REPORT ON SELECTED PRACTICES ON GENDER MAINSTREAMING – ETHIOPIA EMEBET MULUGETA

LIST OF ACRONYMS

BPR	Business Process Reengineering
CSA	Central Statistical Agency
CEDAW	Convention for the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination
	against Women
CSO	Civil Society Organization
FCSA	Federal Civil Service Agency
FDRE	Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
GNI	Gross National Income
HTPs	Harmful Traditional Practices
ICPD	International Conference on Population and Development
MOE	Ministry of Finance and Economic Development
MDG	Millennium Development Goals
MoARD	Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
MoWA	Ministry of Women's Affairs
MoJ	Ministry of Justice
MoWUD	Ministry of Works and Urban Development
NAP-GE	National Action Plan on Gender Equality
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
PASDEP	Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty
PFA	Platform for Action
RCB	Rural Capacity-Building
TGE	Transitional Government of Ethiopia
TVET	Technical Vocational Education and Training
WAB	Women's Affairs Bureau
WAD	Women's Affairs Department
WAO	Women's Affairs Office
Wz	Weizero or Weirzerit, a title used by Ethiopians and equivalent to
	Mrs. or Ms.

1. INTRODUCTION

1. The report is organized in seven sections. The first is the background, which presents some background information on Ethiopia. It also describes women's situation in Ethiopia and the efforts made by the government in response to the various gender gaps in the different sectors. Finally, it describes the cases considered in this report. The second deals with the methodology, describing the various data sources and method of analysis. The third section elaborates on the activities undertaken by the MoWA and the WADs, while the fourth section discusses the process of gender mainstreaming undertaken by the MoWA and WADs. The fifth section talks about the limitations of the gender mainstreaming process, while the sixth deals with the impact of gender mainstreaming. Finally, the conclusion and recommendation section presents some concluding remarks and puts forward some measures to be considered in order to strengthen the mainstreaming process.

1.1 Background

2. As predicted in the 1994 census, Ethiopia had a total population of 79,221,000 in 2008, 49.9 per cent of whom are women. About 86.3 per cent of the population resides in the rural areas, while the remaining 13.7 per cent lives in urban areas. The young population (less than 15 years of age) makes up 45.4 per cent of the total (Central Statistical Agency (CSA), 1999:12).

3. The Ethiopian economy is based on agriculture, which accounts for 54 per cent of the Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and employs close to 82 per cent of the population. About 90 per cent of its exports are from agriculture. According to the World Development Indicators of 2006, Ethiopia is one of the least developed countries in the world, with a per capita Gross National Income (GNI) of 110.00 USD (CSA, 2005:2).

4. Ethiopia has had a succession of absolute monarchs who have ruled for a number of years in her long history. In 1974, the last Emperor was deposed by the military, which ruled the country for 17 years as a military and socialist State. In 1991, the military regime known as the "*Derg*" in Amharic was overthrown by the present Government, which started by establishing a transitional government know as the Ethiopian Peoples Revolutionary Democratic Front (EPRDF). The Constitution of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (FDRE) was ratified on 8 December 1994 and came into effect on 21 August 1995 (African Centre for Gender and Development (ACGD), 2004).

5. Currently, Ethiopia has a federal system of government, with members of parliament elected every five years. The Ethiopian parliament is made up of two houses, the House of the Council of Peoples Representatives, and the House of Federation. The country has nine regional States, and two administrative cities: Addis Ababa City Administration and Dire Dawa Administration Council. The regional States have their own constitutions, though the Federal Constitution is the supreme law of the land. A regional State is further

divided into zones, which are made up of Weredas¹. Weredas are further divided into Kebeles².

1.2 Status of women in Ethiopia

6. Compared to men, women in Ethiopia are clearly in a disadvantageous position in all respects; they benefit less from social services and hold inferior positions in all economic, political, social, and cultural affairs. For example, statistics show the existence of more illiterate women than men (51 per cent men and 66 per cent women) and women are less represented at all levels of education, especially in higher education (Ministry of Education (MOE), 2007).

7. Regarding employment, data from the Federal Civil Service Agency (FCSA) on federal government employees shows that women occupy only 18.3 per cent of all professional and scientific positions, and 25 per cent of administrative positions, indicating that the upper and middle level positions in the civil service are still overwhelmingly dominated by men. According to the same source, women hold 71 per cent of clerical and fiscal jobs and 51 per cent of the custodial and manual jobs (FCSA, 2007).

8. A similar situation is observed in terms of women's participation in politics. Currently, there are 547 seats in parliament and 15 of them are empty due to withdrawal of some members. Among the remaining 530 seats, 117 or 22.1 per cent are held by women. There are 12 standing committees, of which two, namely, the Women's Affairs Committee and the Social Affairs Committee, are headed by women. According to data from the FCSA, among the 28 Ministers currently in place, only 2 or 7.1 per cent are women and among the 42 State Ministers, only 14.3 per cent are women (NetCorps Ethiopia, 2006:19).

9. Looking at the health situation of women, it is noted that there are several poverty and cultural factors that negatively affect women's health, as reflected by various health indicators. For example, according to the Demographic Health Survey (DHS), 27 per cent of women between the ages of 15 and 49 are severely malnourished (CSA, 2005:163). The maternal mortality rate for the period 1998-2004 is one of the highest in the world (673 per 100,000) (CSA, 2005:233). The contraceptive prevalence for married women is 15 per cent (CSA, 2005: 61). The rate of attended deliveries is very low; only 28 per cent of women who gave birth in the 5 years preceding the DHS had received antenatal care (CSA, 2005:111).

1.3 Efforts made by the Ethiopian Government

10. In response to these imbalances and the many problems women encounter, the Government of Ethiopia has made a number of efforts to address gender equality issues. These include adopting or ratifying relevant international instruments pertaining to gender; designing national instruments, including the Ethiopian Constitution and various other policies; and establishing the national machinery for addressing gender issues.

¹ Wereda is an administrative unit in a zone, which has a number of Kebeles.

² The smallest administrative unit.

1.3.1 Major international commitments

11. The Convention for the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) is one of the major conventions regarding the rights of women. CEDAW defines what constitutes discrimination against women and sets up an agenda for national action to end such discrimination. CEDAW commits States to incorporate the principle of equality of men and women into their legal systems, abolish all discriminatory laws and adopt those that prohibit discrimination against women. The Convention specifically mentions actions to be undertaken so that women enjoy equal rights in the areas of education, health and employment. Ethiopia ratified CEDAW on 10 September 1981.

12. Following the requirements of the CEDAW Committee, Ethiopia has been reporting on the progress made in the implementation of CEDAW, though it has not been up to date. The Committee invited Ethiopia to submit its 6th periodic report, which was due in 2002 and its 7th periodic report due in 2006 in a combined report in 2006. Currently, attempts are being made to compile these reports.

13. The Beijing Platform for Action (PFA) that was adopted in September 1995 at the Fourth World Conference on Women is the other commitment that Ethiopia has made. The PFA deals with twelve critical areas of concern: poverty, education, health, violence, armed conflict, the economy, power and decision-making, institutional mechanisms, human rights, the media, the environment, and the girl child. The Beijing+5 review session held in June 2000 in New York reaffirmed the importance of gender mainstreaming in all areas and at all levels. Furthermore, areas that required special actions were identified: education, social service and health, including sexual and reproductive health, the HIV/AIDS pandemic, the burden of poverty on women, violence against women and girls, and the development of effective and accessible national machineries for the advancement of women.

14. Ethiopia has taken its commitment to Beijing PFA seriously. Though the Ethiopian Women's Policy precedes the PFA, the requirement for the national machinery stipulated in the Policy and implemented accordingly is in line with demands of the Beijing PFA. Furthermore, based on its economic and socio-cultural context, the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MoWA) had chosen seven priority areas among the twelve critical areas of concern and developed its National Action Plan on Gender Equality (NAP-GE) in order to ensure gender-equitable development. These were: Poverty and Economic Empowerment of Women and Girls; Education and Training of Women and Girls; Reproductive Rights, Health and HIV/AIDS; Human Rights and Violence against Women and Girls; Empowering Women in Decision Making; Women and the Environment; and Institutional Mechanisms for the Advancement of Women. No budget estimate has been given for the various activities included in the NAP-GE, but the Plan has been integrated into the current poverty reduction strategy paper known as A Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty (PASDEP), which is used as a strategic framework for action in all the development sectors (Ministry of Finance and Economic Development (MoFED), 2006). The monitoring and evaluation process is expected to be planned and undertaken by the various ministries and agencies along with their other activities. It is assumed that WADs in the ministries would play a significant role in this process.

15. Ethiopia is committed to the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). The MDGs have been commonly accepted as a framework for measuring development progress by 2015. Goal 3 focuses on gender equality with the target of eliminating gender disparity in education, employment and political participation by 2015. Many of the targets set in PASDEP for the different sectors such as education and health are aligned with the targets of the MDGs. In fact, the main objectives of this five year developmental plan are to lay the foundation for accelerated, sustained and people-centered development as well as to pave the way for attainment of the MDGs by 2015 (MoFED, 2006:44).

16. The other instrument that Ethiopia has signed is the Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa. The protocol promotes the elimination of discrimination against women $(Art.2)^3$ and stipulates the categories of rights that women are entitled to. These include the right to dignity; the right to life, integrity and security of the person; the right to education, economic and social welfare; and the right to political participation and decision-making.

17. In 1994, the International Conference on Population and Development (ICPD) was held in Cairo. All the 184 participating countries, including Ethiopia, adopted a Programme of Action (POA) in which women's rights to health were formulated. Women's empowerment, gend er equality and the elimination of all forms of violence against women were among the guiding principles. The ICPD+5 review held in New York in June 1999 noted that "reproductive health" and "reproductive rights" had become part of the international development discourse and an agreement was reached to focus on such pressing issues as abortion, HIV/AIDS, maternal mortality and contraception.

1.3.2 National instruments put in place by the Ethiopian Government

18. This part of the report presents major legal instruments, including the Constitution, established by the Government. The policies presented were formulated by the various Ministries themselves with inputs from WADs if WADs were already established at the time of the policy formulation. For example, the head of WAD in the Ministry of Culture and Tourism explained that the WAD had commented on the Ministry's draft policy and the comments were integrated, and the WAO was a member of the committee that worked on drafting the National Population Policy.

19. One of the major documents addressing women's rights is the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Ethiopia. The Constitution in its Article 35^4 states that women have equal rights to those of men in all spheres, including education, employment, and access to resources and management of the same. These include rights and protections equal to those

 $^{^3}$ The Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa was adopted by the 2nd Ordinary Session of the Assembly of the Union in Maputo, on 11 July, 2003 to supplement and elaborate the provisions of the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa.

⁴ Article 35 of the Ethiopian Constitution elaborates on the rights of women in all areas, including marriage, protection from harmful traditional practices (HTPs), reproductive health, employment and political participation.

of men; equality in marriage; affirmative action; rights to full consultation in the formulation of national development policies, designing and execution of projects, especially when these affect the interests of women; the right to acquire, administer, control, use and transfer of property; and the right of equal employment, pay and promotion (FDRE, 1995:23).

20. The National Policy on Ethiopian Women was formulated in 1993 by the then-Women's Affairs Office (WAO) with the objectives of creating and facilitating conditions for equality between men and women; creating conditions to make rural women beneficiaries of social services like education and health; and eliminating stereotypes, and discriminatory perception and practices that constrain the equality of women. The structures of the national machinery to address gender equality and equity issues were clearly laid down in the Policy (The Transitional Government of Ethiopia (TGE), 1993).

21. The National Population Policy (NPP) formulated in 1993 was an instrument aimed at harmonizing the rate of population growth with the capacity of the country. The Policy focuses on the issue of gender and describes the important roles that women play in controlling population growth. It clearly stipulates that the situation of women has a direct bearing on the fertility level of any society and explains how education, employment and legal provisions that ensure the rights of women have been found to be correlated to their fertility levels and reproductive health (TGE, 1993).

22. One of the specific objectives of the Ethiopian Education and Training Policy is to introduce a system of education that would rectify the misconceptions and misunderstandings regarding the roles and benefits of female education. The Policy indicates that the design and development of curriculums and books should give special attention to gender issues. It further states that equal attention should be given to female participants when selecting teachers; training them, and advancing their careers. A number of initiatives have been taken to implement the Policy (TGE, 1994). For example, currently female teachers are selected with a smaller grade point average (GPA) than male teachers and this has increased the number of female teachers in elementary schools.

23. The Developmental Social Welfare Policy was formulated by the Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs in November 1996. The Policy acknowledges that war, famine and the economic crises of the past decades have harmed vulnerable groups, i.e., women, the elderly, children, youth and the disabled. It also explains that women are underrepresented in every sphere, including education, employment, politics and other key decision-making positions. The Policy also highlights the significance of gender mainstreaming in all programmes, projects and services (FDRE, 1996).

24. The Cultural Policy formulated in October 1997 indicates that cultural behaviours, practices and attitudes that support and promote stereotypes and prejudices against women would be slowly eliminated, and conditions would be created to promote gender equality. The content of the Policy clearly elaborates the unfavourable situation of women, and emphasizes the need for a change that ensures women's active participation in all cultural activities and guarantees them equal rights to various benefits, such as recognition and

decision-making power in the various traditional celebrations and institutions, elimination of HTPs and promotion of cultural practices that promote women's welfare (FDRE, 1997).

1.3.3 Case study

25. The importance of national machineries to design, implement, monitor and evaluate as well as advocate and mobilize support for policies that promote the advancement of women has been highlighted in the Beijing POA (BPA, 1996). They are the central policy-coordinating units inside governments with the task of ensuring gender mainstreaming in policies. In Ethiopia, the national machineries are represented by the MoWA at federal level, Bureau of Women's Affairs at regional level, Offices of Women's Affairs at zonal or Wereda level, and the Women's Affairs Departments (WADs) opened in the various ministries, agencies and commissions.

26. The current MoWA, previously known as the WAO, was established in October 1991. The WAO was entrusted with the responsibility of coordinating and facilitating government programmes and designing strategies that would allow women to contribute to and benefit from the country's development, including the democratization, judicial reform and economic reconstruction processes (TGE, 1992). WAO was also responsible for creating a conducive atmosphere for the implementation of the National Policy on Ethiopian Women in various government ministries, and monitoring its realization.

27. Following the provisions of the National Policy on Ethiopian Women, WADs were established in ministries, commissions, agencies or authorities in order to implement the Policy and thereby incorporate gender into the formulation and implementation of development plans in their respective institutions. The general objectives of the WADs were derived from the national policy on women, and the specific objectives formulated by harmonizing the objectives of a specific institution with those of the national policy (Hareg Consult, 2005:90).

28. Though the structure of the national gender machinery was planned to reach the grassroots and implement the various provisions in the Ethiopian Women's Policy, its effectiveness has not been impressive for a variety of reasons. These include:

- Placement of the structures in a position where they cannot be part of decisionmaking.
- Limitations in financial and human resources.
- Lack of clarity in the mandates of the women's affairs structures.
- Decentralization, which has made accountability between federal WADs and regional WABs challenging.

• Absence of strong networking and collaboration with sector bureaus, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), civil society organizations (CSOs), and communities (Hareg Consult, 2005:90).

29. The WAO was upgraded to the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MoWA) in May 2005 (Proclamation No. 471/2005) as an expression of the Government's commitment to gender equality and to strengthen the efforts being made. According to the proclamation, the responsibilities of the Ministry include putting in place recommendations for the protection of the rights of women at national level and follow-up of the same; ensuring that policies, legislations, development programmes and projects designed by the Federal Government address gender issues (gender mainstreaming); and following up the implementation of international instruments and national policies that Ethiopia has adopted on women and children.

30. Prior to the upgrading of the WAO to the MoWA, the highest organ of the machinery was the WAO linked to the WADs in the different ministries, which empowered the WAO to coordinate and monitor the activities of WADs. However, since the proclamation for the establishment of MoWA does not mention anything about the nature of the working relationship between the Ministry and WADs, no formal relationship exists. The Head of the Gender Mainstreaming, Follow-Up and Evaluation Department in the MoWA explained that there is no structure that dictates a formal working relationship. However, following the previous tradition, the WADs report to the Ministry in meetings held annually with all the WADs, and the Ministry calls upon WADs for necessary activities.

31. Unlike in the past, the Ministers of Women's Affairs and heads of bureaus of women's affairs are members of cabinet at federal and regional councils, respectively, which enhances their chances of participating in and decision-making. However, no information is available as to how much this opportunity has been utilized to mainstream gender.

32. The national gender machinery was selected as a best practice in Ethiopia for this assessment because it plays a determining role in the gender mainstreaming process in various sectors, thanks to the presence of WADs in the ministries. It also enables the MoWA to follow up and coordinate the gender mainstreaming activities in the different ministries and offices at various levels. The importance of the national gender machinery was also highlighted in the Beijing POA.

33. With the above background, the general objective of this assessment was to see the efforts made in the area of gender mainstreaming, while the specific objectives were to:

- See the structure of the existing national gender machinery.
- Explore the activities of MoWA and WADs in the effort to mainstream gender.
- Identify the challenges faced in gender mainstreaming.

• Synthesize undertakings that could be considered as best practices in gender mainstreaming.

34. Addressing gender is a very challenging task requiring a multi-dimensional approach. Gender mainstreaming needs sensitization and knowledge about gender issues, all of which require the provision of training, as well as the preparation of relevant materials. Policies and laws need to be formulated and those that are discriminatory require revision. Restructuring needs to take place for a fair distribution of positions and budgets allocated based on gender analysis. Empowering women through women-focused activities also enhances the gender mainstreaming process. Above all, gender mainstreaming needs both national and organizational-level planning and coordination. However, since it is unrealistic to expect a gender mainstreaming process with all the above activities, where some of these activities take place, WADs are considered as cases illustrating best practices on gender mainstreaming.

2. METHODOLOGY

2.1 Data sources

35. Both primary and secondary data were used in the process of data collection. Since the analysis from secondary sources was utilized as the basis for developing an assessment instrument, the first step was gathering and compiling secondary data. Secondary data sources included relevant legal instruments such as conventions, laws and policies, studies undertaken on assessment of the Women's Affairs national machinery, annual reports presented at the annual meetings of Women's Affairs Departments (WADs), guidelines and other materials prepared for mainstreaming gender, and relevant studies and reports on institutional mechanisms to address gender.

36. An interview guide was the instrument utilized to gather primary data. In-depth interviews were held with the Head of the Gender Mainstreaming, Follow-up and Monitoring Department in the Ministry of Women's Affairs, and heads of the WADs selected for this assessment. The interviews looked at the efforts they have made in the attempt to mainstream gender and their major responsibilities and activities.

2.2 Sampling of ministries and interviewees

37. Major emphasis was placed on the **Ministry of Women's Affairs**. In addition, **WADs in 10 selected ministries or agencies** were chosen to be covered in this report. The selection was made using purposive sampling, the criteria being that the selected ministries are dealing with gender equality and women's empowerment issues. These 10 ministries/agencies and departments are: Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development(MoARD); Ministry of Mines and Energy; Ministry of Water Resources; MoFED; Ministry of Works and Urban Development; Ministry of Education; Federal Civil Service Agency; Ministry of Health; Ministry of Justice; and Ministry of Culture and

Tourism. In the WADs, the heads or any other individual who could provide the needed information was purposively selected.

38. Lack of documentation on the performance of the Ministry of Women's Affairs and the WADs, and the unavailability of heads of WADs due to the various workshops and meetings, especially the Business Process Reengineering (BPR) that is currently being adopted by the Ethiopian Government, were the challenges encountered during the assessment period.

2.3 Data analyses

39. Data from interviews were transcribed and analyzed using themes. Reporting followed using the identified themes and major issues discerned from the assessment.

3. CASE STUDY: THE NATIONAL GENDER MACHINERY

40. This part of the paper presents a brief description of the national gender machinery which is made up of the Ministry of Women's Affairs and the WADs in the different ministries, and its major activities.

3.1 The Ministry of Women's Affairs

41. As explained in the background section, the MoWA has four departments: Gender Mainstreaming, Follow-up and Evaluation Department; Women's Policy and Strategies Implementation Department; Children's and Mothers' Affairs Department; and Capacity-Building and Participation Department.

42. The Gender Mainstreaming, Follow-up and Evaluation Department in the MoWA is entrusted with the responsibilities of:

- Ensuring that government policies, strategies, plans and programmes including government proclamations, address gender issues and follow up their implementation;
- Providing research-based data and information in order to enhance gender mainstreaming in government policies, programmes and projects;
- Assessing the impact of projects undertaken by the various governmental and non-governmental organizations, and providing appropriate guidance to ensure their benefits to women;
- Gathering, analyzing and compiling data on issues related to the economic, social and political activities of women; and
- Building the capacity of WADs in æctor ministries and WABs in the regions and other stakeholders by providing appropriate and relevant training.

3.2 WADs

43. The MoRAD previously known as the Ministry of Agriculture had the Rural Women's Affairs Team under its extension department. The team worked on different projects such as training of rural women, distribution of extension packages, and introduction of labour-saving technologies such as improved stoves. After the launching of the Ethiopian Women's Policy, the team in the Ministry was upgraded to WAD.

44. The WAD at the Ministry of Mines and Energy was opened in November 2005. The Rural Energy Development and Promotion Centre, one of the Centres reporting to the Ministry of Mines and Energy, has a gender focal person and, in collaboration with GTZ, works on the production and distribution of fuel-saving stoves. The Centre strongly believes that it is women and children who are the primary victims of low productivity caused by land degradation, draught and desertification. In addition to helping women save time spent on collecting firewood, it creates an opportunity for generating income (Tesfayenesh, 2008).

45. The WAD in the Ministry of Water Resources has a vision that women play significant roles in the administration of water and development of water resources. It aims to ensure that gender issues are addressed in all water development plans, programmes and projects, and that women participate in sustainable development just like men. It encourages and pushes all departments to address gender issues as part of their activities, and formulates projects that reduce the time women spend on fetching water.

46. The WAD in the Ministry of Works and Urban Development became operational in January 2000. As a result of its effort, the Ministry's annual plan contains a number of items that address gender. Some of these are the special consideration women receive from the Integrated Housing Development Programme (MoWUD, 2008:14); Micro and Small Enterprises (MSEs) (MoWUD, 2008:27); and Capacity-building and Human Resources Development Programme (MoWUD, 2008:73).

47. The WAD in the MOE, currently known as the Gender and Equity Department, was opened in 1994. It aims to mainstream gender in all the activities of the Ministry, and to undertake girls/women-focused activities to increase the enrolment of girls and their success. It also targets emerging regions such as Gambella and Benshangul to work on girls' education. In collaboration with other partners, a number of programmes have been under way, such as the school feeding programme, bursary schemes, and leadership and assertiveness training for girls, and awareness creation for community leaders and other stakeholders.

48. The WAD in the MOH was established in October 1994. Over the years, the Department has undertaken a number of activities. Some of these are the compilation of sex- disaggregated data in the document "Health and Health Indicator", including the identification of top ten diseases by sex and the accessibility of antiretroviral drugs by sex; the training and employment of female health extension workers; the priority accorded to

pregnant women and children in the provision of mosquito nets; addressing of gender and malaria issues; and the consideration of gender issues as one of the components of the yearly and mid-term reviews of the Health Sector Development Programme.

49. The WAD in the Ministry of Justice (MoJ) was opened in 1995 with the objective of protecting the human rights of women and children and preventing violence and other crimes committed against children (MoJ, WAD, 2008:1).

50. The WAD in the Ministry of Culture and Tourism was established in 1995 to enhance the participation of women in the areas of sports and culture; enable women to take up decision-making positions; and promote the equality of women in the sector. In the attempt to achieve these objectives, the WAD utilizes a number of strategies, including undertaking research; providing of education and training on gender; building the capacity of employees engaged in the sector, mainstreaming gender; encouraging women in the sector to build their capacity; and networking with other organizations working in the area of gender.

51. The WAD that is currently in the MoFED was established in 1992 in the then – Ministry of Finance. When the Ministry of Finance and the Ministry of Economic Development and Cooperation (MEDAC) were merged, the WAD was moved to the current office of MoFED. In order to implement the Women's Policy, the WAD uses various strategies, including offering training; mainstreaming gender in plans, programmes and guidelines; and participating in committees that prepare proposals and projects for the Ministry.

52. Following the stipulations in the Ethiopian Women's Policy, most WADs are staffed with a head, two experts and a secretary. The exceptions are the MOWA, MoARD and the MoFED. The MoWA has four departments, each staffed with one head and at least one expert and a secretary. Unlike the other WADS, the WAD in MORAD is staffed with a head, seven experts and a secretary. The relatively large size of the staff is the result of the recent merging of the MoRAD and the Disaster Prevention and Preparedness Agency (DPPA). Similarly, the MoFED has a head, five experts and a secretary. Within their ministries, all WADs report to their respective ministers and the FCSA reports to the commissioner. The other bodies to which the WADs report are the MoWA and the Women's Standing Committee in Parliament.

53. As indicated earlier, WADs are responsible for achieving gender mainstreaming, and they undertake a number of activities to that end, including training offered to employees of their Ministries and other relevant individuals. The issues covered in the training include gender sensitization; gender mainstreaming; gender budgeting; monitoring evaluations; leadership; assertiveness, especially to females; and orientation on relevant documents such as the Development and Change Package, revised and newly written policies and promulgated laws. Depending on the Ministry, a wide variety of participants attend these trainings. For example, the MoJ targets individuals working in the justice system, while MoFED offers training to staff of MoFED and finance and economic development bureaus in the regions.

54. The other activity carried out by most WADs is the preparation of gender mainstreaming and gender budgeting guidelines and checklists and relevant training modules and manuals, and compilation of sex-disaggregated data. Research is undertaken, for example, by MoWA, MoARD, Ministry of Water Resources, FCSA, and Ministry of Culture and Tourism.

55. Securing educational opportunities for female staff participating in committees which formulate projects for gender mainstreaming; assessing project proposals from a gender perspective; disseminating information and networking with relevant organizations are the other activities undertaken by WADs.

56. In addition, there are Ministry-specific activities that are undertaken by some WADs. For example, the WAD in the MOJ provides legal counseling to women who seek help and plans to run a centre for investigation and prosecution of violence against women. The MOE runs school-feeding programmes and provides bursaries to needy female students.

4. PROCESS OF GENDER MAINSTREAMING – BEST PRACTICES

57. The WADs attempt to address gender in two different but interrelated ways: addressing gender in the plans and programmes of their respective ministries, which is *gender mainstreaming*, and formulating projects that focus on women in order to narrow the existing gender gap. Both of these approaches are encouraged in the Beijing Platform of Action (United Nations, 1996).

4.1 Gender mainstreaming

58. Gender mainstreaming is a commitment that countries made at the Fourth World Conference on Women held in Beijing, China in 1995. It is a process that requires awareness and commitment. One of the ways in which the Ethiopian Government has shown its commitment is through the establishment of the national machinery, which includes the MoWA and the WADs.

59. In this report, the efforts classified as gender mainstreaming or a component of gender mainstreaming include activities undertaken to address gender in different policies, plans, and programmes, as well as any effort that facilitates the gender mainstreaming process. In the context where many challenges exist in addressing gender issues in general and gender mainstreaming in particular, these efforts are considered as best practices that could be shared.

60. Addressing gender issues in various initiatives is part of the gender mainstreaming process. The WADs make efforts in this direction, as exemplified by the following projects undertaken by the WAD in MoARD: food security, the agricultural sector support Programme, Livestock and Rural Capacity-Building (RCB). The WAD in the MoFED

mainstreams gender in the projects funded by bilateral and multilateral organizations, and it assesses project proposals submitted by different departments from a gender perspective using the assessment guideline prepared by the Ministry for their approval.

61. Integrating gender into documents, plans and strategies is the other component of gender mainstreaming. In this regard, the efforts made by the WAD in MoFED to include gender issues in the PASDEP, the attempts of the WAD in the Ministry of Water Resources to integrate gender into the curriculum of TVET focusing on water; the attempt made by the WAD in MoARD to include gender issues in the extension strategic plan; the integration of gender into the annual plan of the MoWD; and the inclusion of the issue of violence in the workplace and maternity leave in the Revised Civil Servant Proclamation by FCSA are some of the gender mainstreaming activities. The plan by the WAD in the Ministry of Culture and Tourism to include gender issues in the draft tourism policy is yet another example.

62. In addition, there are other activities that will enhance gender mainstreaming, including the training of staff on gender sensitization, gender mainstreaming, assertiveness, empowerment, and leadership (FCSA), gender budgeting, gender auditing and community mobilization (MoWA); preparation of gender mainstreaming guidelines, for example, by the Ministry of Water Resources, MoWA, Ministry of Works and Urban Development, MOE, MoFED, MoWUD, MoARD, MOH; and the preparation of other guidelines, strategies and manuals such as Strategies for Promoting Girls' Education and A Guideline for Integrating Gender Issues in the Preparation of Teaching Learning Materials by the WAD in the MOE.

63. Research and documentation facilitate the gender mainstreaming process by providing information on the situation of women and suggesting options on the best forward. In this regard, the efforts being made by MoH, MoE and FCSA need to be noted. The compilation of sex-disaggregated data is another important activity which lays the foundation for action addressing gender gaps. Many of the WADs undertaken this activity; including MoWUD, MoH and Ministry of Culture and Tourism.

64. The availability of aware and committed women in top positions could be one of the conditions for promoting gender mainstreaming. This presupposes the employment and promotion of women. In this regard, the efforts made by all WADs to ensure that during recruitment, training and promotion, the affirmative action provisions stipulated for women are implemented could be considered as part of mainstreaming. Another similar endeavour is the encouragement given to women during training by providing information and support for them to participate in various committees (Ministry of Mines and Energy, MoARD and Ministry of Works and Urban Development).

65. The working relationship between the WADs and other parallel departments and the lack of similar structures in the regions were two of the challenges mentioned by the WADs. In an effort to bridge the gap between the WADs and other departments, the WAD in the Ministry of Water Resources works closely with relevant departments such as the Planning and Projects Department, the Irrigation and Drainage Department, and the Rural

Water Supply and Sanitation Department, to ensure that gender issues are addressed by providing comments and participating in various workshops. The WADs in the MoWUD and the Ministry of Mines and Energy, on the other hand, make efforts to ensure that WADs are opened in the organizations operating under the Ministry and that gender focal persons are assigned in all regional bureaus and other smaller organizations reporting to the Ministries.

66. Monitoring and follow-up is an important component of gender mainstreaming. The WAD in the MoWUD follows up with the different departments in the ministries to make sure that they address gender issues in their annual plans and reports; prepares assessment reports to document the integration of gender issues in the various activities of the Ministries; and follows up and ensures that women are benefiting from the various provisions made available by the Ministry during the quarterly meetings held with regional bureaus and by investigating performance reports submitted by the bureaus. Similarly, the WAD in the Ministry of Water Resources monitors the implementation of manuals and guidelines prepared for addressing gender issues (field manuals and the gender mainstreaming guideline) and other programmes.

4.2 Women-focused projects

67. As indicated earlier, another approach to addressing gender issues is working on women-specific projects. In this regard, a number of activities have been highlighted by the WADs. For example, in the Ministry of Works and Urban Development's WAD, there are a number of women-specific projects, including short-term training programmes in the area of construction to reduce the number of unemployed women as well as to encourage women to participate in construction work, where their number is significantly low compared to their male counterparts.

68. The WADs in the MoWUD, FCSA, and MoARD and the Ministry of Mines and Energy have training for women employees on gender sensitization, affirmative action, the Rural Women's Development Package, and other policies and revised laws related to women's rights to enable them to become aware of and exercise their rights.

69. Another women-specific activity which is closely linked to gender mainstreaming is the creation of opportunities for female employees to upgrade themselves and take up decision- making positions by enroling in formal education programmes using funds from the Ministries as well as other donors. The MoWUD and the Ministry of Mines and Energy are two ministries working in this direction. Training is offered by the Ministry of Mines and Energy and FCSA on issues related to HIV/AIDS to enable female employees to protect themselves and their families against the HIV pandemic.

70. Advocacy is another women-focused activity undertaken by the WADs. Advocacy on women's rights using different media such as newsletters, websites, forums to celebrate March 8, International Women's Day, and radio and newspapers is carried out by the WADs in the MoWUD, FCSA, Ministry of Justice and the Ministry of Mines and Energy.

71. Forming associations or forums for the purpose of discussing issues such as HIV/AIDS and experience sharing in solving the challenges women face is another activity some of the WADs carry out. In this regard, the WAD in the Ministry of Mines and Energy sensitizes and motivates female artisanal miners to establish cooperatives with male partners in order to maximize their opportunities of obtaining technical and material support from the Ministry, as well as to identify potential areas and marketing opportunities that would give them good return for their work. Similarly, the WAD in MoWUD urges female employees to create a support group and a discussion forum where women come together to discuss issues of common interest and share experiences. An example is the Girls' Education Forum, group organized by the WAD in the MOE bringing together stakeholders of girls education to help raise enrolment and reduce the dropout rate among girls.

72. The economic empowerment of women and meeting their practical gender needs is another focus of some of the women-specific projects undertaken by WADs. The production of fuel-saving stoves is one such example. The WAD in the Ministry of Mines and Energy works with GTZ to produce fuel-saving stoves that save time spent on collecting fuelwood and trains women to produce the stoves for marketing purposes in order to empower them economically.

73. In this process of gender mainstreaming, WADs encounter several challenges. These include:

- lack of capacity of WADs in terms of educated and skilled personnel to follow up, monitor and evaluate the activities of the different divisions and departments from the perspective of gender
- inadequate of financial resources
- high turnover of experts
- lack of support from relevant bodies
- lack of space
- loose connection of the Bureau of Women's Affairs with Wereda Offices, and the consequent unavailability of sex-disaggregated data
- lack of horizontal linkages with parallel departments during planning and reporting
- the unavailability of similar structures or gender focal persons at regional level and below
- lack of accountability
- non-involvement of the WADs in projects right from the outset.

5. SOME LESSONS LEARNED

74. The structure of the national gender machinery in Ethiopia is very impressive. WADs exist in ministries, commissions and agencies, to be coordinated by the MoWA. In addition, the structure is meant to reach the grassroots, since there are Offices of Women's Affairs at zonal level reporting to the Bureau of Women's Affairs in the regions. The kebele-level Women's Affairs offices report to the zonal offices. Gender mainstreaming would be enhanced and effective if this machinery is well used. However, the mere existence of this machinery will not be sufficient. Adequate human resources and other resources will contribute to the gender mainstreaming process tremendously.

75. Addressing gender is a very challenging task that requires support from all directions at all levels. As we have seen in the report, the WADs in various ministries encounter several problems. However, all the WAD heads pointed out that the ministers in their respective ministries have been very supportive of gender mainstreaming. Securing the support of ministers was possible because all WADs report to their respective ministers. This high-level support buffers the resistance the WADs encounter from different directions, thereby enhancing gender mainstreaming. Therefore, establishing the gender machinery at key and important positions is a very decisive factor.

76. The process of gender mainstreaming cannot be undertaken by WADs alone; all departments or divisions need to have the knowledge, skills and commitment to mainstream gender. Accordingly, WADs need to play the role of catalyst and coordinator. The attempts that WADs make to provide training on gender sensitization and gender mainstreaming to staff of the ministry and to prepare gender mainstreaming guidelines and checklists is a good initiative which, with appropriate coordination, follow up and resources, will take the gender mainstreaming process one step further.

6. LIMITATIONS OF GENDER MAINSTREAMING PRACTICES

77. Though encouraging efforts are being made in Ethiopia in the sphere of gender mainstreaming, there are also a number of limitations that need to be addressed, such as the lack of an all-embracing and coherent process of gender mainstreaming. For gender mainstreaming to be effective, it has to address all issues in the organizations, including structural issues, policy issues, plans and programmes, budgeting and monitoring and evaluation. However, what we observe in this assessment is a fragmented gender mainstreaming process. For example, there is no time when the WADs deal with structural issues to ensure that both men and women occupy decision-making positions, except encouraging them to participate in committees, as witnessed in the Ministry of Mines and Energy and MoWUD. Many of the WADs are also not involved in the process of gender budgeting. The only effort seen in this direction is the gender budgeting guideline prepared by the MoFED, but it includes mention of monitoring and evaluation that would help with programme evaluation from a gender perspective.

78. The experiences further show that gender mainstreaming is not institutionalized – it is mostly undertaken by WADs. Other departments carrying out various programmes do not do gender mainstreaming due to lack of awareness and lack of capacity. This problem is compounded by the lack of capacity on the part of WADs, which constrains them from monitoring the gender mainstreaming activities of other departments, and the unavailability of a formal parallel relationship that would help WADs enforce the mainstreaming process. Furthermore, despite the training on gender and gender mainstreaming offered by almost all WADs, no follow-up is done to see whether the knowledge and skills acquired from the training are adequately implemented.

79. Another limitation observed is that the practice of gender mainstreaming in policies and other documents prepared by the ministries is usually in revising draft documents and providing comments instead of involving WADs from the outset in the identification of problems and formulation of objectives all the way to monitoring and evaluation.

7. IMPACT OF GENDER MAINSTREAMING

80. Much time is needed to asses the impact of gender work in general and gender mainstreaming in particular, because it requires awareness and attitude change. This is especially true when the process of gender mainstreaming is not very coordinated. However, the report attempts to describe some achievements registered in this area. It should be noted that the achievements listed below are the outcomes of the collaborative efforts of different parties, though WoWA and the WADs have played significant roles.

81. Gender mainstreaming requires political support at high levels. In this regard, one of the achievements is the inclusion of the ministers of MoWA in the cabinet. This is unlike in the past when the head of the WAO was not a participant in this important decision-making body. Similarly, the heads of WABs are members of the regional cabinet.

82. Laws that were discriminatory have been reviewed with the collaborative efforts of the MoWA, WAD in the MOJ and the ministry in general, and NGOs such as the Ethiopian Women Lawyers Association. For example, the revised federal family law has addressed issues that were harmful to women. These include raising the marriage age for girls from 15 to 18, to deal with the problems of early marriage, the right of women to administer family properties and share the family wealth upon divorce. The revised criminal code also protects pregnant women by prohibiting harmful traditional practices that cause bodily injury and endanger the lives of pregnant women (Art. 561 & 562), domestic violence by criminalizing violence to marriage partner or a person living in an irregular union (Art. 564) and female circumcision and infibulations (566, 567 & 567)⁵.

83. In addition, women's property rights have been reformed in the Rural Land Administration and Land Use Proclamation (No. 456/2005). The Proclamation clearly indicates that women who want to engage in agriculture shall have the right to get and use

⁵ Taking into consideration the economic, political and social changes that had occurred since 1957 when the previous penal code entered into operation, the criminal law was revised and officially came into effect in May 2005. Unlike the previous penal code, the current one addresses several gender issues in its chapter III.

rural land, and that where land is jointly held by husband and wife or by other persons, the holding certificate shall be prepared in the name of all joint holders. Similar provisions have been given by regional land proclamations.

84. In relation to the economic situation of vulnerable men and women, some initiatives have been made, especially in encouraging small and medium enterprises (SMEs). These include the preparation of Micro and Small Enterprises Development Strategy and the establishment of the Micro and Small Enterprise Development Agency. One of the fundamental principles of the Strategy is placing emphasis on the advancement of women (FDRE, 1997).

85. Another initiative in relation to the economic empowerment of women is the Women's Development Initiative Project (WDIP), which was established by WAO in April 2001 with the objective of empowering women economically and socially, thereby enabling them to play a significant role in the development of the country (WDIP 2006). The project targets poor women who have business potential but lack the resources. The project operates in Addis Ababa and Dire Dawa and the other nine regions of the country. So far the project has organized 623 working groups with 11,295 members of these women's groups, 621 have started different businesses such as animal fattening, grain trade, small restaurants. The major achievements of the project include acquisition of funds by all the beneficiaries; participation of beneficiaries in IEC trainings, with the majority acquiring the capacity to earn profits; creation of cooperatives by a large majority of the women's group; improvement in the lives of beneficiaries which has enabled them to send their children to school; construction of houses and toilets; and purchase of oxen, cows and goats.

86. In relation to the future of gender work in general and gender mainstreaming in particular, clear directions have been set. As explained earlier, the Ministry of Women's Affairs has prepared the NAP – GE and the content of the NAP has been integrated into the PASDEP, the strategic framework of plans and actions in all sectors that has formed the basis for the preparation of the Development and Change Package for Ethiopian Women, and that has been distributed widely and is expected to guide the activities of WADs. Therefore, with the implementation of PASDEP and the Package, the gender mainstreaming process could be pushed one step further.

8. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

87. The Ethiopian Government has committed itself to promote gender equality. This commitment is expressed through the ratification of various international instruments as well as the introduction of supportive national legal instruments. Along with these, the national gender machinery has been put in place, starting from the federal ministry and down to kebele level, which is the smallest administration unit in the country. However, there is strong evidence that the structure does not reach the grassroots.

88. Gender mainstreaming has been accepted as a strategy for achieving gender equality. Accordingly, efforts have been made by the MoWA as well as the WADs in different ministries, commissions and agencies. However, the data in this report reveal that

gender mainstreaming is not an all-embracing process touching upon structures, policies, strategies, programmes, budgets and monitoring and evaluation. It is not also carried out in a coordinated manner rather, because of the many challenges that the MoWA and the WADs encounter.

89. In order to facilitate the gender mainstreaming process, the following measures might be considered:

- Currently, whatever gender mainstreaming is done at the MoWA and WADs level is not reflected and coordinated in WABs at the regional level and the zonal level and below. Similarly, there is no formal working relationship between the WADs and other parallel departments. As a result, the gender mainstreaming process remains weak and fragmented. In order to address this problem, the vertical and horizontal working relationships that the MoWA and WADs have with other bureaus, offices and departments have to be clearly defined and strengthened.
- In relation to the structure of the national machinery, one of the problems reiterated was the unavailability of an office in the regional bureaus to coordinate the gender mainstreaming process. It was explained that even when there are gender focal persons, the gender work still suffers, since these individuals undertake the gender work in addition to their regular responsibilities, and usually they lack the necessary qualification and experience. Therefore, in order to address this problem, attention should be given to creating the structure and assigning the necessary resources for gender/women's activities at regional levels and below.
- The MoWA and the WADs suffer from lack of capacity, manifested in the shortage of qualified and experienced staff. As a result, they have a limited capacity to ensure that gender is mainstreamed in organizational policies, strategies, programmes and plans, and that progress is monitored. Hence, capacity-building is an issue that deserves serious attention. The current structure that allows WADs to have only one head, two experts and a secretary needs to be revised to increase the number of staff. In order to curb the high staff turnover, ministries need to put in place a reinforcement system based on training, study tours and other schemes that would help retain experienced staff. The capacity-building efforts should also consider the issue of office space, equipment and the ability of other relevant staff to mainstream gender.
- Lack of accountability is also mentioned by interviewees as one of the problems they face, since WADs are not in a position to monitor the activities of other departments to see whether they have mainstreamed gender. Departments are not required to report about the status of gender mainstreaming either. Even when employees know they are supposed to address gender, they do not take up the issue because of this lack of accountability. Therefore, a system needs to be

put in place that will force all employees to report about the work of gender mainstreaming.

- The interviewees noted that the WADs are usually requested to comment on draft proposals or other documents after they have been prepared by departments, instead of being involved from the very beginning. WADs need to be involved at the initial stage of project design in order to ensure that the identified problems, objectives, strategies, plans and indicators used for monitoring and evaluation address gender.
- The availability of sex-disaggregated data is necessary in order to address gender gaps and put in place appropriate measures. Therefore, organizations need to be encouraged and even forced to collect and compile sex-disaggregated data.
- A number of initiatives have been taken by the MoWA as well as the WADs to facilitate the gender mainstreaming process. These include the provision of training and the preparation of guidelines. However, no follow-up is done to see whether these efforts have been fruitful and also to revise the activities based on the information gathered during monitoring. Hence, the need to monitor and evaluate the gender mainstreaming process has to be underlined.

REFERENCES

African Center for Gender and Development (2004) The African Gender and Development Index (AGDI)-The Ethiopian Trial, ACGD, ECA, Addis Ababa.

Central Statistical Authority (2000) Statistical Abstracts of Ethiopia. CSA, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

Central Statistical Authority (2005) Demographic Health Survey, CSA, Addis Ababa. Federal Civil Service Agency (August, 2007) Personnel Statistics: 1998 Ethiopian Fiscal Year, Addis Ababa.

Hareg Consult (May 2005) Gender Situation Analysis, Women's Affairs Office/Office of the Prime Minister, Addis Ababa.

Ministry of Finance and Economic Development (September 2006) A Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty (PASDEP) – 2005/06-2009/10, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

Ministry of Education (March 2000) A Guideline for Integrating Gender Issues in the Preparation of Teaching Learning Materials, Women's Affairs Department and Institute of Curriculum Development and Research, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia (Amharic Publication).

Ministry of Education (September, 2004) Gender Mainstreaming Guideline and Checklists for Education Bureaus, Teacher Training Institutions and Schools, Federal WAD, Addis Ababa.

Ministry of Work and Urban Development (2008) The 2008 Urban Development Master Plan, Ministry of Works and Urban Development, Addis Ababa.

Ministry of Women's Affairs (2006) Development and Change Package of Ethiopian Women, Ministry of Women's Affairs, Addis Ababa.

NetCorps Ethiopia (August, 2006) Gender Analysis, Unpublished Report, NetCorps Ethiopia, Addis Ababa.

Tesfayenesh, L (2008) "Gender Mainstreaming in Minerals and Energy Sector", A paper presented at the workshop organized by ENDA- Ethiopia, Addis Ababa.

The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (1995) The Constitution of the Federal Republic of Ethiopia, Addis Ababa.

The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (November, 1996) Developmental Social Welfare Policy, Addis Ababa.

The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (November 1997) Micro and Small Enterprises Development Strategy, Ministry of Trade and Industry, Addis Ababa.

The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (1997) Cultural Policy of Ethiopia, Addis Ababa.

The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (May 2005) Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Establishment of the Ministry of Women's Affairs Proclamation. Federal Negaritgazeta, Addis Ababa.

The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (July 2005) Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia Rural Land Administration and Land Use Proclamation, Federal Negaritgazeta, Addis Ababa.

The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (February 2007) Federal Civil Servants Proclamation, Federal Negaritgazeta, Addis Ababa.

The Transitional Government of Ethiopia, Office of the Prime Minister (April, 1993) National Population Policy of Ethiopia, Addis Ababa.

The Transitional Government of Ethiopia, Office of the Prime Minister (September 1993) National Policy on Ethiopian Women, Addis Ababa.

The Transitional Government of Ethiopia (1994) Ethiopian Educational and Training Policy, Addis Ababa.

United Nations (1996) The Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, Department of Public Information, New York.

World Bank (2006) World Development Indicators 2006, Washington DC: World Bank.

Women's Development Initiative Project (2006) Success Story Women's Development Initiative Project, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.

APPENDICES

Appendix I – List of Interviewees

1. Wz. Atsede Guta	Head, Gender Mainstreaming, Follow-Up and Monitoring Department, Ministry of Women's Affairs
2. Wz. Tsehai Assefa	Head, Women's Affairs Department Federal Civil Service Agency
3. Sr. Tsigeroman Aberra	Head, Women's Affairs Department Ministry of Health
4. Ato Mohammed Abubeker	A/Head, Gender and Equity Department Ministry of Education
5. Wz. Manyahilishal	Head, Women's Affairs Department Ministry of Justice
6. Wz. Yayesh Tesfahuney	Head, Women's Affairs Department Ministry of Works and Urban Development
7. Wz. Laketch H/Mariam	Head, Women's Affairs Department Ministry of Water Resources
8. Wz. Tiruwork Tizazu	Head, Women's Affairs Department Ministry of Finance and Economic Development
9. Wz. Aster Zewdie	Head, Women's Affairs Department Ministry of Culture and Tourism
10. Wz. Mulumebet Melaku	Head, Women's Affairs Department Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
11. Wz. Tesfayenesh Aregaw	Head, Women's Affairs Department, Ministry of Mines and Energy