

S3732

E/CN.14/SWCD/64

REPORT OF THE
FIRST SUBREGIONAL WORKSHOP
ON
INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION
IN
RURAL DEVELOPMENT IN AFRICA



Khartoum
26 November -1 December 1973

UNITED NATIONS

REPORT OF THE
FIRST SUBREGIONAL WORKSHOP
ON
INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION
IN
RURAL DEVELOPMENT IN AFRICA



Khartoum
26 November -1 December 1973

UNITED NATIONS
ECONOMIC COMMISSION FOR AFRICA

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<u>Chapter</u>		<u>Paragraphs</u>
I	— Organization of the Workshop	1 - 25
II	— International Co-operation in Rural Development	26 - 54
III	— Recommendations	55
Annex	— List of Documents	

CHAPTER I

ORGANIZATION OF THE WORKSHOP

Purpose and objectives

1. The First Subregional Workshop on International Co-operation in Rural Development in Africa was held at the People's Hall, Khartoum, Sudan, from 26 November - 1 December 1973. It was organized by the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa, with the collaboration of the Government of the Democratic Republic of the Sudan, as the first in a series of sub-regional workshops planned for 1973 and 1974.
2. The Workshop was held pursuant to Commission resolution 197(IX) which, among other things, requests the Executive Secretary "to promote co-ordination of the work of the Economic Commission for Africa, the United Nations specialized agencies, the United Nations Children's Fund and other organizations with rural development programmes in Africa in order to secure maximum impact of these programmes on the social and economic progress of the region".
3. Following this resolution, a Symposium on Rural Development in Africa in the 1970s, was held in Addis Ababa, in August 1971 ^{1/}. The Symposium suggested that, in order to ensure a more effective utilization and greater impact of the resources of international voluntary agencies, ECA might wish to encourage the initiatives of Governments in seeking increased collaboration between voluntary agencies and their host Governments. To this end, the Symposium further suggested that meetings might be convened of voluntary agencies concerned, African Governments, and United Nations agencies.
4. The first Workshop was thus intended to bring together representatives of international voluntary agencies (including field agents and national representatives), ECA member States in the Eastern and Southern African subregions (English-speaking) and United Nations agencies concerned, to share experiences, develop strategies and agree on machinery for effective co-operation among governmental and non-governmental agencies involved in rural development in the countries of the two subregions.

^{1/} Report of the Symposium on Rural Development in Africa in the 1970s (E/CN.14/544).

Participation

5. The Workshop was attended by representatives of :

— 5 Governments : Kenya, Mauritius, Sudan, Tanzania and Zambia;

-- 25 national and international voluntary agencies : Young Men's Christian Association (Ethiopia); Freedom From Hunger Committee (Sudan); Sudan Council of Churches; Sudanese Red Crescent; Sudan Village Development Committee; Sudan Women's Union; Sudan Youth Organization; American Council of Voluntary Agencies for Foreign Service Inc.; Agricultural Missions Inc.; Catholic Fund for Overseas Development; Co-operative for American Relief Everywhere; Caritas Internationalis; Joint Committee for the Promotion of Aid to Co-operatives; Ford Foundation; International Agency for Co-operation in Development; Intermediate Technology Development Group; International Union for Child Welfare; International University Exchange Fund; League of Red Cross Societies; Lutheran World Relief; Medical Assistance Programme Inc.; MISEREOR; OXFAM; Rural Development Consultancy for Christian Churches in Africa; World Young Women's Christian Association;

— 3 Universities : Haile Selassie I University, Addis Ababa, University of Zambia, and University of East Anglia, England;

— United Nations specialized and operating agencies : FAO, ILO, UNDP, UNHCR, WFP and WHO.

The Organization of African Unity (OAU), USAID and the Pan American Development Foundation were represented as observers.

Opening session

6. The opening session was addressed by H.E. Major-General Mohamed El-Baghir Ahmed, First Vice-President of the Democratic Republic of the Sudan; H.E. Mr. Hussein Idris, Minister of State for Research and Services, Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Natural Resources; and Mr. Robert K.A. Gardiner, Executive Secretary of the Economic Commission for Africa.

7. The First Vice-President of the Democratic Republic of the Sudan, opening the Workshop, emphasized the urgent need for greater and more effective international co-operation in the development of Africa's vast rural resources, for the benefit of all humanity. He testified to and praised the examples of international co-operation which the Sudan itself had witnessed, and noted that such concerted international effort was already exercising great influence on the Sudanese people. The international Anti-Thirst Campaign, which had been successfully executed with the support of both international aid and Sudanese self-help, had proved successful and had brought untold benefits to thousands of families in the country-side. Similarly, international co-operation had achieved great successes in the

schemes of relief and resettlement of returnees to the southern part of our country. He further observed that the present experiment in the field of resettlement and development in the Southern Region, which was being conducted in collaboration with the international agencies, benevolent and voluntary organizations, engendered great optimism.

8. Referring to the world food crisis, the First Vice-President observed that reports of the specialized international agencies had clearly indicated that, at the end of this century, Sudan would be ~~one of the countries upon~~ which the world could depend for much of its food supply. He said that Sudan was aware of this and that the priority aims of the programmed actions outstripped the bounds of self-sufficiency in food supplies. Sudan's ultimate goal was to export a great deal of surplus food items.
9. The Minister of State for Research and Services, Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Natural Resources, who spoke next, noted that the Democratic Republic of the Sudan was devoting great attention to rural development because 80 per cent of the population was in the rural areas, and was employed in and dependent upon the agricultural sector. This sector contributed about 54 per cent of the gross national product and accounted for about 98 per cent of total export earnings. He stressed that development in a country like the Sudan and in other sister countries in Africa depended basically on economic and social development in the rural areas. The Sudanese Charter emphasized that economic development was, at the same time, social development and that the sufficiency of production should, by no means, be separated from social justice. In their development effort, according to the Minister, developing nations felt the need for adequate capital, technical know-how and infrastructure such as roads, communications and ports. Furthermore, there were other conditions relating to the social structure, with its traditional social relations, its concept of work, wealth, savings, organization and time, which must be considered.
10. Despite all the difficulties that were being encountered in the process of development, the Sudan, he said, had been able to accumulate rich experience in the field of integrated rural development in the Gezira, Managil and Khashm El Girba Schemes, from which other developing countries could greatly benefit.
11. Concluding, the Minister expressed the hope that the Workshop would benefit from the experience of such local voluntary organizations as the Sudanese Women's Association, the Sudanese Youth Association and the Village Development Committees, as well as from the experience of international voluntary organizations and the United Nations specialized agencies working in the Sudan.
12. The ECA Executive Secretary reported on the progress made and actions taken by ECA in response to the recommendations of the Symposium on Rural Development in Africa in the 1970s, held in Addis Ababa in 1971.

13. With reference to the Symposium's first recommendation concerning the Mobilization of Domestic Savings -- in particular calling for support for the Africa Co-operative Savings and Credit Association (ACOSCA) -- the Workshop was informed that ECA had offered and would continue to provide to ACOSCA technical assistance including the identification of donors, when requested.

14. The second recommendation concerned Development Education by mass media. In co-operation with Radio Voice of the Gospel, ECA had broadcast eight programmes on rural development subjects. Texts of these programmes were being prepared for publication.

15. As for the third recommendation concerning the establishment of the Voluntary Agencies Bureau (VAB) within the ECA Human Resources Development Division, ECA had offered to assist voluntary agencies in carrying out pre-investment studies, in the field management of projects and in project evaluation activities. About a dozen feasibility studies and evaluations had been undertaken. Seven issues of the Rural Development Newsletter, intended to disseminate information on rural development and containing articles on self-help activities and on village technology, had been published so far.

16. The fourth recommendation covered the publication of the Directory of Activities of International Voluntary Agencies in Rural Development in Africa. The Directory was issued in 1972, and would be updated in 1974.

17. The last recommendation concerned the concentration of assistance to countries in special need. Since the Symposium, Governments, voluntary organizations and United Nations agencies had become increasingly conscious of the "hard-core least developed countries" (as identified by the United Nations) and of the areas of poverty which existed even within those countries in Africa which were comparatively well off. A great deal of the attention of ECA -- especially of VAB -- had been directed to the peoples of these areas.

18. The Executive Secretary urged that the problems of poverty be examined from at least three angles, -- those of the individual, the region, and the nation as a whole. From the angle of the individual, the concern was to ensure him the minimum standards of human dignity -- health, food, shelter, education and employment. The provision of these called for improvements in socio-economic structures. But the problems of the individual could not be considered in isolation. Areas or regions within a country required transport, water for human consumption and agriculture, extension facilities supported by agricultural research, access to credit and supply, and commercial institutions. At the national level, problems of international trade, the earning of resources to finance development, the degree of international economic co-operation -- financial aid and technical assistance -- formed the substance of current international economic diplomacy. It was the failure to recognize both the distinction between and the interdependence

of these aspects of the problems of poverty and development which accounted for the neglect of individual needs, particularly in rural areas.

19. The Executive Secretary continued : "We must devise ways of pooling and co-ordinating our development resources. The mass societies which we have created demand quick action at the mass level. Right here in the Southern Sudan, the first steps toward co-operation may be said to have begun. In the drought-stricken areas of the Sudano-Sahelian zone, Governments, voluntary and United Nations agencies have become bolder in their co-operative actions".

Election of officers

20. The following officers were elected by the participants of the Workshop:

- Chairman : Gaafar El-Hassan El-Hussein
Director-General of Natural Resources
and Rural Water and Development Corporation
Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Natural
Resources, Sudan
- Vice-Chairman : Frank Bishop, Assistant Director
International University Exchange Fund (IUEF)
- Rapporteur : Dennis Frost
Operations Administrator
Intermediate Technology Development Group (ITDG)

Agenda of the Workshop

21. The following agenda was adopted :

- (1) Distribution, scope and nature of voluntary agency projects in the Eastern and Southern subregions;
- (2) Areas of need for voluntary agency efforts : reaching the hard-core least developed areas;
- (3) Objectives of integrated rural development projects in national development plans; representative projects of Governments and voluntary agencies;
- (4) Evaluation of the voluntary agency experience : strengths and weaknesses;
- (5) Strategies for co-operation among Governments, voluntary and United Nations agencies at the project, national and regional levels :

- focal points for collection and dissemination of information on existing and needed projects;
 - identification of new projects, feasibility studies, request procedures, implementation and evaluation;
 - types of machinery for co-operation.
- (6) Pre-project planning : local participation; technical assistance; leadership training;
 - (7) Project evaluation : experiences and guidelines;
 - (8) Formulation of action proposals and recommendations.

Method of work

22. The tasks of the Workshop were conducted through plenary sessions and working groups. The following were considered in the working groups :

Group I : Machinery for co-operation among Governments, voluntary and United Nations agencies at the project, national and regional levels.

Group II : Pre-project planning : Local participation; technical assistance; leadership training.

Group III : Evaluation of projects.

23. For the first two days, and for part of the third day, the Workshop met in plenary sessions to hear opening addresses, consider topics of the agenda generally, and to decide on the work of the working groups. The Workshop then constituted three Working Groups to discuss in detail their respective topics and to prepare draft reports. On 29 November 1973 all the participants were able to visit and inspect the sixty-year old land reclamation and development scheme of the Gezira. One and a half days were devoted to group working sessions; and the Workshop reassembled in plenary, on the last day, to consider and adopt the reports of the Groups.

24. The closing session was addressed by H.E. Mr. Wadie Habashi, Minister for Agriculture, Food and Natural Resources of the Sudan Government.

25. A list of working papers, background documents and statements submitted by country and agency participants is to be found in the Annex.

CHAPTER II

INTERNATIONAL CO-OPERATION IN RURAL DEVELOPMENT

Coverage : Agenda item 1 — Distribution, scope and nature of voluntary agency projects in the Eastern and Southern subregions

Agenda item 2 — Areas of need for voluntary agency efforts : reaching the hard-core least developed areas

26. Participants considered the implications of information contained in the ECA paper, Analysis of the Work of International Voluntary Agencies in Rural Development in Africa. The representative of ECA noted that data analysed in the paper provided only a general indication of the distribution and scope of voluntary agency projects. The information could not be regarded as a precise and up-to-date picture of the in-puts or value of voluntary agency effort to the countries concerned because, for example, no distinction was made between large and small projects or between the results in each case. But despite its limitations, the data provided a valuable basis for the discussion of needs in the field of rural development. Various factors were identified by the Workshop participants which might explain why some countries appeared to be receiving more aid than others. These included :

- some countries were more vocal in putting forward their requests; others were able to state their needs more clearly; some had greater ability to handle and administer aid programmes;
- the poorest countries seemed least able to formulate their aid needs;
- some voluntary agencies had historical ties with or felt themselves more able to respond to the needs of certain countries;
- some countries created situations in which voluntary agencies were able to operate easily;
- voluntary agencies differed in character and these differences were reflected in the types of projects and, therefore, the areas and circumstances in which they were undertaken;
- there was no established correlation between a country's financial resources and its ability to provide its own manpower resources.

27. Participants felt that there was a need to examine further the criteria and priorities applied by voluntary agencies when they considered requests

for aid. In this context, it would be necessary to consider who took the initiative in formulating requests and in making decisions to implement projects.

28. It was clear that the areas of greatest need for aid from voluntary agencies could be classified geographically or functionally :

- Geographically, voluntary agencies might consider areas of priority those 16 countries listed as the poorest in Africa ^{1/}. In doing so, however, it must be remembered that other countries had, within their national boundaries, certain areas of greatest need which might well equate with the needs of the poorest elsewhere.
- Functionally, it was difficult to be specific as to where the areas of greatest need lay, as this would depend upon the circumstances in each country. However, the general categories listed in the ECA documents gave some indication of priorities.

29. Reference was also made to the need for research and technical training and for greater attention to the role of women in rural development. It was stressed that the positive values flowing from the voluntary nature of voluntary agencies should not be lost sight of.

Agenda item 3 : Objectives of integrated rural development projects in national development plans

30. Papers were presented by the representatives of Kenya, Mauritius, Sudan, Tanzania and Zambia, centering on objectives and approaches to integrated rural development within national development plans.

31. During the discussion that followed the following points were made :

- (a) The country reports indicated a general move away from sectoral and towards integrated planning for rural development. However, there were problems in seeking to implement the concept of integrated planning on a national scale. For example, because of limited resources, it was unlikely that sufficient supporting services, which should form an essential part of integrated programmes, could be provided to ensure a balanced infrastructure, on a national scale. Therefore, it would appear that truly integrated development programmes had to be limited to certain areas.

^{1/} Note : The following "sixteen hard-core least developed countries" have been identified in Africa : Botswana, Burundi, Chad, Dahomey, Ethiopia, Guinea, Lesotho, Malawi, Mali, Niger, Rwanda, Somalia, Sudan, Tanzania, Uganda, and Upper Volta. However, Guinea (Bissau), Angola and Mozambique should also be included as special cases.

- (b) A participant suggested that basic requirements for successful integrated rural development must include : initial participation and involvement of ordinary people in the development process at the local level; strong, single management forces at the local, regional and national levels, co-ordinating the activities of all sectoral agencies; and formulation of local plans within the broad framework of national policy objectives.
- (c) Country statements made no specific reference to the role of international voluntary agencies in integrated rural development. Although it could be assumed that voluntary agencies would play an appropriate part in development, there was a need to recognize the contribution they could make to the achievement of development objectives.
- (d) It was important to recognize the levels at which voluntary agencies could best contribute to rural development. In most areas, this would be at the local/district level, where they could make a valuable contribution by supporting small schemes which, because of their size, had not been provided for in government plans, or where government resources were insufficient to initiate new services or enterprises.
- (e) It was necessary for governmental and voluntary agencies to co-operate and co-ordinate their efforts. This was best done by voluntary agencies, making use of the recognized planning structures at the appropriate levels. In the case of those outside agencies which worked solely through indigenous local groups, it was assumed that these groups would, themselves, ensure that their efforts did not run counter to the requirements of the development plans.

Agenda item 4 : Evaluation of the voluntary agency experience - Strengths and weaknesses

32. The following papers were reviewed by representatives of the agencies :

- (1) The integrated rural development project BDI-7 (IUEF);
- (2) Problems of voluntary agencies in African development (USAID);
- (3) UNDP field enquiry on relations with non-governmental organizations (UNDP).

33. On the strengthening of the voluntary agency contribution, conclusions of the ECOSOC meeting with voluntary agencies, convened in Geneva for discussion of the UNDP field enquiry, were noted for the emphasis they placed on the need for exchange of information between voluntary and United Nations agencies. The initiative for opening this dialogue was felt to be

in the hands of voluntary agencies, which should make contact with the UNDP office in the host country.

34. The representative of the Kenya National Council of Social Services cited recent meetings between voluntary agencies and UNDP in Nairobi to explore means of co-operation. The question was asked: How might voluntary agencies encourage the establishment of governmental structures to liaise with voluntary agencies? The value of such administrative set-ups was reiterated.

35. The points raised by the IUEF representative in his exposition of the BDI-7 project experiences were used as a basis for general discussion on co-operative efforts. It was suggested that voluntary agencies might use the following guidelines as a framework for project identification:

- (a) that the project must be within the strategy of the rural development plan;
- (b) that the project must also relate to the objectives of the agency itself; and
- (c) that the project might be in response to locally identified problems which were not yet officially recognized in the formal development plan — thereby filling gaps within the plan.

36. Participants noted that the ability of local people to make intelligent appraisals of their needs must be recognized. Response to an expression of simple local needs could open the door to other desirable developments, the value of which might not immediately be recognized by the people concerned. Some participants felt that it was sometimes difficult to respond to local aspirations due to constraints imposed at national or international level. There was a need to reconcile local aspirations with government priorities.

37. Participants called for interagency collaboration in project identification and response to needs. Voluntary agencies should explain their role to government agencies as well as to local people, since the latter might not always have the means of dealing directly with voluntary agencies and must necessarily depend upon government agents to assist them.

38. On the subject of project objectives, it was agreed that these should be clearly defined and mutually adopted. However, this should not mean that objectives, once defined and adopted, should be rigidly maintained and applied. Circumstances did change and objectives should change with them, accordingly. Without clear and precise objectives there was a danger that projects would not result in any permanent improvement or development. Voluntary agencies should ensure the continuity of projects when formulating objectives, and the commitments arising from these should be clearly identified and stated by all parties.

39. The importance of pre-planning surveys was stressed as an essential means of obtaining the basic required information. Simple socio-economic surveys did not require the expenditure of a great deal of time or expertise. It should be found necessary at this stage also to establish the in-puts required to implement a project and, where appropriate, to establish the extent to which projects might become self-financing.

40. An area not often tackled in African countries was the investment of indigenous savings. Too often, such savings were put in commercial banks, then either loaned for urban and industrial development or invested overseas. Such practices were not in the best interest of the small farmer and could hamper successful implementation of rural development projects. It was suggested that Governments, United Nations and voluntary agencies might increase their efforts to mobilize local savings and to encourage their use for giving credit to the small farmer.

Agenda item 5 : Strategies for co-operation among Governments, voluntary and United Nations agencies at the project, national and regional levels

41. A case study of the organization of emergency relief programmes in the Sahelian zone in 1973 was presented by a panel led by the FAO representative. This was followed by an examination of interagency action in the programme for the rehabilitation of refugees in the Southern Sudan, and the Zambian experience in tackling its partial drought.

Case Study : The drought in the Sahelian zone

42. The FAO representative explained that the objective of the case study was to enable participants to identify specific areas of involvement by the agencies concerned in the medium-term and long-term development plans, relating to the Sahelian drought of 1973 that had affected Chad, Mali, Mauritania, Niger, Senegal and Upper Volta. Drought in the area was cyclical, occurring every 10-12 years.

43. The effects of the present drought were aggravated by the current world food shortage and the unpreparedness of all the agencies which might be expected to respond to the emergency. There was, also, a cumulative effect : since the drought did not occur suddenly, people continued to hope that conditions would improve. When the seriousness of the situation became apparent, the six Governments concerned established the Permanent Inter-State Committee for Drought Control in the Sahel (CILSS) and expressed the desire that all agencies — national, international, governmental and voluntary — would channel their efforts through the said Committee. At the same time, however, the importance of agencies maintaining their right to report individually on the effects of their own efforts was fully recognized.

44. FAO was designated by the United Nations to co-ordinate emergency operations to organize the supply of food, farming equipment and water. There were immense problems of co-ordination between the national and international agencies which responded to calls for help. Great difficulty was also encountered in transporting relief aid within the area.

45. While the FAO Office in Ouagadougou acted as the focus for immediate operations (Phase I), a Special Sahelian Office (SSO) had been established by the United Nations, initially in New York, to co-ordinate medium-term and long-term efforts (Phase II). ECA was involved in assisting medium-term and long-term development plans (Phase II) on a multidisciplinary basis. In doing this, ECA had placed emphasis upon the human element, which had created imbalances in the development of natural resources through their misuse. Phase II of the programme, which involved the movement, rehabilitation and resettlement of people from desert areas to areas of greater potential, could be seen as an area of activity in which voluntary agencies could play an important role.

46. The Secretary General of the Sudanese National Council for Research, spoke on the causal factors of the Sahelian drought. He explained that, in the past, it was accepted that a cycle of 20-30 years was sufficient to establish a definite pattern of causal factors. Recent events had proved this wrong. It was his view that while it was difficult to identify the major cause of the drought, it was apparent that both natural and man-made factors were interacting; and that, in some areas, this interaction had led to permanent loss of land. It was felt that there was a serious need for research into the precise factors leading to drought. Such research would obviously be expensive; but the responsibility for it could be shared regionally.

47. The representative of OXFAM, speaking on the world food supply situation, pointed out that the climatic changes in 1971-1972 had resulted in world food shortages in 1973 and a rise in food prices. World food stocks had fallen to the 1953 level, whereas population had increased. The shortage of food supplies and rising prices resulted in weaker populations, which led to a diversion of funds and effort away from food production into support for short-term remedial services in an attempt to stabilize the situation.

48. The representative of the American Council of Voluntary Agencies for Foreign Service (ACVAFS) noted that as a result of the Sahelian zone disaster, ACVAFS had strengthened its activities with a view to informing its member organizations of the needs of the area and to exchanging information with them. Situation reports on the activities of member organizations were being issued regularly by ACVAFS, and distributed to the Governments concerned, United Nations agencies and other voluntary agencies.

Case Study : Voluntary agency co-operation in the Southern Sudan

49. The International Agency for Co-operation in Development (IACOD), was formed by a group of international voluntary agencies in response to the emergency situation in the Southern Sudan. The representatives of IACOD spoke of some of the difficulties encountered in making the new agency operational, for example, the need for each agency to retain its identity, for fund raising purposes. IACOD had set up short upgrading courses in clerical work and mechanics. The courses included elements of hygiene, for example, so that trainees might introduce new practices, on return to their villages.

50. In the Southern Sudan, IACOD workers participated in the informal monthly meetings with other United Nations and voluntary agency field workers. Pooling of information on projects, and sharing of resources, such as radio-telephone and airplane cargo space, had been some of the advantages being derived from the monthly meetings, whose venue and chairmanship revolved from agency to agency. This informal group was looking forward to the establishment of an advisory board under government leadership, which would include private sector representation, for continued co-ordination of development efforts.

Case Study : Zambia drought problems and preventive measures

51. Zambia was only slightly affected by the drought in 1973. However, even the experience of the slight drought taught many lessons. Problems of transportation and distribution of maize were encountered, in particular, because of narrow bridges in most rural areas. It was difficult to persuade farmers to sell their animals before their health deteriorated from lack of food and water; and it was not easy to convince maize farmers to share their crops according to government plans, when the farmers themselves had their own commitments. As a preventive for the future, Government had planned to provide food storage facilities at provincial and district levels.

Discussion of the case studies

52. During the discussion that followed the presentation of the three case studies, emphasis was given to the need to set up interagency structures for co-operation as early as possible, and to site these as near as possible to the areas of action. Although, as in the case study of the Sudano-Sahelian Zone, it might be possible to establish inter-State machinery for co-operation in an emergency, such action might, in other circumstances, imply a certain loss of national sovereignty which could render its concerted operations somewhat difficult. The remedy in such cases might lie in the establishment of less formal inter-State organs for the provision of common services, although the siting of such services would require considerable thought. Organizational structures created to meet emergency situations raised, also, the whole question of the levels at which decisions must be taken. It was

necessary to identify these clearly so as to ensure that appropriate areas of initiative in the decision-making process were correctly allocated, bearing in mind the need to engender the fullest consultation, co-operation and involvement of people at local levels.

53. The representative of the Resettlement Commission in the Southern Sudan referred to the co-ordination of agency efforts which had evolved as a result of national and international action in support of the resettlement programme. He expressed much gratitude to the numerous voluntary and United Nations agencies which had assisted in the area. There had been some lack of co-ordination initially, both on the part of voluntary and government agencies; but this was overcome as time went on. It was again emphasized that, although voluntary agencies wished to preserve their independence, they would like to consult with government agencies in identifying the priority areas in which their contributions might be most effective.

54. Recognizing that the circumstances of an emergency situation and the actions taken to relieve it might not necessarily be appropriate to the requirements of an integrated rural development plan, it was proposed that ECA undertake a study of the lessons to be drawn from the relief and rehabilitation efforts in the Sudan. The lessons would be contained in the description and analysis of the co-operative work undertaken by government, voluntary and United Nations agencies. The experience would provide guidance as the co-operators moved into the phase of integrated rural development in the Southern Sudan. The study should be on-going, so that continuous evaluation of the experiences might be of use to the three parties both in the Sudan and elsewhere in Africa. Those individuals and agencies that had undertaken studies and made reports on the subject were invited to forward these to ECA's Voluntary Agencies Bureau, for use as background materials for the study. (See Recommendation A.4, for outline of proposed study).

CHAPTER III

RECOMMENDATIONS

55. Taking into account the views expressed at the plenary sessions, the documents submitted to the Workshop, and the conclusions of the three Working Groups, the Workshop, at its final plenary session on Saturday, 1 December 1973, adopted the following recommendations :

A. On national machinery for co-operation among Governments, voluntary and United Nations agencies, the Workshop recommended :

- (1) That, based on the Report of findings of the UNDP field enquiry on relations with non-governmental organizations ^{1/} which encouraged closer co-operation between the United Nations and voluntary agencies, where national government or voluntary machineries exist, they should assume the responsibility for the collation and dissemination of information concerning rural development programmes at all levels. Where no national machineries existed, UNDP should be requested to assume this responsibility, with the agreement of the Government concerned, until a Government machinery was set up. The information should also include surveys and research undertaken in connexion with the country's development programmes. It should be made freely available to all government departments, OAU, United Nations agencies, voluntary agencies, regional and subregional organizations, and all other institutions interested in the development of that country.
- (2) That, in the establishment and functioning of the national co-ordinating machinery, special attention should be paid to the representation of women and women's organizations, and to the role of women within the framework of rural development policies and programmes. In furtherance of this, it was also recommended that ECA should generate in the subregion a field study of domestic labour, in order to identify ways and means of reducing the time spent by women in non-productive labour in the home, and converting the time saved into productive activity, with special reference to improving the economy and diet at home. This study should be followed by practical design and development work in order to implement improvements in the home.
- (3) That Governments in the subregion should consider designating one or more of their rural development areas for international co-operation in the planning, implementation and study of integrated

^{1/} UNDP/OERI/NGO/2 (October 1973).

development programmes. The main components of such an integrated scheme might comprise :

- (a) full participation and involvement by local people in planning and decision-making at appropriate levels;
 - (b) machinery for communication through national government concerning sectoral services and other inputs to the scheme;
 - (c) assistance from ECA and/or United Nations Development Advisory Teams (UNDATs), as required, in establishing pre-investment social, economic, and organizational benchmarks, recording progress, and evaluating results;
 - (d) participation by invited voluntary agencies in planning, co-ordination of activities and implementation, in partnership with national bodies at all levels.
- (4) The Workshop proposed that the Outline for the ECA Study of Co-operation in the Southern Sudan be divided into two sections :

(a) Emergency phase

- (i) To study problems of co-ordination in the execution of relief operations and, in particular, the effectiveness of co-operation between Government, voluntary agencies and United Nations agencies in order to evaluate the past achievements of these operations;
- (ii) To draw lessons from this experience and make recommendations to the Sudanese Government;
- (iii) To make recommendations to external agencies with a view to providing a broad outline of strategies for meeting similar emergency cases.

(b) Development phase

To prepare a comprehensive pre-feasibility study on an integrated rural development programme for the Southern Sudan, outlining its objectives, resource requirements, planning and co-ordinating machinery and the timing for implementation. The study should also look into possible sources of financing such an integrated rural development project. ECA should act as the central co-ordinating agency for such an exercise.

The Workshop further proposed that the study should cover the period after the signing of the Peace Accord, and recommended

that immediate consultations be initiated between ECA and the Sudanese Government with the view to expediting the study which should be completed by the end of April, 1974.

B. On evaluation and follow-up of the First Subregional Workshop, the Workshop recommended :

- (1) That periodic subregional seminars and workshops similar to this one should be held, to discuss the technical subjects related to the development programmes concerned. At the same time, regular contacts should be encouraged between Governments, OAU, voluntary and United Nations agencies at all levels.
- (2) That follow-up action by way of evaluation of this workshop and the appraisal of progress in the implementation of its recommendations be undertaken by ECA, in collaboration with OAU, as a preparation for the subsequent workshop or seminar.

C. On pre-investment planning, continuous and final evaluation

Noting that, because of the wide diversity of projects and agencies, it was not possible to specify rigid guidelines for integrated rural development projects, the Workshop recommended :

General guidelines for pre-investment planning, continuous and final evaluation of integrated rural development projects :

(a) Over-all needs in project planning

- (i) All pre-investment planning should include specific arrangements for local participation at the national, regional and local levels, as appropriate.
- (ii) The need for improved communication channels between the national, regional and local levels of all operations, governmental and non-governmental, and within the governmental and non-governmental levels should be emphasized.

(b) Criteria for determining objectives of projects

- (i) The statement of project objectives should include : a summary of the situation and problems; a project description in relation to the problems; and a summary of priorities of project objectives. Objectives should be stated specifically and, as far as practicable, in quantifiable terms, i.e., what social and economic benefits were to be achieved at the end of each stage of the project, and who would reap the benefits.

- (ii) Projects should be planned to maximize the use of available resources, especially manpower.

(c) Project design

A proper plan of operation should be prepared, including :

- (i) detailed objectives of the project, and agreement on the methods of implementing the programme to attain these objectives;
- (ii) means of regular communication between the individuals and groups involved;
- (iii) a list of all inputs (finance, human resources, technical resources, local resources);
- (iv) a time schedule for completion of the project, and assignment of responsibilities and tasks i.e. who should implement the actions, and how should this be done;
- (v) provision for continuous and final evaluation of the project.

(d) In preparation of the plan of operation, the following deserved special attention

- (i) there was the need to avoid prestigious projects and to concentrate on promoting simpler and less costly projects;
- (ii) the project should cater for the individual, the community and the nation;
- (iii) linkage effects should be taken into account, and possible areas of need for supporting services for such projects should also be looked into. Analysis of the expected results of a proposed project or programme would often reveal the necessity of parallel or complementary action in other fields, and would thus assist in the better integration of rural development efforts;
- (iv) the relevance of the project to local conditions should be carefully examined;
- (v) pre-investment planning should include some research capability for monitoring the progress of the project, and provide adequate feed-back, to facilitate co-ordination between the various agencies that might be involved;

- (vi) adequate note should be taken of the availability of financial and other resources, in order to avoid undertaking projects in respect of which adequate financial resources and follow-up services could not be envisaged or provided;
- (vii) projects should be properly subjected to cost/benefit analysis and opportunity costs involved should be determined, with the view to identifying alternative activities which could have been undertaken with the same resources;
- (viii) personnel should be selected on the basis of qualifications required by each individual project, in accordance with terms of reference established previously;
- (ix) attention should be paid to the need for on-the-job training as a project component, with the view to training local personnel to replace expatriates (where applicable);
- (x) in selecting a project name, project planners should avoid associating projects with ethnic groups, clans, or leaders whose names could eventually affect the project if they were to fall from power;
- (xi) wherever possible, project planners should choose integrated rural development programmes as opposed to single isolated projects.

D. On continuous and post-project evaluation

As a guide to continuous and post-project evaluation the Workshop recommended consideration of the following set of criteria :

- (i) the measure of attainment of the project's original objectives;
- (ii) the relevance of the project's original goals, taking into account the changed circumstances;
- (iii) the amount of increase of the community's development capability and development of the people's sense of self-reliance;
- (iv) the degree of people's and Government's involvement in the project during its implementation;
- (v) the measure of co-ordination among agencies, with a view to avoiding duplication;
- (vi) the relevance of the project to the national development plan.

LIST OF DOCUMENTS

- Provisional Agenda
- Agenda
- List of documents
- List of participants
- Aide-Mémoire and Corrigendum
- E/CN.14/544 Report of the Symposium on Rural Development in Africa in the 1970s
- E/CN.14/SWCD/61/Rev.2 Directory of Activities of International Voluntary Agencies in Rural Development in Africa
- Rural Development Newsletter, Vol. II, Nos. 1, 2 and 3
- ECA : Some Models for International Co-operation in Rural Development
- ECA : Analysis of the Work of International Voluntary Agencies in Rural Development in Africa
- FFHC : An assessment of co-operation in FFHC field projects
- FFHC/AD:INF/73/1 FFHC : Programme Notes, 1973-1975
- FFHC : NGO involvement in medium- and long-term development in the Sahel : An action for development proposal
- COPAC : Joint Committee for the Promotion of AID to Co-operatives — Information Note
- E/ICEF/NGO/155 } UNDP : Companions in country programming : Report on
UNDP/OERI/NGO/1 } a Workshop sponsored by the NGO Committee or UNICEF
in co-operation with UNICEF and UNDP - 16 April 1973
- UNDP/OERI/NGO/2 UNDP : Report of findings : UNDP field enquiry on relations with non-governmental organizations (October 1973)
- UNDP : List of twenty-five least developed among the developing countries
- Opening Address by H.E. Major General Mohamed

El Baghir Ahmed, First Vice-President of the Democratic Republic of the Sudan

Address of H.E. Mr. Hussein Idris, Minister of State for Research and Services, Ministry of Agriculture, Food and Natural Resources, Democratic Republic of the Sudan

Address of Mr. Robert K.A. Gardiner, Executive Secretary, Economic Commission for Africa :
International Co-operation in Rural Development

USAID : Problems of voluntary agencies in African Development

ACVAFS : Statement submitted by the American Council of Voluntary Agencies for Foreign Service, Inc.

ISVS : Statement submitted by the International Secretariat for Volunteer Service

ITDG : Statement submitted by the Intermediate Technology Development Group

IUEF : Report of an independent evaluation mission on the integrated rural development project EDI-7 (June 1971)

OXFAM : Statement submitted by OXFAM

RURCON : Statement submitted by Rural Development Consultancy for Christian Churches in Africa

YMCA of Ethiopia : Some examples of YMCA rural work in East Africa

Ethiopia : Some notes on Haile Selassie I University's involvement in rural development problems of Ethiopia, by H. Abatena

Kenya : Kenya Government's policy on rural development and the role of voluntary organizations in developing rural areas of Kenya

Mauritius : Statement submitted by Mauritius

Mauritius : Geographical situation, climate, population, labour force and employment information

- Mauritius : Identification of village poverty profile
 - Mauritius : Practical experience as a Village Development Officer
 - Mauritius : Total organization structure of the rural development programme
 - Sudan : Integrated rural development and the role of public participation and voluntary agencies
 - Sudan : Country statement of the Democratic Republic of the Sudan
 - Sudan : Qalaa En Nahal Refugee Settlement : A prototype of inter-agency co-operation
 - Tanzania : Rural development in Tanzania (Policies, objectives and strategy)
 - Zambia : Statement on international co-operation in rural development
-