**Ad-Hoc Expert Group Meeting (AEGM) on
"Reforms of Public Sector Management: Lessons Learned"**

**Workshop Report**

**28-29 May 2003
Addis Ababa, Ethiopia**

# ABBREVIATIONS

| | |
|---|---|
| AEGM | Ad-Hoc Expert Group Meeting |
| CBOs | Community Based Organizations |
| CSPR | Ethiopia's civil service reform program |
| DPMD | Development Policy and Management Division |
| DPSM | Directorate of Public Service Management |
| ECC | Economic Committee of Cabinet |
| ICTs | Information and Communication Technologies |
| IFI | International Financial Institutions |
| MCB | Ministry of Capacity Building |
| MPIC | Ministerial Performance Improvement Committees |
| NGOs | Non-governmental organization |
| NEPAD | New Partnership for Africa's Development |
| NPM | New Public Management |
| PIC FORCE | Committee of Permanent Secretaries |
| PMO | Prime Minister's Office |
| ROM | Performance Management Systems and Results-Oriented Management |
| TQM | Total Quality Management |
| UNCC | United Nations Conference Centre |
| WITS | Work Improvement Teams |

## INTRODUCTION

1. The Ad-Hoc Expert Group Meeting (AEGM) on **Reforms of Public Sector Management: Lessons Learned,** was held at the United Nations Conference Centre (UNCC) in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia from 28-29 May 2003. The meeting was organized by the Development Policy and Management Division (DPMD) of the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa (ECA). The overall purpose of the meeting was to bring together officials and experts from public service institutions, as well from academic institutions, to exchange views on various aspects of public sector reform in Africa. The meeting also reviewed specific country presentations.

2. The specific objectives of the meeting were the following:

   - To review the status of public service policy reforms undertaken in Africa and identify successful experiences, especially towards the promotion of better public service delivery.

   - To provide an opportunity to discuss issues related to public sector reforms in general and also public service delivery in particular.

   - To provide an opportunity for participants to review the document on "Reforms of Public Sector Management: Lessons Learned" and to make contributions and recommendations to improve the quality of the document.

## PARTICIPATION

3. The meeting was attended by 21 participants representing various national, regional and international organizations. The list of participants included officials from public service reform institutions, senior experts from public service and academic institutions, with extensive background and expertise in the areas of public service delivery and public sector reform programmes. The list of participants is attached *(See Annex I).*

## ACCOUNT OF PROCEEDINGS
## Opening of the Meeting

4. The meeting was officially opened by Mr Abdalla Hamdok, Officer-in-Charge (OIC) of the Development Policy and Management Division (DPMD) of the Economic Commission for Africa. In his opening statement, Mr. Hamdok, on behalf of ECA and the Director of DPMD, Mr. Kempe Ronald Hope, who was not able to attend the meeting due to prior commitments, welcomed the participants to the AEGM. He emphasized the importance and the timeliness of the meeting as the public sector in Africa is taking the center stage in the development process.

5. Mr. Hamdok further noted the fact that during the past two decades, with the assistance of international development partners, a number of African countries have embarked on comprehensive civil service reform programs. However, despite these efforts, with the exception of a few success stories, progress in the area of public services reform in Africa remains, by and large, elusive.

6. He then continued to explain some of the reasons behind the lack of progress. He identified factors such as lack of efficiency, ineffective management practices, wastage of scarce resources, and corruption as the major sources hindering development in the sector. This fact, along with the importance NEPAD has placed on civil service reform in Africa, has convinced ECA to include in its programme of work for 2003-2004 the convening of this important meeting.

7. Finally, Mr Hamdok informed the participants that although DPMD/ECA has an elaborate internal review mechanism, through which staff make comments on documents and reports, due to time constraints the Division was unable to incorporate the comments into this working document. As such, comments will be shared with the experts after the presentation of the paper.

## Election of the Secretariat

8. Mr. Maurice Nyamunga (Public Service Reform Programme, Botswana) was elected as Chairperson and Mrs. Ayodele Fagbemi (Ethiopian Civil Service College, Ethiopia) was elected as Rapporteur of the AEGM.

## Adoption of the Agenda

9. The participants adopted the proposed agenda and programme of work without any amendments *(see Annex II)*.

## PRESENTATION AND DISCUSSIONS ON THE WORKING DOCUMENT ON "REFORMS OF PUBLIC SECTOR MANAGEMENT: LESSONS LEARNED"

### Presentation

10. The paper reviewed the experiences and practices of African countries in civil service reforms. Case studies were presented highlighting experiences of countries that have improved their civil service policies and public service delivery strategies, as well as enhanced effectiveness.

11. The paper also examined various issues related to the characteristics, values and priorities that are essential to a sound system of public service delivery. These included factors such as ethical values and public accountability, community responsiveness and partnerships, cross-community concerns, equality and human rights, subsidiarity, quality of services, co-ordination and integration of services, scope of the public sector services delivery, efficiency and effectiveness, and innovation and strategic management in the public service.

12. The paper stated that many recent reform programmes in public sector management that have been undertaken in Africa aim at ensuring not only adequate management of the machineries of government but also effective public service delivery. These reforms include strategies to strengthen and develop partnerships with the private sector, community based organizations (CBOs), and non-governmental organizations (NGOs).

13. Cases of successful implementation and failures of public sector management reforms were reported, and reference was made to their strategic vision, conceptual framework and approach. It was emphasized that given the contextual character of reforms, the adoption of strategies from other countries must take into account the cultural differences and the potential impact on the citizens of the countries where reforms are being implemented.

14. Public service delivery in most African countries face a number of challenges that have seriously limited the scope, speed and quality of services rendered. These challenges include issues of multiple accountability; corruption; inadequate resource utilization; declining social values; declining civil service morale; pressures from globalization and conditionalities. Corruption and inadequate resource utilization constitute the two most critical challenges currently facing public service delivery systems in Africa.

15. The main recommendations made to ensure efficiency in the management of public service reforms in Africa were as follows:

- African governments need to be aware of the assumptions that underlie public sector management, such as the rights of citizens as owners and customers, the setting of priorities, campaign points of politicians, and an accountable government.

- The need to involve CBOs and NGOs in public sector management, and also the need to improve their relationship with governments.

- Implementation of adequate decentralization policies as a means of achieving public service effectiveness, and ensuring public administration is more accountable and responsive to citizens it serves.

- Performance contract systems are recommended for the management of public enterprises. This approach has been advocated by the World Bank as one of the principal measures of public enterprise reforms.

- To institutionalize dialogue between governments and NGOs to reduce mutual suspicion, and to enhance partnerships in public service delivery with the aim of promoting equity and effectiveness at the community level.

- To promote the wide use of information and communication technologies (ICTs) in Africa including the Internet in government (e-government) and public service institutions.

- To encourage the establishment of the Citizen's Charter by African governments—specifying what government promises to deliver to its citizens.

- To establish adequate public reporting systems.

- African public services should adapt New Public Management (NPM) techniques which incorporate a performance-oriented civil service, total quality management, benchmarking, decentralization and customer-driven government.

- To enforce leadership commitment to quality management whilst reinforcing laws against corruption and unethical practices.

- Capacity building should be considered as a basic requirement for sustainable public service reforms and effective public service delivery.

16. The above strategies should be based on the concept of a 'lean' and effective government that functions in partnership with all stakeholders. Such government will also promote proper policies and well-managed regulatory bodies, which will also ensure the creation of an enabling environment for the growth and development of the private sector. Where government provides services directly, a performance-oriented civil service should deliver timely, efficient and high quality services.

**Discussions**

**General Comments**

17. The Experts judged the paper to be comprehensive and to form a good basis for the way forward; however a number of suggestions were made to improve its quality. These were as follows:

- The title of the paper should adequately reflect its content in terms of emphasis on public service delivery. Appropriately, it should read: "Reforms of Public Sector Management: Lessons Learned in Public Sector Delivery"

- It was observed that public sector management and delivery should fit within a wider conceptual framework of good governance, accountability and transparency.

- The paper should include an historical background to some of the concepts of New Public Management (NPM), Public Sector Management and Delivery. These should include an enumeration of factors contributing to the reforms; the phases of the reforms; current trends; coping with globalization requirements; lean government; private sector as an engine of growth; and adaptation of NPM techniques.

- The influence of the ideological orientations of the state should be mentioned explicitly in the paper because they affect what the state feels it is obliged to deliver. For example, there are different ideological orientations between the welfare-oriented state (e.g., France) and the market-orientated state (e.g., USA).

- In addition to the examples and case studies from Anglophone countries, the paper should be as inclusive and representative as possible, and include Lusophone and Francophone countries. Further explanations should be provided

on the different applications of the term "local government" as this may differ in Anglophone and Francophone countries.

- Although the paper includes some useful examples of public sector policy reforms, it should also incorporate modalities for implementing these reforms.

- The paper should also include examples of failures of public sector reforms as examples, not only success stories.

- The legal aspects of reforms should be incorporated to balance the emphasis on management reforms.

- It should be stated that a government should be evaluated both in terms of the quality of services and its internal efficiency.

## Specific/Chapter-related Comments

- **Issues in Public Service Delivery**

18. Regarding the changing role of government, it was also recommend that governments need to be lean and capable of delivering public services. Furthermore, the concept of "lean government" should be clarified.

19. It should be emphasized that the public sector should respond to customer demands like the private sector. In responding to customer demands, the public service should be results-oriented, specifically focusing on:

   – Accountability towards to the public
   – Cost-effectiveness
   – A positive attitude towards customers

20. Among one of the organizational mechanisms for public sector reforms, it should be emphasized that accountability drives decentralization and growing local government responsibilities.

21. It was agreed that following "due process" is necessary to minimize mistakes and corruption; however it was felt that there is a need for African public services to strike a balance between "due process" and responsive, fast and effective service delivery. Governments should endeavor to keep the public informed of its processes to enhance faster service delivery.

22. The importance of NPM techniques was noted. However, it is was felt that there is a need to adapt the techniques to the African context, i.e., within the context of Africa's institutional and human capacity.

- **Public Service Delivery Reforms: Best Practices in African and non-African Countries**

23. The Botswana case on the use of Work Improvement Teams (WITS) was presented as an example of an efficient tool in public sector management. The Police Force in Botswana has established organizational backed WITS to improve performance through the reduction of time in processing cases. The Ethiopian Civil Service has also established 'Complaints Handling Teams' to respond quickly to customer complaints.

24. The case of the Federal Republic of Ethiopia was cited as a case of a best practice in decentralization. Ethiopia has decentralized authorities called '*woredas*'' (districts). The Central Government provides financial resources to carry out development programmes, however the woredas also have the power to generate local revenue and decide on the utilization of funds.

25. Whereas the introduction of the system of user charges/fees is accepted in principle in many countries, its application should be implemented with caution and should include mechanisms to assess the ability of customers/consumers to pay for services rendered.

26. Privatization, as a means of reducing the interference of government in the economy, is accepted as a positive principle; however it was agreed that African governments should ensure that certain requirements/agreements are in place before privatizing public enterprises. Among these are:

    – Capacity of indigenous people to manage the enterprises
    – Existence of internal accountability systems after privatization
    – Provision of support services
    – Agreement on areas that will remain under government control
    – Certainty of an improvement in the quality of services after privatization

27. Partnerships with the private sector were highlighted as a new development paradigm for economic growth. While delegating to private sector part or all of functions and activities of the public service, governments should strengthen the capacity of public civil servants to manage contracts and other partnership activities.

28. The need for regular dialogue between the private and public sector managers, with the aim of sharing roles/responsibilities in public service delivery, should be highlighted. For example, in Botswana there is a high level consultative council between the private sector and public service managers aimed at facilitating dialogue between the private sector and the public sector on development issues.

29. It was noted that whilst partnerships with NGOS is important, government should provide an enabling environment for NGOs to perform. Government desk officers in charge of NGOs should operate in an enhancing and not inhibiting manner towards local and international NGOs. Appropriate mechanisms and policies should be developed in consultation with local authorities and local NGOs. Services provided by NGOs should relate to the needs of the people.

30. Information and communication technologies (ICTs) as tools for effective and efficient public service delivery are very important. However, deficiencies in human capacity and financial resources make it difficult for African countries to cope with the new challenges of ICTs. African countries should formulate policies and strategies geared towards building capacities in all areas of development, particularly in the field of ICTs.

31. The Citizens' Charters were mentioned as pivotal instruments towards enhancing the standards of public services and making them more effective and responsive to the needs of citizens. African public services should adhere to Article 10 of the African Charter of Public Service adopted during the Third Biennial Pan-African Conference of Ministers of Civil Service in Windhoek, Namibia 5-6 February 2001. National Charters should be set within the context of the NEPAD Charter to ensure uniformity in each country.

32. Public reporting systems include Ministerial reports to relevant Parliamentary sub-committees on the performance of government entities. The case of Botswana was mentioned as an example of such practice whereby Ministers and Permanent Secretaries converse with the public about their performance through the media as a means of public accountability. Also, at the beginning of every year, Ministers and Permanent Secretaries go to press to highlight their strategic plans. The media generates debates about achievements and progress reports are published every quarter. It was suggested that lessons learned and case studies of public reporting should be included in the report

- **Challenges to Public Service Delivery**

33. Regarding the issue of multiple accountability and relationship between Ministers and department Chief Executives, participants emphasized that the Minister and the Permanent Secretary should have clearly defined roles and responsibilities. Inputs from civil servants should be incorporated into the policy agenda and as well as government priorities. The case of New Zealand was given to illustrate the problem of multiple accountability. However it was recommended that some African cases should be highlighted so as to broaden the picture.

34. Regarding the question of globalization it was stressed that African countries should take advantage of the positive aspects of the global market whilst ensuring the independence of their economies. Also, the capacity of the public sector to support the private sector should be enhanced.

- **Strategies for Better Public Service Delivery**

35. It was mentioned that leadership commitment to quality management should be addressed as a major theme for effective public administration and management. The commitment of Ministers and senior officials was identified as a major influence on implementing successful public service reforms.

36. There should be a clear statement of the vision and mission of the public service. NPM techniques such as Total Quality Management (TQM), Performance Management Systems, and Results-Oriented Management (ROM), have now become part and parcel of the work culture of the civil service.

37. It was mentioned that the Performance Management Systems in the Botswana civil service use the following steps aimed at improving public service delivery:

   − A Statement of the vision, strategic plan and complementary goals
   − Operational /Annual Performance Plans are developed
   − Measures or indicators for the operational plans are developed
   − Performance review on a quarterly basis at higher levels and monthly basis at lower levels are carried out.

38. The key steps in performance-based management should include using performance information as a basis for decision-making at various organizational levels, particularly for rewards and sanctions.

39. The meeting acknowledged that many African public services have well written codes of conduct already established. However, governments should make an effort to promote a culture of ethical behavior.

40. Participants noted that human resource management is an important aspect of training and development. They were of the opinion that leadership training and development at both the political and technocratic levels, as well as attitudinal and mind set changes, are essential for the effective implementation of public sector management reforms.

**Presentations and Discussions of Country Reports**

*41.* Representatives from Botswana and Ethiopia made presentations on their experiences of public sector management reforms. The country presentations are attached *(See Annexes III and IV).*

**Conclusions and Recommendations**

**Conclusions**

42. The increased awareness of events in other parts of world through improved ICTs has increased the demand for information from governments by the citizens. This increased citizen awareness also makes it difficult for governments to get away with self-serving policies that are not in the best interest of the citizens. Governments should seek to implement reforms that enhance their capacity to respond speedily to citizens' expectations.

43. Where well-designed reforms are implemented, governments have taken advantage of benchmarking by emulating best practices in other countries, whilst at the same time bearing local adaptation in mind. Human capacity building ensures the success of public sector reforms in general and public service delivery

in particular. Therefore, African governments should now emphasize investment in developing human capital towards effective policy formulation, analysis implementation and evaluation. Trained and highly developed personnel complemented by political will and commitments, have become basic inputs into the realization of the public sector reform agenda in Africa.

44.  Africa's efforts at modernizing its machinery of government have been constrained by the formulation and adoption of inappropriate reforms, as well as the poor and ineffective implementation of the reforms. Even where reforms committee/machineries have proposed creative reforms, many have not been properly implemented. Ineffectiveness of the public sector reforms in Africa is also due to the piecemeal approach, which focuses on the management of the public service or a specific sector to the negligence of the others.

45.  Many recent reform programmes in public sector management undertaken in Africa main at ensuring not only adequate management of machineries of government but also effective public service delivery. Improvements in the administrative system should accompany improvements in other components of the society. Consequently, these reforms encompass strategies to strengthen the private sector, the CBOs and NGOs. Attention is now also being paid to reforms in other neglected sectors such as the environment and ecological conditions.

## Recommendations

46.  African governments need to be aware of certain assumptions that underlie public service delivery. Such issues include the rights of citizens as owners and customers; the setting of priorities; campaign points of politicians; and the need for an efficient and accountable government.

47.  The involvement of CBOs and NGOs in public service delivery is now recognized worldwide. African governments should improve their relationship with civil society organizations, and use them as partners in development rather than adversaries.

48.  Decentralization/devolution of powers to the local level should match responsibilities. Resources should be provided to enable local authorities to deliver.

49.  Services provided to citizens should be based on carefully anticipated values and priorities of the citizens as owners and consumers. Government should conduct voter's value assessments to establish priorities among competing programs.

50.  African governments may wish to emulate the use of Work Improvements Teams (WITS) as a means of enhancing the quality of service delivered, productivity and teamwork. Governments need to emphasize reforms that enhance efficiency in the public service, value for money, financial and managerial activity.

51. Decentralization of responsibilities in its various forms is advocated as a means of achieving public service effectiveness and ensuring that public administration is more responsive to citizen's needs at organizational levels. Decentralization improves the quality of decision making through better information flow.

52. Fundamental changes in the accounting system should be made to accommodate both cash accounting as well as accrual and capital charging. The concern for probity should be matched with government officials acting as public sector entrepreneurs who can fully utilize financial and material resources.

53. Performance contract systems are recommended for the management of public enterprises.

54. Governments should institutionalize a competent, efficient and accountable system of governance that would provide an enabling environment for private investors. The regulatory and law enforcement functions of government need to be adhered to in order to protect consumers and the citizenry from unscrupulous investors.

55. Governments should improve partnerships with the private sector to enhance the transfer of competitive skills from the private sector to the public sector. Delivery of services can be contracted to the private sector under the marketing testing technique.

56. Governments should regularize dialogue with CBOs and NGOs to reduce mutual suspicion and enhance partnership in public service delivery.

57. The development of ICTs in Africa should embrace the active use of the Internet in government offices. Electronic voting is recommended as a panacea to problematic elections in Africa. However, for ICTs to be most effective, access to information must be in the language most comfortable to the public user. Cyber laws should be made available to the public so that electronic information systems have the same legal validity as information stored on paper.

58. Each African government should have a citizens' charter that specifies what it promises to deliver. The public service is expected to respond to the changing needs and demands of the citizens.

59. Public reporting should be encouraged to improve transparency and dialogue

60. Public service delivery can never be effective without the eradication of corruption and unethical practices. The various Anti-Corruption Bills/Commissions should strictly enforce the laws against corruption.

61. The conditionalities of International Financial Institutions (IFIs) that are inimical to public service delivery should be renegotiated.

62. Leadership commitment to Quality Management should be taken as a basic requirement to sustainable public service reforms and effective public service delivery.

63. African public services should adapt NPM techniques, which include performance-oriented civil service, Total Quality Management, Benchmarking, Decentralization, and Customer-Driven Government.

64. Capacity building in policy management should be a priority of African governments as public service reforms depend on the policy management skills of public officials. Governments should embrace a new culture of participation, accountability and transparency. All stakeholders must be involved in the policy development process for support and ease of implementation. A competency-based approach to training and development of public servants is recommended. The need to develop public servants as better managers is widely recognized as an essential element of any public service reform programme.

65. African public service agencies need to formulate strategic plans, which should be the basis of effective public service delivery.

66. Government should involve Management Development Institutes and allied institutions in the policy formulation process.

## Adoption of the Report

67. The meeting discussed the content and adopted the report of the Ad-Hoc Expert Group Meeting (AEGM).

## Closing Ceremony

68. In his closing remarks, Mr. Hamdok thanked the group for the successful meeting and noted that the Experts contribution to the paper will help a great deal in revising the paper. He recalled that collective thinking is superior to individual thinking and ascertained that DPMD will continue to rely on support from the Experts and hopes that the relationship will continue into the future. Mr. Hamdok then thanked the Chairman for his work and noted that his leadership over the two days was remarkable. He also thanked the Rapporteur for a hard-working job and also DPMD staff for the support they had given to the meeting to make it a success.

**Annex I**


**Ad-hoc Expert Group Meeting on Reforms of Public Sector Management**

**28-29 May 2003, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia**


**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**


Mr. Atkilt Assefa
Director General
National Archives and
Library of Ethiopia
P.O. Box 30543
Addis Ababa
Tel:  516532
Fax:  526411
E-mail:  atkilt2001@yahoo.com

Mr. Getachew Desta
Head of Legal Service
Federal Civil Service Commission
Addis Ababa
Tel:  562985

Dr. Ayodele Fagbemi
Instructor
Ethiopian Civil Service College
P.O. Box 5648
Addis Ababa
Tel:  463318
Fax:  463016
E-mail:  ayodelefag@yahoo.com

Mrs. Lorato Jongman
Assistant Director
Director of Public Service
Management
Private Bag 0011
Gaborone, Botswana
Tel:  00267  3958777
E-mail:  ljongman@gov.bw

Dr. Mamosi Lelo
Project Manager
CAFRAD
P.O. Box 310
Tangeir, Morocco
Tel:  212 6130 7269
Fax:  212 3932 5785

Ms. Farai Mugweni
Southern Africa Network of AIDS
Service Organizations
(SANSO)
P.O. Box 6690
Harare, Zimbabwe
Tel:  263 4 745748
Fax:  263 4 745749

Mr. Maurcie Nyamunga
Assistant Director
Directorate of Public Service Mangement
P/Bag 0011
Gaborone, Botswana
Tel:  267 3958777
E-mail:  mnyamunga@gov.bw

Mr. Jacques Mariel Nzouankeu
Secrétaire Permanent
OFPA
Cotonou, Benin
Tel :  229 303368
Fax :  229 303199
E-mail :  mariel@leland.bj

Mr. John Rwomushana
Director of Policy
Uganda AIDS Commission
P.O. Box 10779
Kampala, Uganda
Tel :  256 77 387977
E-mail :  runakuy@hotmail.com

Mr. Mohammed Umer
Advisor to the State Minister
(CBM) in charge of Civil Service Reform Programme
Addis Ababa

**ECA Secretariat**

Mr. Pierre Demba
Development Policy and Management Division (DPMD)
Email: pdemba@uneca.org

Mr. Kaleb Demeksa
Development Policy and Management Division (DPMD)
Email: kdemeksa@uneca.org

Mr. Abdalla Hamdok
Development Policy and Management Division (DPMD)
Email: AHamdok@uneca.org

Mr. S. Ben Kasamale
Development Policy and Management Division (DPMD)
Email: bkasamal@uneca.org

Ms. Doreen Kibuka-Musoke
Development Policy and Management Division (DPMD)
Email: DMusoke@uneca.org

Mr. Mamadi Kourouma
Development Policy and Management Division (DPMD)
Email: MKourouma@uneca.org

Mr. Fred Nikiema
Development Policy and Management Division (DPMD)
Email: FNikiema@uneca.org

Mr. Stephane Oertel
Development Policy and Management Division (DPMD)
Email: SOertel@uneca.org

Mr. Okey Onyejekwe
Development Policy and Management Division (DPMD)
Email: oonyejek@uneca.org

Mr. Guy Ranaivomanana
Development Policy and Management Division (DPMD)
Email: GRanaivomanana@uneca.org

Mr. Taye Said
Development Policy and Management Division (DPMD)
Email: tsaid@uneca.org

**Annex II**

**AGENDA OF THE MEETING**

1.    Opening of the Meeting

2.    Election of the Bureau

3.    Adoption of the Agenda and Organization of work

4.    Presentation and Discussions on the Working document on 'Reforms of Public Sector
      Management: Lessons Learned"

5.    Presentation and Discussions of country experiences by participants

6.    Adoption of the report of the meeting

7.    Closing of the meeting

**Annex III**


**PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT IN THE BOTSWANA PUBLIC SERVICE**

**ABSTRACT**

*1. Performance management is a reform initiative introduced by the Public Service to facilitate delivery of the national vision goals. It is driven by a Performance Management System strategy whose objectives are to provide a planning and change management framework that is linked to the national development plan and budgetary process; enhance the capacity of the government to achieve the desired level of socio-economic governance; improve the performance capacity of public officers; and focus the efforts of the Public Service towards the achievement of the national vision goals.*

*2. Management structures have been put in place in the Public Service to facilitate effective management of the reform initiatives and provide fora for consultation. These include the Ministerial Performance Improvement Committees (MPICs), the Committee of Permanent Secretaries (PIC FORCE) and the Economic Committee of Cabinet (ECC).*

*3. To ensure that ministerial functions and structures support the delivery of the vision goals, each ministry has to define its vision, as a subset of the national vision, and mission, which links the purpose for its existence to the vision. Each ministry then develops a strategic plan based on the policy priorities, which are derived from the national vision, and articulated in the National Development Plan.*

*4. The performance of ministries is reviewed quarterly by respective Permanent Secretaries and their Ministers at the ministry level and half yearly by the President at the Economic Committee of Cabinet level. The Permanent Secretary to the President also reviews the performance of each ministry with the relevant Permanent Secretaries twice a year.*

## 1. THE NEED FOR CHANGE

### 1.1 General

5. National socio-economic and political development agendas are normally designed to respond to the changing demands, expectations and aspirations of a nation. They are also designed to respond effectively to the pressure of the changing global environment and for a nation to meet its obligations effectively, both internally and internationally, it must have an efficient Public Service. The Public Service is the principal actor in macro socio-economic policy making infrastructure and an architect of an enabling environment for national development. Hence, it is imperative that the structures, policies and operations of the Public Service effectively facilitate the realization of national socio-economic needs as articulated in either the national vision statement or the national development plans.

**1.2     The Burning Platform**

6.   The government of Botswana has, since independence, been concerned about the quality of its service delivery to the public and its ability to compete effectively in the global market. Some of the key issues that created the need or the 'burning platform' for change included:

i.       lack of proper planning and management of projects resulting in non-completion of some projects and cost overruns for others;

ii.      inefficiency in the management of resources resulting in serious resource wastage;

iii.     insensitivity of the Public Service to the needs of the public;

iv.      absence of strategic plans at ministry level to facilitate effective implementation  and review of policy goals contained in the national development plans; and

v.       the need to be competitive in the world market

**2.      THE NATIONAL VISION**

**2.1     Vision Development Process**

7. In response to the burning platform regarding the Public Service performance, the government set up a Presidential Task Group in January 1997 to formulate a national vision that would guide national development planning; take stock of the achievements made on the national aspirations set at the time of independence in 1996; formulate another set of aspirations to be achieved by the year 2016 when the country will be fifty years old as sovereign state; and provide the basis for future Public Service reforms.

8. The Task Group, through an elaborate consultative process with the public, eventually produced a national vision which is ***"VISION 2016 – A LONG TERM VISION FOR BOTSWANA: TOWARDS PROSPERITY FOR ALL."*** The vision defines the following seven achievement areas to be realized by the nation, i.e. come the year 2016 Botswana shall be:

- An educated and informed nation
- A prosperous, productive and innovative nation
- A compassionate, just and caring nation
- A safe and secure nation
- An open, democratic and accountable nation
- A moral and tolerant nation
- A united nation

**2.2     The National Vision and the National Development Plans**

9. The national vision sets out a long-term national development agenda from which national development plans define the aspects of the vision that should be achieved within a medium term, which is six years in the case of Botswana. Ministries are, subsequently, expected to develop their strategic and operational plans based on the sectoral policy priority

areas defined in the national development plans. In this way each ministry 's contribution to the realization of the Vision goals can be monitored easily.

## 3.    PUBLIC SERVICE REFORMS

10. The government conducted a study to determine what could be done to address the burning issues regarding the Public Service performance. The study recommended the review of the earlier reform initiatives such as Job Evaluation; Organization and Methods; and Work Improvement Teams. This was followed by the introduction of a Performance Management System, which incorporates Work Improvement Teams (WITS); decentralization of human resource functions to ministries; computerization of personnel management system; and intensification of human resource development.  These initiatives were implemented in 1999.

11. The decentralization of personnel functions, which was completed in 2001, was meant to empower ministries to manage their human resources. Before the decentralization of personnel functions, all personnel matters were centrally handled by the Directorate of Public Service Management on behalf of ministries, which created a lot of delays in personnel decisions at the ministry level.  The decentralization has greatly enhanced timely decision-making and better management of human resources by ministries.

12. The introduction of computerization of personnel management system has provided ministries with up to date personnel information to facilitate quick and effective decisions on human resource management issues, while the introduction of performance management systems has provided an integrated and holistic approach to Public Service reforms with effective infrastructure for the delivery of ministerial mandate; national development plan policy goals ; and ultimately the national vision.

13. Work Improvement Teams (WITS) principles are used within the context of Performance Management System to facilitate identification and solution of operational bottlenecks that affect efficiency levels of ministries and their ability to deliver quality service. This has made considerable impact on those ministries that have used WITS effectively.

### 3.1    Performance Management System (PMS)

14. The Performance Management System is a holistic reform initiative that is geared at transforming the Public Service and whose objectives are:

i.      To provide a planning and change management framework that is linked to the national development planning and budgeting process to ensure that the people of Botswana get maximum benefit out of the national resource use.

ii.     To enhance the capacity of the Public Service to deliver its services more efficiently and effectively, pitch itself at the desired level of socio-economic governance and be able to compete at the global level.

iii.    To improve the capacity of the public servants to be more productive.

**iv.**    To focus the efforts of the Public Service on the facilitation of the achievement of the Vision 2016.

### 3.2     Performance Management System Development Process

15. The installation of PMS into the Public Service was anchored on the national vision and from that point of reference, appropriate strategies were designed to facilitate realignment and refocusing of Public Service plans and operations towards the achievement of the Vision 2016 goals. These strategies included creating an infrastructure for the management of reforms; training public servants on change management; development and implementation of strategic plans by ministries; carrying out measurement and review of planned activities by ministries; and putting in place appropriate human resource management systems.

### 3.3     Infrastructure for the Management of Reforms

16. A number of structures were created, at different levels in the hierarchy of the Public Service, to facilitate effective management of reforms and coordination of the implementation of the Vision 2016. These included Ministerial Performance Improvement Committee (MPIC) at the ministry level; Performance Improvement Committee (PIC-Force), as a committee of all Permanent Secretaries; Economic Committee of Cabinet (ECC); the Vision Council; Directorate of Public Service Management; and Botswana National Productivity Center.

### a)     Ministerial Performance Improvement Committee (MPIC)

17. The Ministerial Performance Improvement Committee is a committee of heads of department within a ministry and is chaired by a Permanent Secretary. Its role is to manage all the reform activities within a ministry. Permanent Secretaries are answerable to the Permanent Secretary to the President on reform issues in their respective ministries. They also report to the PIC-Force on progress being made by their respective ministries on reforms.

18. Permanent Secretaries are supported by Performance Improvement Coordinators. These are officers who are specially trained to facilitate reforms in ministries and coordinate the work of consultants assigned to ministries. They are attached to the offices of the Permanent Secretaries.

### b)     Performance Improvement Committee (PIC-Force)

19. This is a committee of all Permanent Secretaries and is chaired by the Permanent Secretary to the President. At the PIC-Force meetings, Permanent Secretaries share their experiences, learn from each other, and suggest solutions to common problems they face during the implementation of PMS. It is also a feedback forum for the Permanent Secretary to the President.

### c)     Economic Committee of Cabinet (ECC)

20. This is a committee of Cabinet and is chaired by the President. All Permanent Secretaries also attend it. It is a briefing forum where ministers inform the President and their colleagues on the progress their ministries have made on reform. The committee also provides an opportunity for the ministers to share their experiences, learn from each other, and suggest

solutions to common problems their ministries face during the implementation of PMS. It is also a feedback forum for the President.

### d)      Directorate of Public Service Management (DPSM)

21. The Directorate is responsible for the formulation and ensuring effective implementation of human resource management policies in the Public Service.  It is also responsible for the promotion of productivity initiatives in the Public Service. It has, by virtue of its role, been appointed to be the overall manager of reforms for the Public Service.

### e)      Botswana National Productivity Center

22. Botswana National Productivity Center is a government parastatal established to promote productivity in the country. Because of this role it was chosen to be the leading consultant for the Public Service in the Performance Management System project, under the overall coordination of the Directorate of Public Service Management as the project manager.  This involves providing the required consultancy services to ministries on Performance Management System and coordinating the work of consultant/subcontractors in the areas of work where it does not have adequate capacity.

## 3.4     The Vision Council

23. This was set up to manage the implementation of the Vision by the Public Service, the private sector and the other members of the civil society. The Council is made up of members from all the sectors of the economy who periodically report on the status of sectoral performance in the implementation of the achievement areas for the Vision. The Council has developed a monitoring and evaluation system to facilitate effective monitoring of  sectoral performance.

## 3.5 Training

24. There are three sets of training. Training on mindset development and change management; training on strategic annual performance plans and development of skills; and training on performance measurement and reviews. Transformation requires a certain mindset, hence it is imperative that people who are to be involved in transformation initiatives must be trained to think and see the change process positively and be able to manage it effectively as the first step. This training was given to Permanent Secretaries, middle level managers, and supervisory and operative staff in ministries.

25. Training on strategic and annual performance plans, and change management skills were given to Performance Improvement Coordinators who were specifically appointed to help Permanent Secretaries in the management of PMS in ministries. Training on performance measurement and reviews was also given to Permanent Secretaries , heads of department and Performance Improvement Coordinators.

## 3.6     Development and Implementation of Strategic Plans.

26. Ministries develop their strategic plans, based on the policy priorities outlined in the National Development Plan. In the strategic plans, they articulate the key result areas and the

goals they would deliver to the public during the six years planning period. Each goal must have key performance indicators, targets, timeframes, and a measure. From the strategic plans, they also prepare annual performance plans to define what they plan to achieve during a particular year. Using the goals derived from the strategic plans, appropriate objectives are developed for each goal in the annual performance plans. The objectives must also have key performance indicators, target, timeframe, and a measure. Action plans for individual officers are derived from the objectives.

## 3.7 Measurements and Review of Planned Activities

27. Performance measurement and reviews have been introduced to ensure that planned activities are delivered at the scheduled time. Measurement is done at goal and objective levels. Ministries are to regularly measure the progress they make on the planned activities. However, a number of constraints have been experienced in measurement and these include lack of baseline data, the fear of numbers amongst some of the staff, and inappropriately defined goals.

## 3.8 Performance Reviews

28. Performance reviews are carried out to track performance on planned activities and provide remedial action where required. It is done quarterly at the ministry and PIC-Force levels and half yearly at the Economic Committee of Cabinet level. However, heads of department hold monthly reviews within their departments.

29. At the ministry level, a minister reviews the progress of the ministry with the Permanent Secretary, while the Permanent Secretary reviews with the heads of department. On the other hand, at the PIC-Force level, the Permanent Secretary to the President reviews the progress with all the Permanent Secretaries. At the Economic Committee of Cabinet level, the President reviews the progress with all the ministers. The Permanent Secretary to the President also reviews Permanent Secretaries individually twice a year.

## 4. DEVELOPMENT OF APPROPRIATE HUMAN RESOURCE MANAGEMENT SYSTEMS.

30. A motivated human resource is essential to a transformation process. It is, therefore, necessary that appropriate human resource management systems are developed to facilitate this. In this regard, the following instruments are being developed:

a)   A performance appraisal instrument that would facilitate effective management of the performance of individual officers;

b)   A performance based reward system to provide an equitable system for rewarding good performers.

c)   A performance contract for executive leadership i.e., Permanent Secretaries, Deputy Permanent Secretaries, and heads of department, to ensure that only those who deliver are retained in the service;

## 5.    EXPERIENCE

### 5.1    Successes

31. The successes experienced with the introduction of PMS in the Botswana Public Service include:

i.      Positive attitude towards planning for performance.

ii.     Acceptance of strategic and annual performance plans as essential management tools by ministries.

iii.    Clarity of linkages between ministries' plans, National Development plans and Vision 2016.

iv.     Review of Permanent Secretaries by Permanent Secretary to the President.

v.      Review of Permanent Secretaries by Ministers.

vi.     Review of ministries' performance by the cabinet.

### 5.2 Challenges

32. The challenges include:

i.      Lack of support from some leaders

ii.     Some ministries found it difficult to apply measurement principles in performance reviews.

iii.    Public expectation for better service not yet fully met.

iv.     Some ministries do not review their performance regularly.

### 5.3 Lessons

33. The key lessons learnt during the 3-year period we have been implementing the reforms are:

i.      Meaningful Public Service reforms must be driven by a clearly defined national vision.

ii.     For a Public Service to succeed it must have the support of both political and administrative leadership at all levels i.e. reform is leadership driven.

iii.    Change agents driving the transformation process must be skilled, creative, resilient and have the fortitude to withstand the pressure of their responsibilities.

iv.    Because of the size of the Public Service and the number of interest groups involved, its transformation process is a slow one.

v.    Public Service reform is an expensive venture.

vi.    Reforms require strong partnership between the Public Service, labour organizations, the private sector and NGOs because reform decisions affect all players in the economy.

vii.    Reforms also require strong partnership among the reforming entities for purposes of developing and sharing new ideas.

viii.    To maintain the motivation to support reform over a long period, there must be quick hit results to demonstrate the benefit of reforms.

## 6.    CONCLUSION

34. Effective performance management requires:

i.    clearly defined national vision;

ii.    linkage between the national vision and the national development plan;

iii.    linkage between the national development plan and the ministerial strategic plans;

iv.    linkage between the annual performance plans and the ministerial strategic plans;

v.    linkage between the annual performance plans and the individual officer's action plan; and

vi.    performance reviews based on  measurement of progress made on annual objectives.

**ETHIOPIA'S ON-GOING CIVIL SERVICE REFORM PROGRAM: AN OVERVIEW**

**1.    INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND**

1.  Ethiopia's civil service reform program (CSRP) is an integral part of a program of multi-faceted reform initiative- intended to build and strengthen public sector capacity for the attainment of governmental socio-economic development goals and objectives.  It aims at creating an environment conducive for technical and managerial capacity development, building institutional and human resource capacity and introducing improved management systems and new practices so that the civil service will be an effective, efficient, transparent, accountable, fair and ethical administrative arm of the government.

2.  The CSRP was initiated to address the weaknesses of the civil service and is now redesigned to go hand in hand with decentralization in the delivery of public services upon which the Government has embarked in recent years. In this context, the CSRP is a process of modifying legal and regulatory frameworks, operating systems and incentives to build an efficient and dedicated civil service in a newly decentralized environment.

3.  The start-up phase of the CSRP began in November of 1994, when a Task Force was commissioned by the Prime Minister's Office (PMO) to diagnose and take stock of the problems facing the civil service. The task force undertook an in-depth review of the management arrangements and operations of the civil service from *woredas* (districts) to Federal levels and submitted its report and recommendations to the Government, in February 1996. The report identified a number of weaknesses in the ways the civil service manages its financial and human resources and delivers services to the public and on how top management set strategic priorities and monitor and evaluate performances in the implementation of governmental development policies, programs and projects. It also identified that there is no proper arrangement in place to ensure ethics and tackle corruption, embezzlement and fraud in government.

4.  In line with the recommendation of the task force, the program was divided into five sub-program components including: (a) Expenditure Management and Control, (b) Human Resource Management, (c) Service Delivery, (d) Top Management Systems and (e) Ethics. Each of these sub-programs was not only broken down into reform projects designed to address specific reform issues through the development of new and improved legislations and operating systems, but also tasked with the responsibility of rolling out and spearheading the implementation of the systems by the various civil service institutions across the country.

5.  To manage the reforms, the Government put the program under the strategic direction of a high level Steering Committee presided over first by the Prime Minister and later by the then Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of Defense. The Committee reported to the PMO and was assisted by a Program Coordinating Office. A Federal lead institution and a Director were also designated for each of the sub-program component.

6.  To implement the reform initiative the Government has benefited from bilateral and multilateral support from the UNDP and other donors for the employment of consultants,

procurement of materials to carry out training. The Government itself has also committed a significant amount of resource in terms of annual budgetary allocation for the payment of salaries and incentives for local staff involved in reforms, processing and purchasing of office equipment and materials, among others.

## 2. OBJECTIVE

7. The overall objective of the CSRP is to build a civil service capable of promoting democracy, federalism and good governance, providing client- oriented service delivery and supportive of the Government's social and economic development policies and private sector development. The various specific objectives set out by its sub-program components include:

- Ensuring that federal and regional governments are able to deliver efficient and effective services with equity and fairness in the treatment of the client public on a sustainable basis, and have staff with significantly better understanding and appreciation of public service management and delivery issues.

- Ensuring that federal civil service institutions re-orient their planning, management and performance evaluations to strategic management issues and have staff with the capacity to effectively undertake planning, management and performance monitoring and evaluation.

- Ensuring that the police and the judiciary have significantly stronger ability to investigate and judge cases of impropriety in service delivery, and the media is able to objectively investigate and report cases of impropriety and corruption in government and the service.

- Ensuring federal and regional governments manage and promote staff on the basis of performance in a fair and honest manner, and train their personnel to effectively and efficiently implement government policies and priorities.

- Ensuring that federal and regional governments operate within comprehensive and complete legal frameworks for civil service in human and financial resource management.

- Ensuring that federal and regional governments operate budgetary systems showing informed and rational annual and medium-term resource allocation reflecting government objectives and priorities and have improved accountability to elected representatives.

- Ensuring change of management attitudes, practices and procedures in consonance with the tenets of result-oriented management.

## 3. REFORM APPROACHES AND STRATEGIES

8. For the CSRP to deliver the results, sub-program components and projects have been provided with selected guidance, which emphasize the need for the following:

- In-depth analysis of the problems facing the particular aspects of civil service management targeted for reform;

- Assessment of the impacts that the identified problems are having on performance;

- Development of recommendations, in specific project policy proposals, on how identified problems can be resolved;

- Defining strategic objectives in terms of the fundamental changes the reform projects will deliver in management/performance improvement;

- Assessment of capacity development requirements for reform development and implementation in lead and client institutions; and

- Development of capacity building plans and determination of how and by whom the plans are to be implemented.

While this guidance has been basic to the reform design and development exercises, a couple of strategies for processing reforms were also developed. These include:

- Allowing wider stakeholder (Federal & Regional) participation in the development of reforms to tenure sustainability of the changes to be introduced into the civil service. This involves constituting broad based sub-program core groups and project focus groups for reform processing, holding extensive consultation meetings at every stage of reform design and development, and use of pilot approach to ensure live testing and feedback on reform ideas from the management and rank civil servants of sample institutions;

- Recruitment of key reform staff on the basis of their qualification, experience and ability to identify problems and seek solutions;

- Building the capacity of key staff of reform projects to ensure that they 'own' projects and have a full command of the their Respective roles. For the pursuit of this strategy, the sub-programs have been instructed to seek support both from the political and administrative leadership, the civil society and the rank and file employees of the civil service. They have also been allowed to employ external consultants only when they clearly establish that the knowledge, skills and experience needed for the conduct of a reform project are not available within country. The presumption is that consultant led reform projects are likely to undermine the needs of the civil service in relation to human resources capacity development through the process of learning by doing.

## 4. PROBLEMS AND CHALLENGES

9. Over the past 6 years since the launch of the reform development phase in 1997, commendable efforts have been made to develop a number of new and improved legislations and working systems. Parallel efforts have also been made in terms of providing training to thousands of Federal and Regional civil servants and rolling out some of the new and improved systems for application by most Federal and some Regional civil service institutions.

10. However, although here have been some improvements in efficiency, effectiveness and responsiveness, only limited successes have been registered in bringing about a real positive

change in performance and service delivery, effective policy formulation, and program and project execution as well as in tackling other problems of the civil service in general. This mainly resulted from:

- Lags in transition from the problem identification phase to the "full" reform implementation phase.

- Weaknesses in integrating and coordinating reforms in order to achieve meaningful impacts on the efficiency and effectiveness of the civil service.

- Weakness in ranking of reform priorities, and sequencing and timing of implementation.

- Inadequacy of attention given to implementation of mutually reinforcing reform measures with a "do-it-now" approach.

- Lack of incentives to reform and resources.

- Low level of participation of regional governments in the reform process.

Despite these challenges, government commitment to reform has, however, been very strong as demonstrated by the support and priority accorded to the program by top officials. Realizing that there are massive tasks ahead, the Government has stepped up efforts to improve implementation of the program with focus on:

- Adequately removing legislative restrictions governing financial and human resources management and control;

- Providing civil servants with a conducive working environment in which they can pursue their careers;

- Enhancing the capacity of top officials and senior managers to strategically manage and implement policies and program, and

- Restructuring the original CSRP Co-ordinating Office as a CSRP Office and strengthening its capacity to manage and co- ordinate the implementation of the program.

- Transferring ownership of the various reforms and accountability for their implementation to federal and regional institutions through a series of seminars delivered to top officials on the objectives of the CSRP and its components.

- Providing extensive training to staff from various federal and regional institutions so as to enable them to spearhead implementation of reforms.

- Establishment of focal Civil Service Reform Offices, in key federal and regional civil service institutions which provide technical support to management in reform planning and change management.

- Distribution of an interim reform implementation plan document containing information on what "quick win" reform measures need to be taken to increase service recipients' (clients') satisfaction.

## 5.    FULL-SCALE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE CSRP

11. Based on lessons learned, the Government has undertaken relevant policy and institutional reform measures for full-scale implementation of the program.  These include:

- Placement of the responsibility to management and coordinate the CSRP under the newly established Ministry of Capacity Building (MCB).

- Restructuring the original CSRP Coordinating Office as a CSRP Office and strengthening its capacity to manage and coordinate implementation of the program.

- Transferring ownership of the various reforms and accountability for their implementation to federal and regional institutions through a series of seminars delivered to top officials on the objectives of the CSRP and its components.

- Providing extensive training to staff from various federal and regional institutions so as to enable them spearhead implementation of reforms.

- Establishment of focal Civil Service Reform Offices, in key federal and regional civil service institutions, which provide technical support to management in reform planning and change management.

- Distribution of an interim reform implementation plan document containing information on what "quick win" reform measures need to be taken to increase service recipients' (clients') satisfaction.

12. With the above preparatory arrangements in place, full implementation of the CSRP was launched beginning September 2002, and is now in full gear in the context of the country's *National Capacity Building Program* whose aim is to develop human and institutional capacity at all levels of government and in all sectors of the economy. Encouraging results are being obtained and the Government is determined to intensify implementation of the CSRP for attaining the objectives of sustainable growth and poverty reduction, good governance and democracy whose critical importance are echoed widely in several policy and strategy documents.

13. Parallel efforts are underway to strengthen the capacity needed to effectively and efficiently manage and coordinate the desired changes, complete uncompleted reform development works and restructure the original CSRP sub-program components into three core sets of activates including: (a) Resources management and Control, (b) Accountability and Transparency, and (c) Performance and Service Delivery Improvement.

14. It is strongly believed that this new CSR implementation arrangement to driving the CSRP forward will enhance improvement of performance within the entire civil service by strengthening human and financial resources management and control, raising the responsiveness of the *service* to citizens' needs, promoting strategic priority setting in public

service delivery and efficiency in program/project implementation and ensuring accountability and transparency.