management Team** - Referred to as the Technical team, it has responsibility for the overall management of the reforms. It comprises six (6) members, including the Head of the Civil Service as Chairman, and the UK DFID Senior Programme Adviser;
- **CSPIP Secretariat** - manned by a Director in the Ghana Civil Service, with a support staff;
- **CSPIP Support Office** -with another DFID representative, an expatriate, as Office Manager; which provides the essential logistical and financial support for CSPIP. The office is located at the OHCS;
- **Reform Co-ordinating Unit** – whose purpose is to co-ordinate the reform initiatives in the Civil Service and provide the linkages. It has a full-time head, assisted by a small support staff.

3.2 **DONOR SUPPORT**

Civil Service Reforms require a high level of financial support. In this regard, it is observed that the World Bank and the DFID have funded the Civil Service Reforms right from the beginning, and have continued to do so. DFID has, in fact, committed five million pounds sterling (£5m) to CSPIP as a grant to fund CSPIP during its full operational phase which runs from September 1996 – August 2001. With this level of funding CSPIP is assured of sustainability.

3.3 **Performance Improvement Facility (PIF)**

A Performance Improvement Facility has been built into CSPIP. This off-shore Facility is to cater for the cost of some items and equipment or special needs that have been identified to push the reforms forward, without waiting for national budgetary allocation.

3.4 **Formation of Capacity Development Teams (CDTs)**

CDTs are the change agents and are, therefore, “the pivot around which the entire CSPIP process revolves in the various civil service institutions”. CDTs are to comprise a full-time Capacity Development Co-ordinator (CDC) and the four (4) functional directors in a ministry. The CDTs are to ensure participation of Civil Servants in the reform process and build consensus around it.

3.5 **Development of Performance Improvement Plans (PIPs)**

One of the most important and innovative aspects of CSPIP is the introduction of the preparation of PIPs, and the involvement of all stakeholders in this exercise. The PIPs are prepared in stages: first, institutions complete Self-Appraisal Instruments (SAIs), then Beneficiary Assessment Surveys are carried out, followed by Diagnostic Workshops and then the finalisation and validation of the PIPs.

3.6 **Completion of Self-Appraisal Instruments (SAIs)**

The use of this instrument is part of the process of internal assessment of the organisation. In this exercise, a cross section of the personnel of an MDA periodically is to revisit its mission, evaluate the institutional capacity as well as its past performance in relation to the objectives of its programmes etc.

This self-assessment prepares the MDAs in their environmental scan and for the subsequent CSPIP Diagnostic Workshops.

3.7 **Stakeholders/Beneficiary/User Surveys**

MDAs were supported with funds to carry out surveys aimed at determining the impact on the beneficiary of the services the MDAs provide to them. In the process the MDA would clearly identify the users of its services and get the latter to express their views about the services provided. It is expected that the knowledge of consumer expectations would help the institutions to position themselves to respond to them. Also, it is intended that such views would be taken in cognisance of the formulation of public policies by the respective organisations. Local Consultants were engaged to assist the MDAs in facilitating the entire process.

3.8 **Diagnostic Workshops**

These workshops are organised subsequent to the completion of the self-appraisal instrument and the conduct of the beneficiary assessment surveys.

They are generally attended by Chief Directors and other directors, a cross section of the personnel of the institutions, some representatives of stakeholders, including

users of the services provided by the organisations concerned. Members of the CSPIP Technical Group serve as facilitators at the Workshops.

3.9 **Preparation of a Mission Statement**

Participants at the workshops start by revisiting the mission of the institution and formulating a MISSION STATEMENT for it and then review its past performance over the few preceding years.

3.10 **Swot and Stakeholder Analyses**

They then do an environmental scan, examining first the internal environment. They identify their Strengths and Weaknesses and seek the means to further consolidate the Strengths while devising ways to eliminate or minimise their weaknesses. An analysis of the external environment allows them to identify the Opportunities they can take advantage of, and the Threats which they may face.

During the SWOT Analysis, they are to take into account particularly, the Government's blue-print for accelerated economic and social development for the country "Vision 2020", Government's policy on decentralisation and the role of the private sector as the engine of economic growth, as well as the national budget. Where the threats cannot be handled by the institution on its own, OHCS intervenes to deal with them if they are within its purview or invites other organisations to either tackle them, or join it collectively to do so.

3.10.1 **Objectives**

Having identified the key issues to address, institutions then formulate the specific objectives that they intend to achieve during the plan period. These objectives must be specific, measurable, attainable, relevant and time-bound. (S.M.A.R.T.) That way, performance can be more easily monitored and evaluated.

3.10.2 **Strategies**

After setting S.M.A.R.T. objectives, the next step is that the strategies that would be used in achieving them are developed.

3.10.3 **Resource Requirements**

At this stage, the participants determine the resources required for the achievement of the plans. These include the human, material and financial resources without which the PIPs will remain on the drawing boards. Moreover, responsibility centres are determined, i.e., specific individuals who are expected to carry out specific actions are identified and given those responsibilities

Once the strategies have been developed, and the resource requirements and responsibility-centres determined, the next key activity is to break the strategies down into specific steps to undertake. These are the PIPs to which are attached Action Plans.

3.10.4 Validation of PIP

The finalisation of the PIP is entrusted to a small committee set up after the workshop. After fine-tuning it, the PIP is submitted to representatives of the organisation concerned, CSPIP Technical Group, Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development and National Development Planning Commission for consideration and eventual endorsement. It is only then that the implementation of the PIP can be set in motion.

The entire process gives the stakeholders ownership of the PIP and ensures their commitment to it. It also helps to strengthen the management capacity of the individual participants by equipping them with the skills for strategic planning. Further, it creates an esprit de corps among Civil Servants of the same institution and a bond with other stakeholders who learn to appreciate more than ever before, the constraints under which Civil Servants work. Moreover, by setting S.M.A.R.T. targets, staff of the MDA become focussed and results- oriented and can be more easily mobilized. Finally, performance is easy to monitor and evaluate.

4.0 PERFORMANCE AGREEMENT BETWEEN GOVERNMENT AND CHIEF DIRECTORS

Another major reform measure introduced to improve performance is the signing of Performance Contracts between the Government of Ghana and Chief Directors as bureaucratic heads of ministries. The individual Chief Director signs his part while the sector Ministry signs on behalf of the government, with the head of the Civil Service endorsing it.

In the agreement, "the Chief Director accepts responsibility for the overall performance of the sector as a whole" and also pledges to make use of "the most up-to-date and appropriate management techniques in performing the functions" of leading and directing the ministry. He will employ the most efficient, effective and economic ways in managing the ministry. The government also undertakes not to stand in the way of Chief Director in this regard especially as pertaining to cutting back approved budget or delaying the release of funds. Performance is to be evaluated at the end of the period, which runs from January – December.

Incentives and sanctions are built into this agreement: achieving over 90% of targets will lead to obtaining a merit award. On the other hand, poor performance i.e. achieving below 70% of targets without an acceptable explanation will lead to the officer being counselled or the imposition of sanctions. The sanctions range from caution to dismissal.

The first Performance Contracts were signed this year and it is yet to be seen how effective they are in bringing a marked improvement in productivity in the Civil Service.

5.0 **LAUNCHING OF CODE OF CONDUCT AND WORK ETHIC**

As stated earlier, CSPIP had put high on its agenda, the pursuit of integrity, accountability and transparency in the Civil Service, in order to have good governance. Indeed, good governance has been identified as a pre-requisite for economic and social development. The reform measures undertaken under CSPIP have sought to address this issue. Also, to help focus attention on the importance of integrity and transparency, CSPIP has revisited the issue of ethics and transparency with a view to reducing corruption and making Civil Servants cultivate a healthy work ethic.

This is particularly pertinent as allegations of corruption, indiscipline and laxity have for long been levelled against the Civil Service. CSPIP has published and launched a leaflet entitled "Developing and Sustaining a Strong Work Ethic (Combating negative work habits in the Ghana Civil Service)." Civil Servants are reminded in this leaflet, of the need for "diligence, perseverance and dedication" and to be "a disciplined corps" to carry out Government Policies. Administrative Instructions and a Code of Conduct have also been prepared and have received the fiat of the authorities. They are yet to be published.

It is worth noting that none of the areas covered by these reform measures is new. Indeed, there have in the past been Codes of conduct and work ethics embodied in the General Orders (G.Os). The novelty is that whereas the G.Os were bulky and kept under lock and key usually by Personnel Officers and were not available for even Civil Servants to consult, these leaflets are being distributed to the general public, and it is hoped that Civil Servants can lay hands on them readily. It is also hoped that relevant parts of the Administrative Instructions and the Code of Conduct will be published and made available to those whose life and work they are expected to govern.

6.0 **CUSTOMER ORIENTATION**

In its efforts to be customer-oriented and customer-focussed, CSPIP has not only identified stakeholders and their expectations through the beneficiary surveys but has also sought to involve them in the development of the PIPs to build a Civil Service-Private Sector partnership.

CSPIP has gone a step further. A number of MDAs have simplified the procedures for carrying out certain tasks, and explained these procedures and the time frames set for their completion. These have been published in leaflets which are available to the public.

- 1) 'How to acquire a Ghanaian passport' – published by the Passport Office.
- 2) Guidelines on Setting up Client Services Units – by OHCS
- 3) The Public Complaints Unit - by OHCS
- 4) Procedure for change of ownership of Vehicle - by Vehicle Examination and Licensing Division VELD of Ministry of Roads and Transport.
- 5) 'Resolution of Disputes between landlords and tenants' by Rent Control Department of the Ministry of Works & Housing.
- 6) "Preparation of Parcel and Cadastral Plans for Land Title Registration – by Survey Department.
- 7) "How to register your land" by Land Title Registry.
- 8) "Procedure and Requirement for issuing building permits" by Accra Metropolitan Assembly.
- 9) "Regulations and Procedures for issuance of building permit" by District/Municipal and Metropolitan Planning Departments of the Assemblies.

It needs to be pointed out that these are very sensitive and critical areas to tackle since these are some of the Ministries or Departments where corruption is reported to be rife. For instance, when a person needs a passport to travel or wishes to obtain a permit to start a building (s)he is often desperate and therefore ready to use any means to accelerate the process including giving a bribe. The leaflets are, therefore, valuable, since access to information is one of the most important weapons in the fight against corruption.

III CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS: OTHER COUNTRIES

1.0 CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS IN UGANDA

1.1 Introduction

At independence, Uganda inherited a relatively small Civil Service with limited objectives from the colonial regime. The objective of the Civil Service at that time was the maintenance of good government, law and order. After independence, the objectives and functions of the service were expanded to include the social and economic development of the country.

1.2 Size and Cost of the Civil Service

With the increased functions and responsibilities of the Civil Service, it developed certain tendencies. The service became oversized, with too much centralism, inadequate and inappropriate institutional capacity, and declining resources. The political party in power started massive recruitment exercises because of the increased functions of the civil service. Several institutions were established and staffed without taking due cognisance of quality of personnel. As a result there was tremendous increase of the salary and wage budget and declining resources.

A study on the size and cost of the Civil Service in Uganda in 1991 by Prof. F. Byarugaba revealed that employment statistics from the central establishments were not reconcilable with those at the Treasury Payroll. In fact, record keeping broke down, there was overemployment and the Service was full of ghost workers. Recruitment was done with the main aim of "eating and survival" or "outright stealing."

1.3 Reform Strategies

The National Resistance Movement Government, realising this unacceptable situation, attempted a reform of the Civil Service to reduce size and cost. The approaches suggested were to:

- a. cut down the number of Ministries;
- b. eliminate ghost workers;
- c. retire personnel who were of retiring age;
- d. streamline the pay roll; and
- e. increase salaries of employees left in the system to boost their morale and productivity.

The implementation of these reforms did not go far. The Bikangaga Commission which was appointed by the Government to study the Civil Service and make necessary recommendations observed that the Ugandan Cabinet was the largest in

Africa. There were 75 Ministries with Ministers and Deputy Ministers, 38 Districts plus a number of Counties under the Districts.

The Commission made a number of suggestions towards reform of the Civil Service. On the definition of posts, a recommendation was made that posts in command of major departments or Ministries should be designated Heads of Departments instead of only the three --Permanent Secretary, Auditor General and Registrar of the high court -- who were recognised as such. Another suggestion was to regroup the Civil Service into ten (10) main groupings instead of the former four (4) main cadres.

The Bikangaga Commission went further to review allowances and leave entitlement rates, and proposed the introduction of a contributory pension scheme. It put a lot of emphasis on revision of salaries, the recommendations of which were accepted and implemented on first January, 1976

The Ugandan Government in the 1970s and 1980s made several attempts to reform the Civil Service and do away with most of its ills. In 1980/82, the Turyamuhika Report based on the need for civil servants to be paid a "living wage" made proposals for a new salary structure with a view of making salaries comparable to those existing in other African Countries. Job specifications were provided for positions so as to improve on the quality of staff holding such positions. Posts in the Service were also graded.

The recommendations were not implemented. However, later in 1989/90, the Government, realising that the public service had become inefficient, ineffective, unresponsive, demoralised and not delivering the needed goods, established the Public Service Review and Reorganisation Commission (PSRRC) to study and provide recommendations for reform of the Service.

The PSRRC reported that the Public Service was characterised by:

- ♦ high degree of centralisation;
- ♦ little or no encouragement for exercising initiative;
- ♦ lack of reliable information;
- ♦ extensive breakdown of procedures;
- ♦ resource deprivation;
- ♦ low salaries and wages; and
- ♦ low morale.

The institution was also highly bureaucratic and training efforts were not dynamic and innovative. There was high degree of corruption and at the upper critical professional level, brain drain had assumed frightening proportions. The Commission pointed out that the Government had assumed activities and responsibilities which can equally be performed by the private sector, perhaps even better.

In the Report of the PSRRC they made far reaching recommendations as to the measures the Government should take in the reform of the Public Service. The Government was to divest itself from some of the activities and responsibilities it had assumed. Other recommendations were that:

- ◆ the number of Ministries should be reduced to 20 or 21, and the names listed;
- ◆ Civil Service jobs should be defined in specific functional terms;
- ◆ decentralisation policy should be pursued;
- ◆ salaries should be improved;
- ◆ staff should be retrained;
- ◆ there should be retooling in terms of equipment;
- ◆ counter corruption; and
- ◆ create the office of the OMBUDSMAN.

1.4 **Working With Donors**

Definitely, Uganda has embarked upon a serious public service reform programme, and has achieved some reasonable success. From the start of the Civil Service Reform Programme, Uganda had a clear picture of what it was looking for to help improve the delivery of quality service.

Dr. Mohammad Kisubi in his article on Working With Donors to Improve Civil Service Date Reforms points out that Uganda has developed an efficient and effective way of utilising assistance from donor agencies. There is a high degree of collaboration and consultation between the CSRPF and the donor agencies to the extent that there is understanding among them as to the course of action to take and how to bring about continuity and sustainability of the reforms.

1.5 **Summary**

Uganda realised the need to reform the Civil Service, particularly to reduce the size and cost, and to improve upon its services to bring about social and economic prosperity. A number of factors led to increases in the size and cost of the Civil Service. Some of the causes were:

- ◆ the enlargement of the Service to include Parastatals;
- ◆ creation of Ministries for political expedience (duplication of Ministries);
- ◆ failure to check the Establishment; and
- ◆ the flouting of rules and regulations.

Several commissions were appointed since 1970s to recommend measures for making the Civil Service efficient and effective. Most of the time, the

recommendations were not implemented. However, upon the realisation of the Government of the need to embark upon a reform programme to bring about efficient and effective delivery of services and improvement in the economy, the Civil Service has seen important reforms in the 1990s with the assistance of donor agencies.

Uganda has now built a pool of local expertise in reforms to assist continuity and sustainability. Several countries have visited Uganda to see for themselves how the reforms are managed because of the success the country has achieved.

2.0 CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS IN CAMEROON

2.1 Introduction

Cameroon embarked upon Civil Service reforms at a time when there was stiff opposition to any reforms. The size of the Civil Service was larger than necessary and cost had risen very high despite dwindling resources. The main objective of the reforms, therefore, was “to obtain the appropriate size that would give the civil service maximum result, yet maintaining its efficiency” according to Andrew Odilo Maimo who researched into the Cost and Size of the Civil Service in Cameroon. The opposition was so strong that at the early stages those to be affected or involved had to be consulted tactfully and initiated into the proposed reforms.

The cause of over-employment in the Civil Service was that there was no transparency in recruitment, for the rate of recruitment followed no defined pattern. In fact, recruitment was done at the whims of those in power, and it was fairly high, especially at the lower ranks.

2.2 Approaches to the Reforms

The main methods adopted for the Civil Service reforms were:

- ◆ voluntary retirement;
- ◆ freezing recruitment;
- ◆ decentralisation;
- ◆ new methods of staff evaluation;
- ◆ prizes to deserving staff;
- ◆ reducing the size of staff in the technical services and teachers;
- ◆ drawing new organisation structures for the Ministries; and
- ◆ scrapping lodging of Civil servants.

2.3 Voluntary Retirement

Civil servants were encouraged to retire voluntarily and be paid their benefits in lump sum so that they could venture into new businesses. Workers embraced the idea only to realise that the idea was attractive just on paper. The Government did not have the money to meet the demands of those who were willing to retire. This resulted in people dragging their feet because no one was prepared to leave the service empty-handed. The idea, therefore, became unpopular and the reform did not get off the ground.

2.4 Freezing Recruitment

People were not willing to accept the idea of freezing recruitment because of the fairly high rate of unemployment. Though the idea was not popular, the Government was not financially prepared to meet salaries and wages of a large number of people. To an extent, the reform was implemented, and it achieved partial success.

2.5 Decentralisation

The decentralisation policy had three (3) basic aims. It was meant to improve productivity in the services the civil service provides; to make authority at the lower echelons effective; and to make local officers more responsible. The reform was well received and made local officers more productive than before. It was a great success.

2.6 Staff Evaluation

Previously, the system of staff evaluation was not efficient because it did not measure what it was supposed to assess. The reform in this area was directed towards defining targets or setting objectives based on available resources. A more effective system was proposed to measure these objectives and targets. Its implementation has been successful.

2.7 Prizes to Deserving Staff

Since the scheme of rewarding exemplary work and punishing extremely poor performance was introduced as a measure of civil service reform, it has enhanced the productivity of the service. It is an encouragement to staff to work harder than they were doing before. Tied up with the new staff evaluation system, the selection of award winners was made fair and transparent.

2.8 Reducing the Size of Staff in the Technical Services and Teachers

One of the factors which increased the size of the civil service was the inclusion of all teachers. A strategy adopted to reduce size and cost of the civil service was to encourage staff, especially those in the technical services, to retire voluntarily and form groups to establish private enterprises. The Government was to assist them

with refundable capital, the disbursement of which needed approval from the Presidency. The reaction of those concerned was favourable.

However, it was realised that this approach coupled with freezing of recruitment would create undesirable consequences for the Ministries of Health and Education. The health and education of the population were high on the agenda, but services in these areas definitely required a sizeable number of employees. The Ministries were, therefore, excluded.

2.9 Restructuring of Ministries

Preparing new organisation structures for the Ministries and assessing the appropriate staff of each Ministry was considered one of the approaches to solve the problem of cost, size and efficiency of the civil service.

The restructuring of the Ministries was to take into account the mission of the Ministry concerned and the service it provides. This is to prevent conflicts and overlapping of responsibilities. Accompanying the new structures should be well defined posts and job descriptions, salaries and other emoluments attached to the positions. Also, it was expected that costs and numerical strength of the service would be detailed out. No one could create any post without authority, therefore establishing some form of control in recruitment.

2.10 Accommodation for Civil Servants

Civil servants had been enjoying accommodation provided by the Government. It was discovered that the scheme was full of abuses, and therefore costing the Government an immense fortune. As a measure to cut down cost, it was proposed to scrap lodging of civil servants and giving them housing allowance instead.

2.11 Comment

The planned measures for reducing size and cost of the Civil Service were laudable and believed to achieve their purpose if effectively implemented. However, the data available to the author do not indicate the extent to which these methods were used and their outcome.

3.0 CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS IN ZIMBABWE

3.1 Introduction

The problems of the Civil Service of Zimbabwe after the colonial rule were similar to those other countries in Africa, South of Sahara, were experiencing, though a few of the causes were unique.

3.2 Problems

The Zimbabwean Civil Service was noticed to be bedevilled with the following problems:

- a large and cumbersome service of about forty five (45,000) persons rising to one hundred and ninety two thousand (192,000) in 1992;
- high increase in costs and budget –with no corresponding increase in productivity;
- serious overlaps and duplication of functions and responsibilities resulting sometimes in conflicts because of large size of bureaucracies;
- a substantially inexperienced cadreship operating in a heavily – centralised working environment;
- accountability and responsiveness; and
- complicated rules and procedures that stifled initiative and innovation.

3.3 Rationale for the Expansion of the Civil Service

During the era of the colonial administration, the services of the Civil Service were directed towards the benefit of the white minority in the country. When the local administration took over they were compelled, if they were to achieve fairness of the distribution of social and economic welfare to all Zimbabweans, to extend services to the masses who hitherto had been neglected by the previous Government. This obviously led to an increase in the functions and responsibilities of the Civil Service. Therefore, new Ministries and Departments were created to provide universal as opposed to selective services to all citizens.

For the Government to cater for the welfare of the citizens, it was very necessary to change the state machinery to be more development-oriented as opposed to using control and oppression, a strategy of the previous Government. Furthermore, most of the programmes which were being funded by donor agencies were left for the Government to sponsor and manage, taking up both capital and recurrent costs. What aggravated the situation was the fusion of party bureaucracy and the state administration which resulted in the creation of more public service posts and accelerated recruitment of staff, leading to increased expenditure and costs.

Notwithstanding the above, there was serious increase in unemployment, the prices of many basic commodities shot up, and the civil service became inefficient and ineffective.

3.4 Civil Service Reforms

The deteriorating inefficiency and ineffectiveness of the Civil Service was recognised by both the state administration and external funding agencies. The latter instituted a number of conditionalities before loans were granted. The Government was to be seen cutting down the size of the civil service and improving

the compensation framework for the remaining staff. In addition, the Government was to privatise some of its activities in order to reduce cost.

3.5 **Reform Strategies**

An important strategy was to reduce the number of civil servants by about 25% i.e. 23,000 (leaving out the Ministry of Education) within five years beginning in the financial year 1991-1992. Another measure which was directed at lowering the budget deficit which was being experienced was to cut down subsidies paid to public enterprises.

The huge Government bureaucracy had caused duplication and overlap among Ministries. Among the first steps to be taken towards reforms was to identify the areas of duplication and overlap so that appropriate action could be taken to streamline the discrepancies within the system.

One major concern was to ensure that politicians fell in line and did not behave in a way which would contradict the aims and objectives of the reforms in order that their behaviour did not impact negatively on civil servants.

- Posts which remained vacant in excess of twelve 12 months were abolished, since it means that such posts were not critical or essential;
- Ministries were requested to obligationly give up a certain percentage of post;
- Also, Civil Servants were encouraged through monetary incentives to take voluntary retirement. By July seven hundred and forty five (745) applications had been received by PSC; and
- Adverse effect is that the most enterprising and good performer took advantage of package, leaving behind the less efficient and effective officer;

By June 30, 1994, the Zimbabwe Civil Service had been reduced by 12,700, leaving a shortfall of 10,300 posts to reach target. The PSC is embarking on more vigorous way to achieve the objectives. These include:

- the reduction of administrative levels within the Service;
- contracting out of certain functions of line ministries which can be better and profitably performed by the private sector; and
- decentralisation of certain functions and activities of ministries to local authorities;

Through these strategies, it was hoped to further reduce the size of the Service by 16,815 by 30 June 1995.

In 1990, – ESAP was embarked upon to transform the country to market – economy. The objective of the Civil Service Reform was, therefore, “to transform the Civil

Service from a development administration – oriented machine” to become a “facilitator of a market – economy and a promoter of individual initiatives”.

Still with that objective, it became imperative to restructure ministerial organs, hive off some tasks and put them in the private sector. The reform is also designed to make the Civil Service “mission- oriented”, so it will set and achieve targets and be effective and efficient.

4.0 **CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS IN BOTSWANA**

4.1 **Introduction**

Botswana inherited a civil service of just about six thousand (6,000) staff on attaining independence in 1966. The service was dominated by expatriate staff because there were not many local qualified persons to fill their positions. The Government and the people of Botswana, therefore, had the collective will to reform the service so as to accelerate and sustain economic development. By 1995, the number of staff had increased to sixty seven thousand eight hundred and fifteen 67,815.

4.2 **Problems**

The major problem of the civil service was the small number of available nationals who were qualified to join the service which was predominantly expatriates. The policy of the Government was not to completely do away with the expatriate staff but follow a policy of localisation and the use of expatriates in the form of technical assistance.

One other problem was the absence of adequate local institutions to train civil servants and sharpen their skills to meet the challenge of providing effective and efficient goods and services.

4.2 **Reform Strategies**

There were three specific areas of weakness and concern in the civil service, and which were seriously addressed to bring about efficiency and effectiveness in the service. These areas were:

- Organisation and Methods;
- Pay and Incentives; and
- Enhancement of Productivity.

4.4 **Organisation and Methods**

- 4.4.1 **Training:** The reform of the Civil Service placed strong emphasis on training. A Committee was appointed and the Localisation and Training Report was issued in 1972. It was proposed that the suggestions were implemented over a ten-year

period. Review committees on localisation of the civil service and training were appointed in 1977, 1979, 1981, 1987 and 1994. On - the - job training of personnel started in earnest, and some training was carried out in departmental training units.

- 4.4.2 **In-service Training and Allocation of Graduates:** The national objective of replacing expatriates in established positions with citizens was consistently high on the agenda. The Training and Development, and the Manpower Planning Divisions did a lot to improve the quantity and quality of the staff of the civil service. While the former provided in- service training, the latter allocated the stock of graduates to government departments.
- 4.4.3 **Institutional Training:** There were not many institutions in Botswana where personnel of the Civil Service could be trained in the disciplines and numbers required. The reform made provision for training to be done overseas, especially long-term graduate and post-graduate studies. Some of the training was also done in Regional institutes. In any event, most of the training was done locally.
- 4.4.4 **Funding of Training Programmes:** Until 1990 the cost of civil servants pursuing courses outside the country was paid by donor agencies in its entirety. In 1990, the Directorate of Public Service Management introduced a fund for in-service training which gave the Government the opportunity to exercise maximum control on training programmes in its totality.
- 4.4.5 **Retention of Trained Staff:** The temptation of trained civil servants leaving the service for industries and the private sector could not be ruled out. For the Government to prevent or reduce the incidence of vacation of posts and resignations, beneficiaries of the training scheme were bonded for the length of time the training lasted. In addition, the Government accepted no resignation of officers before the bonding period had lapsed or the payment of the full cost of the scholarship awarded the beneficiary.
- 4.4.6 **Counterparts:** As stated above, many of the key and professional positions in the Civil Service were held by expatriate staff. The reform programme made provision for expatriates to have counterparts to understudy and learn from them, so that eventually the counterparts would be in a position to take over their functions when they left. This "shadowing" technique, as it was called, worked to perfection. A shadow post was discontinued when a counterpart took over from the expatriate. However, in 1994, it was revealed that there was abuse of shadow posts in many technical department; Shadow posts were, in some instances, retained even though the expatriate staff had left.
- 4.5 **Job Evaluation:** It became necessary to include in the civil service reform process job evaluation. The value of each job in the service was assessed in relation to other jobs. It was an exercise which provided data for the determination of salaries and wages, ranking and placement of staff. It took ten

(10) years to complete.

- 4.6 **Organisational Restructuring of Government:** The restructuring exercise was carried out successfully to cover all the nine (9) Ministries of Government. The Office of the President was what was left to be done. Based on government policies, priorities and programmes and with the collaboration of all concerned, each ministry was provided with clear corporate objectives and functions, making sure that there were no conflicts nor duplications.

A problem which became apparent during the exercise was that there were inadequacies of human resource in terms of numbers and skills.

- 4.7 **Human Resource Utilisation:** As an input for the reform programme, it became necessary to set up an inspectorate to audit manpower in departments. The main functions of the inspectorate were:

- to ensure the compatibility of staff and work-load ratios;
- to ensure the existence of an effective monitoring system of workers' productivity; and
- to ensure that human resources were deployed in the best possible way.

4.8 **Pay and Incentives**

One of the policies of the Government was to encourage staff to stay in the civil service. It was hoped that through enhancement of salaries and wages the objectives of retaining the scarce, highly-trained and experienced officers within the service would be achieved. Since 1982, based on recommendations of Presidential Review Commissions, there had been increases in salaries.

Another Committee appointed by the Government came out with a Report on Implementation of Paralled Progression in 1991. The recommendations led to an extended salary scales in 1992 for professionals, technical and artisan cadres. The parallel progression programme was introduced by a Presidential Commission on Incomes Policy which enhanced entry salary scales for the same group of staff mentioned above. The prospects of promotion increased, and staff were persuaded to stay longer in the service with the hope of getting additional promotion.

4.9 **Productivity**

Efforts were made at the national level to improve productivity in the civil service. In 1993 the National Productivity Centre was established "to stimulate and generate productivity consciousness in Botswana." An innovation introduced into the system was Work Improvement Teams (WITs) which was considered an effective strategy for productivity improvement. WITs was basically a task-oriented approach to work based on certain assumptions including the belief that "people want to be part of a team." Added to these measures meant to increase productivity was the issuing

of a set of values touching on transparency, ethics and behaviour of the civil servant.

4.10 **Decentralised Development Planning**

Decentralisation of development planning constituted a major approach in the reform programme. The Government adopted a bottom-up approach in the planning process thus involving members of the public through consultations, to the extent that village development committees were seriously involved in policy formulation and development planning.

4.11 **Accountability and Transparency**

The people of Botswana expected their Government to be accountable and transparent in its activities; so also was the Government willing to demonstrate accountability and transparency in managing the economy and controlling public services.

- 4.12 **Parliament and District Assemblies:** Government ensured that its activities were discussed legally and formally in Parliament and District councils where every member, whether in the opposition or ruling party, had equal chance of participating in discussions. Frequently in Parliament, Ministers were questioned on the actions of their ministries and were expected to respond.

Government expenditure was closely monitored, and Parliament served as a watchdog over it. The Auditor-General was tasked with the responsibility of advising Parliament on financial issues, whereas the Public Accounts Committee was to hear cases of wrongdoing in the disbursement and use of government funds.

- 4.13 **The Press:** The press assisted greatly in promoting accountability and transparency. The entry of the private media into the stream of public information and scrutiny of government activities improved the quality of criticisms. One important advantage of the press was that there was press freedom which allowed the media to express any relevant view provided they did not infringe the law.

4.14 **Corruption and Economic Crimes**

Corruption and economic crimes, hitherto not common in Botswana, started increasing. The Government, therefore, set up a machinery to combat them. A Directorate on corruption and Economic crimes was established in the Office of the President with the mandate to investigate and prosecute corrupt officials and businessmen/businesswomen. Importantly, the Directorate was to provide public education on corruption and economic crimes and prevent them.

4.15 **Ombudsman**

Another important establishment which was proposed was the office of the Ombudsman. The main function would be "to investigate any action taken by or on behalf of a government department or authority, as a result of which any member of the public claims to have sustained injustice. The Ombudsman may require the principal officers to remedy the situation if...indeed an injustice has been committed."

IV. CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS: RESULTS ACHIEVED AND LESSONS LEARNED

1.0 Introduction:

In this chapter, we shall critically compare the results achieved by the five (5) African countries whose reform initiatives we have examined as well as those of two (2) other countries; notably Malaysia and Trinidad and Tobago.

2.0 Problems

In both Ghana and Uganda, one could see similar weaknesses in the Civil Service and yet in both cases, it needed pressure from donors to embark on the reform initiatives. Zimbabwe and Cameroon had some of the lacunae, notably overstaffing, an unwieldy Civil Service suffering from inefficiency and ineffectiveness as well as lack of responsiveness to the public. In Zimbabwe, even though the authorities had set some reform action in motion, yet it needed the intervention of donors to give it impetus. It is worthy of note that Botswana, Malaysia and Trinidad and Tobago had different situations yet, on their own, without pressure from outside quarters, they initiated profound reform measures, which, in addition, were implemented with a large degree of success.

3.0 Reduction of the Size of the Civil Service

Ghana's first reform measure in 1987 was aimed at reducing the staffing levels of the Civil Service. It sought to do this by providing incentive packages for voluntary retirements. Under the Labour Rationalization Policy, it succeeded in trimming the size of the staff from 140,000 in 1987 to 91,000 in 1993. The success of Uganda, Zimbabwe and Cameroon in this area has been quite insignificant. Zimbabwe, for instance, was unable to attain the target of cutting down the staffing levels by 23,000 within five (5) years as it had planned. Instead, it had to settle for the modest figure of 12,700 by June 30, 1994.

4.0 Restructuring of the Civil Service

The restructuring of the civil service in Ghana was given legal backing by the Civil Service Law PNDCL 327 (1993). By this Law, the title of the head of a ministerial organisation which had been changed from Permanent Secretary to Principal Secretary in the early 1960s, was again changed to Chief Director. Also, ministries were to be organised into four (4) distinct specialised functional areas. This activity could not be spoken of as a success. Chief Directors were appointed for some ministries in 1993. The exercise was, however, not concluded, as some ministries were still left without substantive Chief Directors. Also, only two (2) out of ten (10) Regional Co-ordinating Councils had substantive heads. Key ministries like Health, Education, Works and Housing, Lands and Natural Resources, Mines and

Energy, and nine (9) Regional Co-ordinating Councils have been without Chief Directors for years now.

The Civil Service Reform in Cameroon had a restructuring component. This was designed to solve the problem of the cost and size of the Civil Service, among others.

In the Botswana reforms, restructuring was also undertaken. This was reported to be highly successful.

5.0 ACHIEVING A MISSION ORIENTATION

In 1996, the reform process in Ghana shifted its initial emphasis to “strengthening institutional capacity, developing a culture of good governance, of efficiency and effectiveness in service delivery and of willing assistance to the private sector.....”

CSPIP itself had a mission statement and clear objectives. Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) were encouraged to prepare strategic plans, called Performance Improvement Plans (PIPs) for their respective institutions. They developed mission statements, set S.M.A.R.T. objectives and determined strategies to be used to achieve them.

The reform in Botswana also had this aspect. Through the restructuring of ministerial organisations, each ministry had clear corporate objectives and well-defined functions. The restructuring in Cameroon had similar objectives- to revisit the mission and functions of each ministry, thereby avoiding duplication of responsibilities.

Zimbabwe's reform had kicked off with Government charging the Public Service Review Commission in 1987 to undertake a general and in-depth review of the structures, functions, management and procedures in use in the Civil Service. The reforms in Malaysia had made efforts to encourage ministries to adopt a mission orientation. Since 1992 with the introduction of Total Quality Management in the Civil Service, ministerial organisations are required to formulate vision and mission statements, to determine objectives and establish quality standards for its outputs.

In Trinidad and Tobago, ministries and departments have been working since 1992 on the preparation of:

- a statement of vision;
- a mission statement;
- strategic objectives and strategies for achieving those objectives; and
- staff buy-in to the mission/vision of the organisation.

6.0 **FORMATION OF CHANGE TEAMS**

A remarkable feature in the process of formulating a Strategic Plan is the formation of “change teams.” Botswana introduced the “Work Improvement Teams (WITs), a concept which it borrowed from Singapore, in its drive to improve productivity.

In Ghana, Capacity Development Teams (CDTs) were formed in ministries and departments, to spearhead the change effort in their respective organisations. The teams led the way in the process of developing a vision, a mission statement, and in setting objectives and developing appropriate strategies.

Trinidad and Tobago have *change teams* with virtually the same role and responsibilities as the CDTs. Also in all these countries, efforts are made to use the bottom-up approach and involve as many staff members of the institution concerned and stakeholders as possible. While in the process for brainstorming, in Trinidad and Tobago it is a retreat.

7.0 **STAFF PERFORMANCE APPRAISAL SYSTEM**

The CSRP in Ghana introduced a new Staff Performance Appraisal System in 1991, and its application became mandatory in 1992. The aim was to have a more reliable and objective, target – based system to evaluate performance. It was later observed by CSPIP that up to 1997, the use of the new system had not become a culture of the management of the Civil Service. It must be added that it is still not a part of the culture of the Ghana Civil Service. In other words, the reform had failed. Malaysia introduced a new Staff Performance Appraisal System in 1992. Its major objective, like the Ghanaian reform, was “to create a systematic, reliable and comprehensive procedure for work performance measurement”. And a guidebook was prepared to assist users and training was given to Civil Servants to ensure successful implementation, just as was done in Ghana.

However, while the Ghanaian reform failed, the Malaysian effort was successful. Part of the reason for the success of the Malaysian reform, is that it was directly linked to the New Remuneration System (NRS) also introduced in 1992. The NRS involves major changes in “remuneration and reward system and in the terms of services”.

In other words, the Malaysian authorities’ efforts to make the public service “to become more responsive, efficient and capable of meeting new challenges,” it is in the context of a radical move to improve remuneration and incentives.

In the Ghana reform, the new system was introduced in spite of the extremely low salaries paid to Civil Servants and the very poor conditions of service under which they work. It is not surprising that few Civil Servants, if any, show interest in it.

Cameroon had been faced with a problem using a subjective, unreliable system of assessing staff performance. An attempt was made to introduce a reform in this

area- to define specific targets with a means to measure performance. Its implementation is reported to be successful.

8.0 JOB ANALYSIS /EVALUATION

Job Inspections and Analysis were carried out at the initial stages of the reform exercise. The reform had aimed at making job analysis a regular feature of the Ghana Civil Service. Since those early stages, job inspections and analysis have not been conducted in the Ghana Civil Service.

Botswana included Job Evaluation in the Civil Service Reform process. The exercise took ten (10) years to complete.

9.0 INTEGRATED PAYROLL AND PERSONNEL DATABASE (IPPD)

An Integrated Payroll and Personnel Database was brought into operation during CSRP in Ghana. The IPPD was to assist in the management of human resources in the Civil Service and also facilitate the accessing of personnel records. Trinidad and Tobago had embarked on a similar activity in its reform. The implementation of the Integrated Human Resource Management Information System was expected to result in quick access to human resource data and more effective human resource management decisions. A pilot project established in the Ministry of Finance was being evaluated for wider use.

9.1 A Pay and Grading System

A 13-band Pay and Grading Structure had been introduced by 1992 to bring about uniform pay and grading system for the Civil Service in Ghana. It still has not been made operational. Indeed since the start of the reforms in Ghana twelve (12) years ago, remuneration of Civil Servants has not been improved in any significant way. In real terms, they receive much less than before. Their conditions of service have deteriorated as certain allowances have been withdrawn. This is in sharp contrast to what is happening in some other countries in the world i.e., Botswana, Malaysia, Trinidad and Tobago, and in Singapore.

In Botswana, the Government has since 1972, made the improvement in the remuneration of Civil Servants high priority. "Pay and Incentives" was a major aspect of the Civil Service Reform. The Government's policy was to retain the highly- trained and experienced officers in the Service through enhanced salaries and improved conditions of service. Thus, since 1982, there have been periodic salary increases. These improvements in remuneration are directly tied to performance. Malaysia introduced the NRS in 1992 and linked it to the new Staff Performance Appraisal System. The implementation of the NRS was also an opportunity for the reclassification of the schemes of service, aimed at increasing effectiveness in the human resource management of the Service. New forms of

allowances were also introduced while improvements were made in already existing benefits.

However, when it comes to remuneration, the Singapore Civil Service is way ahead of every other Civil Service in the world. Since 1972, the Government has been seeking to provide increasingly competitive salaries and favourable conditions of service for the Civil Servant.

In March 1972, Civil Servants were given a "13th month non-pensionable allowance comparable to the bonus in the private sector." A year later, salaries of Senior Civil Servants were increased to reduce the gap with the private sector. These increases have continued to be based on the Government's view that:

"As a fundamental philosophy, the Government will pay Civil Servants market rates for their abilities and responsibilities. It will offer whatever salaries are necessary to attract and retain the talent that it needs....."

As a result of regular increases, salaries of Civil Servants in Singapore are extremely high--even by international standards. For instance, in July 1994, the basic monthly salary for the top administrative grade (Staff GdV) was S \$38,799 (i.e. US \$25,866).

In Ghana, however, neither the government nor the donors seem to have seen enhancement in remuneration and improved conditions of service as important, let alone a determinant for improved performance and quality service delivery. The attempts to give Civil Servants better pay and enhanced service conditions have without exception, stalled. Thus, twelve years (12) after the Civil Service Reforms were initiated, the plight of the Civil Servant is, to say the least, not better. As indicated earlier, a Pay and Grading System was introduced in 1992, but has as yet not been implemented. Instead, another Committee was set up to study the situation and make appropriate recommendations. These recommendations were not even commented upon. An International Consulting firm was then given the assignment to examine remuneration in the entire Public Service and make recommendations. Its report, submitted after more than two (2) years, was the subject of general comment and discussion for another two (2) years. The Civil Servant was made to believe that finally, even if he was not going to strike gold, he was going to have a decent salary. When these were paid at the end of July this year, the general outcry that greeted its implementation was enough evidence of the frustration and disillusionment of Civil Servants, who all claim are much worse off. Some claim they received in July, one-third the remuneration they had received the previous month! They are, therefore, demoralised and deeply demotivated.

The failure to pay Civil Servants decent wages has been attributed to the poor state of the economy. It is argued that Civil Servants should work hard to bring about a remarkable improvement in the national economy and then there will be a

corresponding improvement in their remuneration. Civil Servants are, therefore, paid "slave wages" because of Government's inability to pay more.

Civil Servants generally interpret this as Government's unwillingness to pay. In any case, it is difficult to see how a totally impoverished and famished officer, unable to take three (3) meals a day, to look after his family and educate his children; unable to make provision for the future, can be expected to work with total commitment and dedication, be customer – friendly and strategise for the organisation. As the Vokker Commission of the USA commented:

"The commitment to performance cannot long survive, however, unless the government provides adequate pay, recognition for jobs done, accessible training, and decent working conditions."

10.0 **PUBLIC COMPLAINTS UNIT (PCU)**

PNDCL 327 (1993) established the Public Complaints Unit to receive complaints from the public and attend to them. It is located in the OHCS. The push for the Civil Service to be customer – oriented and provide quality services makes the PCU assume an increasingly crucial role. Instead of waiting for the citizen – now, re-identified as a customer – to come forward with a complaint, the PCU must now seek customers' views and feedback to enable the Civil Service to respond accordingly and make the necessary quality improvements.

In its efforts to be customer-oriented and customer-focussed, CSPIP has not only identified stakeholders and their expectations through the beneficiary surveys but has also sought to involve them in the development of the PIPs to build a Civil Service-Private Sector partnership.

CSPIP has also published leaflets explaining the procedures and time – frame for carrying out certain tasks. This is to make information more accessible to the user.

Since 1971, Malaysia has had the Public Complaints Bureau, located in the Prime Minister's Department. It was re-structured in 1992 and strengthened to deal more effectively with public complaints. With this, a Permanent committee on Public Complaints was set up under the chairmanship of the Chief Secretary to the Government and its members are Senior officials in the Public Service. The PCB makes strenuous efforts through radio broadcasts, local newspapers, publication of the Annual Report of the PCB, information and exhibition clinics on the *raison d'être* and functions of the PCB etc.

By November 1993, the PCB had received 4,056 complaints. Like the reform in Ghana, Malaysia has gone further in its desire to establish a customer orientation. Public sector organisations are encouraged to formulate "Client Charters" for their respective organisations. In the Client Charter, an organisation makes a written

commitment to deliver service quality to its customers, setting out the latter's rights etc.

One key element in this process is to obtain a feedback from customers through surveys, suggestion boxes, toll-free calls etc. The approach, the identification of customers and their requirements, of services rendered etc. is similar to the Beneficiary Surveys under CSPIP in Ghana.

This approach, in addition to the participation of the users in the diagnostic workshops helps create an esprit de corps among the Civil Servants and their customers in addition to helping to create partnerships between a ministerial organisation and the private sector.

Botswana has been putting up a vigorous fight against corruption, which was increasing at an alarming rate. The need for combating corruption and other economic crimes was realised and the Government set up a machinery for that purpose. The Directorate which was established in the Office of the President, was mandated to investigate and prosecute corrupt officials and also to undertake public education with a view to reducing the incidence of these crimes. Malaysia " is committed to establishing an efficient, clean, trustworthy and disciplined Civil Service. Towards this end, it continues its efforts to inculcate good values on discipline, integrity and accountability among public officials!

Trinidad and Tobago also has measures to ensure integrity in its public service. "Ethics and accountability are major issues which need to be addressed by any democratic government wishing to ensure the trust of its citizens in its stewardship".

Singapore's approach is singularly worthy of note. It is a two (2)-pronged approach. The first prong was to amend the law on corruption by curbing opportunities for corruption and introducing a stiffer penalty. The second prong was to reduce the incentive for corruption by improving salaries and working conditions in the Civil Service. Singapore's anti-corruption efforts have paid off since they are designed to remove the two major causes of corruption: the incentives and the opportunities that make corrupt behaviour irresistible.

We feel inclined to agree with this strategy and to recommend it to all who intend to fight seriously against the canker. For, as long as people are economically pushed against the wall- they will find corruption attractive – no matter what sermons are preached, what campaigns are carried out or what penalties are imposed.

In a recent article entitled: "The campaign against corruption in Ghana: which way", the Executive Director of the Serious Fraud Office (SFO) made this point in unambiguous terms "most public workers are known to have lived on wages lower than the required minimum standard. This is one major cause of petty corruption. No fight against corruption can succeed if society requires its workers to be moral heroes".

V. CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS: ETHICS, ACCOUNTABILITY, TRANSPARENCY AND GOOD GOVERNANCE

1.0 INTRODUCTION

Pierre Landel-Mills and Ismail Sergeldin characterised governance as.

Good governance depends on the extent to which a government is perceived and accepted by the general citizenry to be legitimate; committed to improving the general public welfare and responsive to the needs of the citizenry; able to create an enabling policy environment for productive activities; and equitable in its conduct, favouring no special interests or groups.

At a National workshop on Governance in Ghana (16th – 18th June, 1997) governance was defined as “the exercise of political, economic and administrative authority in the management of a country’s affairs at all levels.” In effect, elements of good governance include good politics, sound economic policies, a vibrant society, and equitable administration.

From the above characteristics of good governance it is obvious that any improvement of the public services must take cognisance of the manner in which countries are governed. Civil service reform which is directed towards developing effective and efficient public management capacity, therefore has direct relationship with good governance which in turn involves ethics, accountability and transparency.

2.0 ETHICS

Public servants are participants in government and are expected to responsibly serve the public. Ethical rules are meant to guide them to render service objectively, efficiently and impartially and with integrity. It is unfortunate that ethical discipline in the public service of many African countries has broken down, and not without reason.

3.0 CAUSES OF DECAY OF PUBLIC SERVICE ETHICS

There are basically three(3) factors which have caused the decay of public service ethics. The first is the Political factor, the second, Economic factor, and the third, Cultural factor.

Public servants, especially the political class, disregard their ethical obligations to society and do just what would suit them. Corruption has permeated through the whole fabric of the public service as a result of the exercise of political power by those who are supposed to set high ethical standards.

The weak situation of African economies has influenced people to behave in a way that would satisfy the need for economic survival. It is realised that the value of the income of public servants has been rendered meaningless because of the economic situation. The easy avenue for survival is for one to place little or no importance on ethical behaviour.

The culture of African countries which binds society together increases the demand made on officials in positions of power and influence. At one point or the other, these officials have to circumvent laid down rules and regulations in order to meet cultural obligations. This has contributed to the erosion of ethical values and standards.

Every society has moral standards which are expected to be observed as a value system. There are some ways of behaviour which are considered "wrong" by society, and there are others which are deemed "right". Any deviation from the right way of behaviour is ethically wrong. The main concern of ethics in the public services is on what is considered the right and accepted behaviour of public servants, especially politicians and civil servants.

Civil Service reforms in many African countries include in the process education of those who hold power and authority to uphold morality high in their behaviour. In Ghana, the people affirmed their commitment to probity in the 1992 constitution, with the hope that people in authority would be just in their decisions and actions in adherence to the Constitution.

4.0 **ACCOUNTABILITY**

In countries of Africa where democratic governance prevails, good governance presupposes that those in authority responsibly perform their obligations to society. In addition, they must account to the people. Any neglect of accountability would create a favourable environment for wrong behaviour, such as bribery and corruption. In some instances public funds are diverted to serve the narrow and parochial interest of an individual or a group of people. Reinhard Bendix and Max Weber have described corruption as when a public official "accepts money or money's worth for doing something that he is under duty to do, or not to do, or to exercise a legitimate discretion for improper reasons".

5.0 **CAUSES OF CORRUPTION**

There are a number of factors which breed corruption in African countries, some of these are political, economic or social. The nature of politics in Africa is filled with uncertainties. There have been many instances of military take-overs and no insurance benefits when a politician leaves office. Therefore, politicians use their office and political power to amass as much wealth as they illegally can acquire. This behaviour trickles down through top bureaucracy to the lowest echelons of the public service. Samuel N. Woode writes that "It is known that it is when those at

the top are busy collecting ten percent commissions that messengers and registry clerks are encouraged to openly demand 'little tips'.

Many public servants are lowly remunerated and can hardly make ends meet. In situations where it is not possible to obtain or perform a second job, coupled with the knowledge of the corrupt practices of politicians/leaders, they are encouraged to neglect ethics and codes of conduct and indulge in corruption to survive.

Economic and social conditions in many African countries have deteriorated to the extent that hikes in prices and interest rates are rampant, reducing the value of the income of public officials. One easy option to top up their income is to receive bribes, sometimes in the form of gifts. Morality is broken down and corruption becomes the order of the day. The situation becomes anomic and many people join without guilt.

The perpetrators of bribery and corruption crimes especially politicians and senior bureaucrats are on many occasions not brought to justice. Where some offenders are sanctioned, the punishments are minor and negligible to the surprise and chagrin of the general public. Unfortunately, this behaviour has not succeeded in bringing down governments in Africa partly because of election frauds and other political malpractices.

Traditional Social values have often facilitated nepotism and corruption. Rules and regulations are bent by politicians and senior bureaucrats to accommodate requests from friends and relatives. And with the infiltration of national politics into civil bureaucracy, the situation has been aggravated. It is not surprising therefore that many unqualified persons were appointed to the civil service introducing inefficiency into the system and swelling the size of the service.

It is for no mean reason that the Ghana 1992 Constitution, for instance, declared and affirmed the commitment to accountability. Accountability enjoins people in authority and who exercise power to account to the people. That is one of the reasons why executive decisions must seek the approval of parliament. If this is always done, it could be said that there is a shared responsibility for accountability between the government and the governed. Because one of the reasons why governments are to be accountable to the people is that accountability is supposed to make governments transparent.

6.0 **TRANSPARENCY**

The governed would consider a government as good if its decisions, goals and actions are easily understood or recognised. Policies are to be understandable, and statements not dishonest or deceptive but frank and discernible. With the fulfillment of the above, the process of government is said to be transparent.

Some African governments are noted as not being transparent in their behaviour. They commit the resources of their countries without informing the people or seeking parliamentary approval. Before one is aware the deal has been sealed may be with the collaboration of some senior bureaucrats. In such transactions there could be veiled corruption which has very disastrous effect on the economy and social life of a nation. Such big corruption which thrives in unsuspected, imperceptible circles has more serious consequences than the petty corruption which is common among small public servants and users of public services.

A few countries in Africa have seriously attempted to fight corruption through several approaches. In Botswana, for instance, government insists that its decisions, policies and activities pass through the formal process for approval. Parliament and District councils play a major role in this. Government expenditure is monitored and the Auditor-General advises on financial issues.

In South Africa, Ghana and Botswana, the entry of private media has enriched the monitoring of government's financial transaction, and provided additional stage for making informed opinion about government affairs, and criticising or praising as appropriate. Press freedom in these countries has gone a long way to protect journalist, provided they act responsibly within the law. It is even on record that the South African President once said that "the press should not be unduly restrained by the laws of defamation when it comes to public figures in their public duties." Press criticisms, infact, have enhanced transparency and contributed a lot to a heightened sense of accountability on the part of governments and senior bureaucrats.

A number of countries have gone further to develop codes of conduct for some of the stakeholders of the integrity system of a country. They have introduced assets declaration system for all office holders and elected members. These countries include South Africa and Ghana.

Reforms in many African countries emphasize ethics, accountability and transparency. There is an attempt to adopt a holistic approach by involving all the stakeholders i.e.:

- Public service commissions;
- Law enforcers;
- Auditor-General;
- Accountant-General;
- Civil/public servants,
- Parliamentarians;
- Private sector;
- General public.

In Ghana, for example, the private sector has been identified as the engine of growth of the economy. Policy formulation has separated from implementation. The Ministries are responsible for the former and the private

sector/departments/agencies the latter. All these are directed towards the strengthening of accountability.

VI. SUSTAINABILITY AND GUIDELINES FOR CIVIL SERVICE REFORMS

1.0 SUSTAINABILITY OF THE CIVIL SERVICE PERFORMS IN AFRICA

One of the crucial issues arising from reform efforts is the extent to which the entire process can be sustained. This demands that certain conditions should be fulfilled.

The first condition for the sustainability of any reform measure, therefore, is the political support. A very senior member of government, preferably the head, must be the one who champions the reform. This political support must be visible and must be demonstrated in his willingness to push difficult reform measures through, to ensure their success. The political support must also be translated into financial support. It is well and good to receive donor funding to carry out reforms. However, external funding provides the donor with the opportunity to influence the reforms. Besides, donor funding will one day dry up and that will mean the end of the reforms.

Again, political support must be in the form of the willingness to provide resources that will enable the Civil Service to undertake successfully the new responsibilities that are entrusted to it.

From our study, Botswana is one African country which has, single handedly, and on its own initiative, carried out Civil Service Reforms. Ghana, Uganda and Zimbabwe have initiated reforms under pressure from donors who also have funded these reforms. Dependence on external funding in those countries puts the reforms at risk. Cameroon, Ghana, Uganda and Zimbabwe must gradually take over this aspect of the reform.

The second condition is management of the reform. This can be in two (2) ways: the expertise of these managers of the reform, and the structures put in place to ensure its success. The Ghana case shows that both aspects are in place. The members of the Technical Group are well equipped for the task and the structures with full-time high-calibre officers, make for sustainability of the reforms. Also, they have shared this expertise and these skills with members of the CDTs and others, thereby building their competencies and capabilities in various areas such as strategic management, etc.

Uganda has gone through a similar experience and now boasts of a pool of local expertise in reforms to ensure continuity and sustainability.

A third condition for sustainability is the institutional capacity building. Civil Servants acquire the skills to develop strategic plans. The process used in arriving at the plans helps to equip them adequately to pursue the reforms and at the same time to improve their performance.

Yet another condition for sustainability of the reforms is ownership. Ownership ensures commitment for success and sustainability. This has been a remarkable feature of CSPIP in Ghana, and of the reforms in Botswana, Malaysia and in Trinidad and Tobago.

2.0 **GUIDELINES**

- There is need for legal backing for the reform process.
- The major condition for the success of CSRs is political support at the highest level. African governments must break the dependence on donors to fund their reforms for them. They must take total responsibility for the reform of the Civil Service.
- The political commitment to the reform must be demonstrated by the resources – particularly financial and material, that government is prepared to make available to push it forward as in the case of Botswana, Malaysia and Trinidad and Tobago;
- African governments should also provide the resources that are required as a consequence of the reforms. For instance, if through the reforms, Civil Servants acquire the skills for Strategic Management, they must obtain the resources required for achieving the objectives of the plan. Nothing could be more demoralising and frustrating than not having the tools to work with;
- Reforms must be on-going and a regular feature in MDAs. Each MDA must establish and a system to sustain the process and be mandated to resolve problems that emerge, instead of waiting for directives and instructions from the Central Government.
- In this regard, Governments in sub-Saharan Africa must vote sufficient resources on a regular basis for application by the MDAs in their reforms.
- CSRs must truly be "homegrown" and initiated to ensure ownership by the Service itself.
- Remuneration and improved conditions of service of Civil Servants must be a priority issue for both political and administrative authorities. It should be seen as the condition for high productivity and for abiding by the Code of Conduct and for building a positive and strong work ethic.
- African Governments must, like the Government of Botswana, establish a Training Fund for the training and development of Civil Servants. Annual budgetary allocations should be made into that fund.

- Governments should clearly define the role of the Civil Service so it is left in no doubt at all about what is expected of it.
- Members of Government should refrain from making public attacks on Civil Servants, especially as the latter are under obligation not to defend themselves
- Most African countries do not have sufficient funds of their own to single-handedly reform the civil service to be strong and effective without donor support. It is essential that the Ministry of Finance of these countries maintain financial discipline in government/public spending. When such an exercise becomes evident, it would enhance the chances of raising funds from external agencies.
- The relationship between reform agencies and donors should be properly defined and their roles spelt out to avoid any conflicts. Obviously, if consultation is improved, that every stakeholder knows what is happening, conflicts would be minimized or eliminated. In some countries, what happens among donor agencies, ministry of Finance and the office of the head of the civil service is mere communication and not consultation.
- Machinery for effective and transparent monitoring and evaluation for the project should be instituted; and the exercise should be on-going so as to make it possible for early identification of problems and constraints for resolution before any damage is done. With the creation of good atmosphere of consultation, co-operation, and information sharing, it would not be difficult to correct any damage to the reform programme and sustain it.
- There are occasions that donor agencies compete among themselves resulting in complete absence of dialogue and consultation. Such a situation does not augur well for any reform programme. Civil Service Reform is complex, and if care is not taken objectives would be misplaced and vacuum created. Donors should consult among themselves to determine areas and volume of assistance each donor is to provide. Recipient countries should also be involved. This would ensure equitable funding of all the sectors of the programme. Their roles and responsibilities would also be clear, and the level of accountability and transparency would be raised.
- In their fight against corruption, the press in African countries must be given its freedom to expose corrupt officials who should be dealt with harshly when found to have committed the crime. In addition, the press should be encouraged to carry out educational campaign on ethical issues, probity and accountability.

VII CONCLUSION

The Public Service of most African Countries during the colonial rule was one of small in nature. After these countries achieved independence their governments bloated the number of staff with indiscriminate recruitment, thereby, making the size of the service unwieldy. One would grant that because of the expanded functions of the Civil Service of the newly independent countries and the urgent need to improve the standard of living of the people, some staff increases were essential, but not to the magnitude experienced.

As a result of the increase in the size of the Civil Service with its accompanying bloated bureaucracy, the service and government machinery swallowed up a big share of the budget, dwindling the financial resources of the countries concerned. This affected the political, economic and social life of the people. There was high unemployment rates in these countries, rampant price hikes, reduction in the value of money and poverty.

The unplanned recruitment of staff into the Civil Service introduced poor quality personnel into the Service. Efficiency was therefore sacrificed for political considerations where politicians and senior bureaucrats bent the rules and regulations to satisfy party members, friends and relatives. Ethics, accountability and transparency broke down, leading to illegal survival strategies of bribery and corruption permeating through government and the bureaucracies from top to bottom. Good governance was meaningless and remote in the eyes of people.

In the 1970s the gravity of the deteriorating conditions in many African countries with respect to the inefficiency and ineffectiveness of the Civil Service became increasingly evident, and some governments started reforms to improve the service. These reform initiatives were implemented half-heartedly and the impact was in the main, insignificant. In the late 1980s, many were prompted by donor agencies to consider the reform of the Public Service and these donors have been providing funding and technical assistance towards the reform efforts.

A number of strategies have been adopted in the quest for an efficient and effective Civil Service. Some of these strategies are:

- Reduction in the size and cost of the Civil Service through retrenchment and freezing of recruitment;
- Devolution which involves decentralization of power and authority from the central government to local governments;
- Improving the conditions of service of the Civil Service; e.g. pay and incentives;
- Education on ethics, accountability, transparency and good governance.
- Organisational capacity building; and
- Organisational restructuring.

It must be said that the reform initiatives in the African countries have achieved reasonable success. In almost all the countries which have embarked on reforms, there have been reductions in the size of the Civil Service and cost. Some of the Ministries, Departments and Agencies have been restructured and a number of institutions established to ensure good governance.

Despite some successes in the pursuit of objectives, much remains to be done. Some of the important areas where reform efforts are to be intensified are:

- Sustainability of the reform programme;
- Eradication/minimization of bribery and corruption; and
- Promotion of ethics, accountability, transparency and good governance.

There are many instances of unacceptable things happening which is an indication that all is not well, and that a lot must be done for the reform measures to be effectively implemented.

This study of the Civil Service Reforms in Africa has clearly shown that the reforms will succeed if governments provide a high degree of political commitment and support, improve the conditions of service of civil servants and practice good governance

VIII. BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. CSPIP NEWS VOL 1 NO. 3
2. Performance Agreement between the Chief Director Ministry of Finance and the Government of Ghana, January –December 1999.
3. Review of the Management Services Division (MSD). December 14, 1987
4. CSPIP: 1996 –2001: Report on CSPIP Internal Review Year 2 of Full Operational Phase (September 1997 – August 1998).
5. CSPIP 1996 – 2001: Report on CSPIP Quarterly Internal Review (September 1998- December 1998) of Full Operational Phase (Year 3: September 1998 - August 1999).
6. CSPIP: 1996- 2001: CSPIP Quarterly Internal Review (January 1999 – April 1999) of Full Operational Phase (Year 3: September 1998 – August 1999).
7. Mamadou DIA “ Making Government an effective partner: Civil Service Reform in sub-Saharan Africa”
8. Government of Ghana – Vision 2020 (The First Step: 1996 – 2000)- Presidential Report on Co-ordinated Programme of Economy; and Social Development Policies.
9. “Bureaucracy Politicisation: The Structural Reorganisation of the Central Civil Service of Ghana, 1982 –1991” unpublished M Phil Thesis, University of Ghana (March 1993).
10. Government of Ghana: National Workshop on Governance in Ghana: Workshop Report VOL.1.
11. European Centre for Development Policy Management: Policy Management brief No. 7: Civil Service Reform in the context of structural adjustment. A triangular relationship – September 7, 1997.
12. S.A. Nkrumah: Aspects of Administrative Reforms in Ghana under the PNDC Government.
13. CHRAJ: “ Towards a Collective Plan of Action for the creation of a National Integrity System: October 1998.
14. Mohan Kaul: Better Policy Support – Improving Policy Management in the Public Service.
15. Samuel N. Woode: “Values Standards and Practices in Ghanaian organisational life” Asempa Publishers 1998.
16. Sadig Rasheed and Dele Olowu: “Ethics and Accountability in African Public Services” A.A.P.A.M. 1994.
17. Commonwealth Secretariat: “Current Good Practices and New Developments in Public Service Management: A profile of the Public Service in Malaysia.”
18. Commonwealth Secretariat: Current Good Practices and New Development in Public Service Management: A Profile of the Public Service of Trinidad and Tobago.
19. C.A.P.A.M : Government in Transition- The Inaugural Conference of C.A.P.A.M. (28-31, August 1994)
20. Ladipo Adamolekun, Guy de Lusignan and Armand Atomate :
21. Civil Service Reform in Francophone Africa: Proceedings of a Workshop, Abidjan, January 23-26, 1996.

22. SAPATI, B.A.: "The campaign against corruption in Ghana: Which way?" "Ghanaian Chronicle". September 8- 12, 1999.
23. A Brief Note for Ministers on the Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme March 1997
24. Government of Ghana : Civil Service Performance Improvement Programme
25. Governance and the External Factor", a paper presented at the World Bank Annual Conference on Development Economics 25 - 26 April, 1991.
26. National Workshop on Governance in Ghana, 16th - 18th June, 1997: Workshop Report, Volume 1, February 1998.
27. Reinhard Bendix and Max Weber, An Intellectual Portrait, New York, 1960.